



HOUSE OF KEYS OFFICIAL REPORT

RECORTYS OIKOIL
Y CHIARE AS FEED

PROCEEDINGS

DAALTYN

HANSARD

Douglas, Tuesday, 11th June 2019

All published Official Reports can be found on the Tynwald website:

www.tynwald.org.im/business/hansard

Supplementary material provided subsequent to a sitting is also published to the website as a Hansard Appendix. Reports, maps and other documents referred to in the course of debates may be consulted on application to the Tynwald Library or the Clerk of Tynwald's Office.

Volume 136, No. 20

ISSN 1742-2264

Present:

The Speaker (Hon. J P Watterson) (Rushen);
The Chief Minister (Hon. R H Quayle) (Middle);
Mr J R Moorhouse and Hon. G D Cregeen (Arbory, Castletown and Malew);
Hon. A L Cannan and Mr T S Baker (Ayre and Michael);
Hon. C C Thomas and Mrs C A Corlett (Douglas Central);
Miss C L Bettison and Mr C R Robertshaw (Douglas East);
Mr G R Peake (Douglas North);
Mrs K J Beecroft and Hon. W M Malarkey (Douglas South);
Mr M J Perkins and Mrs D H P Caine (Garff);
Hon. R K Harmer and Hon. G G Boot (Glenfaba and Peel);
Mr W C Shimmins (Middle);
Mr R E Callister and Ms J M Edge (Onchan);
Dr A J Allinson and Mr L L Hooper (Ramsey);
Hon. L D Skelly (Rushen);
with Mr R I S Phillips, Secretary of the House.

Business transacted

Leave of absence granted.....	995
Welcome to Mr David Dumke from the University of Central Florida.....	995
1. Questions for Oral Answer.....	995
1.1. Brexit – Plans to ascertain Manx residents’ opinions and interests	995
1.2. Energy from Waste Plant – Part played in Climate Change Emergency Strategy	999
1.3. VAT treatment of aircraft – EU Commission’s infringement proceedings against UK.....	1001
1.4. Manx graduates – Number returned to Island in last five years	1002
1.5. Students above school leaving age – Funding available	1004
1.6. Energy Efficiency Scheme – Number of households eligible	1005
1.7. Provenance labels – Number of firms awarded.....	1006
1.8. UNESCO Biosphere conference, Dublin – Role played by the Island	1008
1.9. Licensing Act 1995 – Plans to update.....	1009
1.10. Domestic abuse disclosure scheme – DHA plans for legislation.....	1010
1.11. Post Office retail network – Number operating in past, present and future years ...	1011
1.12. St John’s post office – Resignation of sub-postmaster; effects of proposed closure	1015
Procedural – Notices re Written Answers	1017
2. Questions for Written Answer	1018
2.1. Foreign air forces at Ronaldsway – Terms and frequency of use	1018
2.2. Golden goodbyes for Government employees – Sums over £100,000; subsequent return to Government work.....	1018
2.3. Public assets sold for over £100,000 – Sale details.....	1019
2.4. Golden goodbyes for Government employees – Settlement agreements with confidentiality clauses.....	1019
2.5. Fairy houses story – DfE economic assessment.....	1019
2.6. Sefton Group grant – Repayment extension	1020
2.7. Douglas Hotel Holdings Limited – Details of new grant; Sefton Group grant repayment.....	1021
2.8. School staffing – Vacancies and recruitment 2019	1022
2.9. Energy from Waste Plant – CO ₂ emissions.....	1022
2.10. Treatment at Clatterbridge – Question withdrawn	1023
2.11. Off-Island treatment costs – Expenses claimed by patients in last five years	1023
2.12. Cervical screening – Possible offer from age of 20	1024
2.13. Accommodation allowances for off-Island treatment – Patients unable to pay.....	1025
2.14. Director of Nursing – Job specification; recruitment; number of applicants	1025

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 11th JUNE 2019

2.15. Public sector housing qualification policy – Statement.....	1026
2.16. Horse trams – Temporary marquee	1026
2.17. Horse trams – Passenger numbers during TT.....	1026
2.18. Horse trams – Running costs during TT	1027
2.19. Manx Utilities network failures – Types; cost of repairs	1027
Order of the Day	1029
3. Consideration of Council Amendments.....	1029
3.1. Communications Bill 2018 – Item not moved	1029
4. Bill for First Reading.....	1029
4.1. Property Service Charges (Amendment) Bill 2019	1029
<i>The House adjourned at 11.02 a.m.</i>	<i>1029</i>

House of Keys

The House met at 10 a.m.

[MR SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

The Speaker: Moghrey mie, good morning, Hon. Members.

Members: Moghrey mie, good morning, Mr Speaker.

5

The Speaker: In the absence of our Chaplain this morning, I will lead us in prayer.

PRAYERS

The Speaker

Leave of absence granted

The Speaker: Leave has this morning been granted to Mr Ashford.

Welcome to Mr David Dumke from the University of Central Florida

10 **The Speaker:** We also have a distinguished visitor today: Mr David Dumke from the University of Central Florida, who is visiting the Island in connection with the prestigious Small Countries Financial Management Conference. You are most welcome.

Members: Hear, hear.

1. Questions for Oral Answer

CHIEF MINISTER

1.1. Brexit – Plans to ascertain Manx residents' opinions and interests

The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Chief Minister:

What action he has taken, or is proposing to take, to ascertain the opinion and interests of Manx residents regarding Brexit; and if he will make a statement?

The Speaker: We then turn to Questions for Oral Answer, Item 1, and I call on the Hon. Member for Douglas South, Mrs Beecroft.

15

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I would like to ask the Chief Minister what action he has taken, or is proposing to take, to ascertain the opinion and interests of Manx residents regarding Brexit; and if he will make a statement?

20

The Speaker: I call on the Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister (Mr Quayle): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The Isle of Man is not a member of the European Union or the United Kingdom. As such, the process of the UK's withdrawal from the European Union and the negotiations process is not a matter for the Isle of Man to decide upon. That being said, our deep connections with the UK do mean that we have an interest in the United Kingdom securing the best possible outcome. We are working closely with colleagues in the UK to ensure that the interests and concerns of our Island and its residents are represented in ongoing negotiations.

30

We have already implemented the EU Settlement Scheme to ensure the rights of EU nationals living and working on the Isle of Man are protected. In addition, we have engaged extensively with business, particularly those with EU exports and supply chain interests.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mrs Beecroft.

35

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I would ask the Chief Minister is he aware that the House of Commons Justice Committee said that where our interests are not the same as the UK's interests that it is not an option, the UK have to represent our interests? So I would like to ask the Chief Minister how can the Ministry of Justice represent our interests if we actually do not know what they are?

40

I would ask him again what effort he is going to take to find out what is in the interests of the Isle of Man and what the Manx people, the residents of the Isle of Man, want to happen?

The Speaker: Chief Minister to reply.

45

The Chief Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The Economic Affairs team have included questions to gauge public opinion in relation to Brexit in the Social Attitudes Survey in 2017 and the Business Confidence Survey in 2018, and full copies of both the Social Attitudes Survey and the Business Confidence Survey are available on the Government website.

50

Obviously, Mr Speaker, we have held numerous meetings with business communities to discuss their concerns, problems and where they see things going, and we obviously represent these views when we have our regular meetings, our quarterly meetings, with Mr Robin Walker the Secretary of State for DExEU.

55

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Just for clarity then, could the Chief Minister confirm what the position is of the Isle of Man, what does it say its interests are? Do we want to come out of the EU? Do we want to try to remain in? Are we encouraging no deal? Are we encouraging not to have no deal but to find some way forward? What are our interests? What is he asking to be represented?

60

The Speaker: Chief Minister to reply.

65 **The Chief Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I respectfully remind the Hon. Member that we have never been in the European Union.

Mrs Beecroft: I know that.

70 **The Chief Minister:** So we cannot leave something, which you have suggested, when we are not in it in the first place, so I think that is a point that clearly needs clarifying.

Obviously, Mr Speaker, and I have said in this House and in another place time and time again, what we are looking for, I suppose, is as close to the deal we currently have – freedom of movement of people, manufactured goods and agricultural goods. That is what we have
75 currently and we would hope that after whatever the United Kingdom government and its people decide, we can get as much of what we currently have as possible, and that is what we have been working to.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mrs Beecroft.

80

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Would the Chief Minister not agree that this is an international matter? I think everybody is aware that we have not been in the EU and we are aware that we are not part of the UK, but it is clearly an international matter. And the House of Commons Justice Committee said that where
85 there was an international matter the UK had a duty to represent our interests and therefore we need to make very clear what our interests are and make it very clear to Manx residents and make sure that we are representing what they want and push for those and we should have a separate representation.

90 **The Speaker:** Chief Minister, I think there may have been a question in there but –

Mrs Beecroft: Yes, so did he agree with me?

The Speaker: Do you agree?

95

The Chief Minister: I agree, Mr Speaker, that it is the responsibility of all of us to ensure that the interests of the people of the Isle of Man and businesses who are residents too of the Isle of Man are represented and that we get the best deal for the people. That is why regularly we have our senior civil servants from numerous Departments, mainly from DEFA, going over to the UK
100 to put over the concerns of the Isle of Man, whether that be fishing, agriculture, customs from the Treasury Department or officers from the Cabinet Office, the External Relations Department, putting over our concerns and looking to ensure that any concerns that have been raised with us are addressed and we know where the answer is and how we can plan accordingly, and that is what we do.

105 But at the end of the day, as I say time and time again, we cannot direct the wind; we just trim our sails accordingly.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Hooper.

110 **Mr Hooper:** Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

The Chief Minister in his previous answer said that the Isle of Man's position is to try and obtain the status quo as much as possible. I was a little surprised at that. There is often a lot of talk around Brexit around the potential opportunities that there will be for the Island and for the UK in the wider context. What work is the Chief Minister undertaking to try and take advantage
115 or possibly explore some of these potential opportunities that may now exist as a result of the opportunity to have a new relationship with the EU through the UK, for example, access to

financial services markets. What work is undertaken to try and see if actually we can go beyond the status quo where that is in the Island's best interest?

120 **The Speaker:** Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister: Thank you and I am delighted for the Hon. Member's question because it clearly addresses a valid point.

125 My point is that in a perfect world we would like there to be a customs union, we would like to have freedom of movement of people, freedom of movement of manufactured goods and agricultural and fishing goods. However, as he quite rightly points out, things may change and that is why we regularly send away teams to find out what the latest thinking is. It is why his Department now has the agencies where we are working with the businesses at the coalface who will see what is happening and where the opportunities are they see for their business
130 relevant to what happens in the United Kingdom and the European Union should Brexit go ahead – there is no guarantee it will go ahead. And we take on board those concerns and going forward we will ensure that if there are opportunities out there for business we will seize them, and I look forward to the Department that he works in providing the relevant information to the Cabinet Office and the External Relations team.

135 **The Speaker:** Final supplementary, Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

140 A very simple one: given the turmoil that is in the UK, where they cannot even seem to decide which way they want to go, how can we be representing and just going to talk to them and saying this is what we want for fisheries etc. He must have a clear idea. Do we want to exit, which we will do if we follow the UK, which we have to, even though we are not part of it, we all know that. Do we want no deal, do we want a deal? What exactly is the Chief Minister lobbying for?

145 **The Speaker:** Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

150 I am flattered that the Hon. Member thinks that I have the power (*Laughter*) to dictate to the United Kingdom how they do their negotiations with the European Union. (*Interjection by Mr Malarkey*)

Mrs Beecroft: I never said that.

155 **The Chief Minister:** I regularly lobby to ensure that the best interests of the Isle of Man and the concerns of the Isle of Man are known to the people who will be doing any negotiations, whatever those negotiations are because, as the Hon. Member points to, we are a number of years down the road and I do not think anyone would be brave enough to put a pound bet on the outcome because we do not know at this moment in time. However, we react accordingly
160 and we will all do our best for the people of the Isle of Man.

**1.2. Energy from Waste Plant –
Part played in Climate Change Emergency Strategy**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Callister) to ask the Chief Minister:

What part the Energy from Waste Plant plays in the Climate Change Emergency Strategy?

The Speaker: We turn to Question 2 and I call on the Hon. Member for Onchan, Mr Callister.

Mr Callister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

165 Can I ask the Chief Minister what part the Energy from Waste Plant plays in the Climate Change Emergency Strategy?

The Speaker: I call on the Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister (Mr Quayle): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

170 The Energy from Waste Plant provides a controlled, fully monitored environment for the disposal of the Island's biodegradable, difficult and hazardous, including clinical and oil, wastes. It has replaced landfilling as a method for waste disposal and in doing so has effected a significant reduction in the Island's release of carbon dioxide, methane and other greenhouse gases created through the degradation of deposited wastes.

175 The Energy from Waste Plant will continue to play a significant role in our Climate Change Strategy for the foreseeable future.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Callister.

180 **Mr Callister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Can I ask the Chief Minister just to expand on his statement there to say that the Energy from Waste will play a leading role in his Strategy? Can I ask him to expand on that? Because the more and more we push for green initiatives, the more and more we push for people to recycle, the actual tonnage of this plant could potentially reduce – which did happen, I think, going back about four or five years ago; when we actually pushed for recycling and for people to take plastic out of their household waste, the tonnage at the Energy from Waste Plant fell.

185 So can I ask the Chief Minister to expand on his statement there exactly where this plant fits within the Strategy and what will actually happen if the tonnage at the Energy from Waste Plant falls between now and 2029?

190

The Speaker: Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

195 The Energy from Waste Plant has the potential to provide a controlled combustion environment for all combustible wastes and to prevent the release to air of carbon via unregulated burning of wastes in the open air.

200 The Energy from Waste Plant is regulated against prescribed emissions limits and has a full controlled emissions monitoring system to monitor and manage emissions to the air. The waste sector contributes 24,000 tonnes of greenhouse gas emissions per annum, which is less than 3% of our total emissions. The Energy from Waste Plant converts more than 50,000 tonnes of waste into 25 million units of electricity every year, circa 7% of Isle of Man demand. Now, that is part (a).

I suppose in answer to the Hon. Member's comments regarding a reduction in the amount of waste, we all know that to be as efficient as possible the Energy from Waste Plant needs a

205 certain amount of throughput and that will have to be addressed, should that problem occur, by the operator and obviously the sponsoring Department.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Dr Allinson.

210 **Dr Allinson:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Would the Chief Minister agree that in tackling climate change, it is no longer acceptable to have business as usual and we will need to make substantial changes, and that the Government's Waste Management Strategy in terms of decreasing the total amount of waste we have on the Island, therefore reducing carbon emissions and its production, but also the safe disposal of waste, is imperative if we are going to meet our targets?

The Speaker: Chief Minister to reply.

220 **The Chief Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, and I thank the Hon. Member for Ramsey, Dr Allinson, for his comments.

The Waste Strategy approved by Tynwald in July 2018 makes it clear that energy from waste will remain the Island's core waste management route for the foreseeable future. However, I always quote the Latin phrase that if you do not advance you lose ground, *qui non proficit, deficit*, and we must therefore always look ... Maybe what is acceptable now, maybe in five or 10 years new technology or new ideas may well come out and it is up to all of us to monitor and look at changes to see if we can do things better, Mr Speaker.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Callister.

230 **Mr Callister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I wonder if I can ask the Chief Minister just again with regard to his green policies. This current strategy for the Isle of Man to burn waste was put in place around 1990. The plant came online around 2004 and we set in place a 25-year strategy that runs until 2029. There are a lot of fixed costs attached to the Energy from Waste Plant and between now and 2029 those fixed costs are around £75 million to £85 million. The question to the Chief Minister is, if we keep pushing those green policies and actually ask people to continue to reduce their waste out of their household bins, the tonnage going through this Energy from Waste Plant will continue to fall, which will then increase the overall cost at the plant. I am trying to ask the Chief Minister if he is mindful of this and if the tonnage at the plant does reduce to a level below 45,000 tonnes, will the Chief Minister and the Council of Ministers review this policy until the current policy runs out in 2029?

The Speaker: Chief Minister to reply.

245 **The Chief Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I understand the concern of the Hon. Member and yes, we are concerned that if waste falls, the cost and the efficiency of the plant will fall. But I think it is worth pointing out that by having that facility there, Mr Speaker, it stops people from burning rubbish uncontrolled. We have a facility where it is monitored, it complies with all the latest emissions, it has all the latest equipment to reduce whatever pollutants are in the waste getting into the atmosphere and if it did not exist I would be concerned that members of the public might just burn the product themselves and do far more damage.

But, as I have said, going forward, Mr Speaker, it is something that we will have to take into account and I am sure the Department for Infrastructure, who I believe are responsible for negotiating the contract, will be monitoring now and will be reviewing as we go along.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Baker.

Mr Baker: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

260 Would the Chief Minister agree with me that the Energy from Waste Plant is a key strategic asset of the Island and that in the light of restrictions on our ability to export waste products, then it absolutely has to play a critical role in our mix of solutions, alongside recycling, reuse and reduction?

265 **The Speaker:** Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister: Absolutely.

The Speaker: Final supplementary, Mr Callister.

270

Mr Callister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Can I ask the Chief Minister: if we get to the point where the tonnage going through the Energy from Waste Plant per annum falls below 45,000, is the Chief Minister mindful that we may have to import waste, which I certainly hope we are absolutely against?

275

The Speaker: Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister: I am afraid I cannot answer that really, Mr Speaker; it is not my field of expertise. That really is for the DOI Minister to give a more balanced view on that. I try and answer questions as fairly as I possibly can, but that is something really for the technical detail to come through the House.

280

The Speaker: I did notice the Minister shaking his head, so it will no doubt be one for future questions.

1.3. VAT treatment of aircraft – EU Commission's infringement proceedings against UK

The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Chief Minister:

If he will make a statement on the infringement proceedings by the EU Commission against the United Kingdom government in relation to the VAT treatment of aircraft in the Isle of Man?

285 **The Speaker:** The Hon. Member for Douglas South, Mrs Beecroft – Question 3.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I would like to ask the Chief Minister if he will make a statement on the infringement proceedings by the EU Commission against the United Kingdom government in relation to the VAT treatment of aircraft in the Isle of Man?

290

The Speaker: Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister (Mr Quayle): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

295

On 8th November 2018, the European Commission issued a letter of formal notice of infringement to the United Kingdom government drawing their attention to the possible non-

compliance with EU law of the VAT treatment in the Isle of Man of supplies and leasing of aircraft. The UK had two months to respond to this request. We understand that a comprehensive response was provided to the European Commission within this timeframe.

300

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

305 Could the Chief Minister then clarify what the position is for us: was it a favourable letter that was sent? What communication has there been with the Isle of Man regarding this?

The Speaker: Chief Minister to reply.

The Chief Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

310 I think I need to clarify that this is not *our* report. We have not seen the report yet.

Now, obviously we have been asked for some technical figures on this, but the UK government announced in their spring statement of 2019 issued on 13th March 2019 that there is an intention to publish HMT's findings and recommendations of the review, and I quote, 'in the coming months'. We therefore expect to receive the report shortly.

EDUCATION, SPORT AND CULTURE

1.4. Manx graduates – Number returned to Island in last five years

The Hon. Member for Arbory, Castletown and Malew (Mr Moorhouse) to ask the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:

How many graduates who were educated on the Island returned to the Island in the last five years?

315 **The Speaker:** Question 4. I call on the Hon. Member for Arbory, Castletown and Malew, Mr Moorhouse.

Mr Moorhouse: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

320 I would like to ask the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture, how many graduates who were educated on the Island returned to the Island in the last five years?

The Speaker: I call on the Minister for Education Sport and Culture to reply.

The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture (Mr Cregeen): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

325 My Department does not track the movement of graduates educated on the Island who have moved away; nor does it have the legislative requirement to do so or the powers to require students to report their moves into employment. I am therefore unable to answer the Question asked by the Hon. Member.

330 However, my Department did conduct a survey of Manx graduates in 2017, which showed that the number of returning university graduates was broadly comparable with the numbers returning at the time of the last survey in 2004 of approximately 45%.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Moorhouse.

335 **Mr Moorhouse:** Thank you, Mr Speaker and thank you, Minister.

Given the level of returns appearing quite positive from this response, would the Minister consider putting out an annual update on the number of graduates who have returned to the Island?

340 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

As I said, we do not have legislative powers to ensure that we get these figures back, but we can consider doing another survey in future.

345

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Ms Edge.

Ms Edge: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

350 Can the Minister just confirm: I know that there is an annual check done with all of the secondary schools as to the students that have left and where they have gone on to; what is that data actually used for?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

355 **The Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

But that is when they have left secondary school; this is the graduates who are returning from university, so this is after then.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Moorhouse.

360

Mr Moorhouse: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

With regard to funding of students, is any data available in terms of whether the students return or is that completely separate?

365 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

370 As I said, we do not have data every year of students, whether they return to the Isle of Man. It could be a number of years later. But what we have found previously is that students will go into employment, possibly in the adjacent island, and may return here when they are 29 or 30 to settle down.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Moorhouse.

375 **Mr Moorhouse:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you, Minister.

Given the importance of this data, would the Minister consider working with Locate Isle of Man to come up with some form of future survey that could give us an indication of what is happening?

380 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

385 As I said, we are looking into the future that we will do another graduate survey. The information, when it comes in, is only a sample and as I said, there is no requirement for them to inform us when they do return.

The Speaker: Final supplementary, Ms Edge.

Ms Edge: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

390 Could the Minister confirm with regard to students that have gone onto university, they have received student awards or student grants: how does that communication work? Is there an opportunity for the Minister to gather some of this information, whilst he is dealing with that element of the award?

395 You have to collect that debt back from them: there must be an element that you could bring in as to the intentions of the student beyond that.

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

400 As I said, it is one of those things that we do contact the students and at times we will request where they have gone and what they are doing.

As repeated previously, we are considering doing another survey soon.

1.5. Students above school leaving age – Funding available

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Ms Edge) to ask the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:

What student funding is available for students after school leaving age?

The Speaker: Question 5. I call on the Hon. Member for Onchan, Ms Edge.

405 **Ms Edge:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I would like to ask the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture what student funding is available for students after school leaving age?

The Speaker: I call on the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture to reply.

410

The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture (Mr Cregeen): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I have taken the wording of 'students' from the Hon. Member's Questions to mean students progressing through available post-school-age further or higher education or vocational pathways immediately after leaving school. This excludes those people who are in employment who may be undertaking further study.

415 To that end, my Department offers a range of funding for students once they have attained school leaving age. Support includes student awards funding. This includes tuition fees and maintenance grants for students attending eligible courses at University College Isle of Man or UK overseas universities. The latest student funding provision was included in the Education (Student Awards) Regulations 2019 recently approved by Tynwald on 22nd May.

420 The Department also provides funding for disabled students, additional DSA funding support is also available for disabled students where they will incur additional costs in attending their courses as a direct result of their disability. Allowances are available to help with such matters as the cost of a non-medical helper, specialist equipment and or other course-related costs. This is available for students attending both on- and off-Island courses to study.

425 Vocational training assistance also exists in the form of a Vocational Training Assistance Scheme (VTAS), for those courses having more vocational focus. This is a discretionary scheme with successful outcomes funded on a shared cost basis. My Department's contribution is 30%

430 of the cost of the training limited to a maximum of £1,500 per individual in any 12-month period.

Support for trade apprenticeships is also available with the Department reimbursing the employers the trade rates specified by the Construction Federation for trainees. Attendance to part-time day-release courses is based on the level at which the trainee is skilled. For example, for a first-year apprentice, this is up to £50.08 per day; for a second-year apprentice, this is up to £58.32; for a third-year apprentice, this is up to £84.40 per day.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Ms Edge.

Ms Edge: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

440 Could the Minister confirm ... With regard to the recent regulations that he brought through, 'Eligibility for award' states that a student must be 18 years of age. What I would like to ask the Minister is: what actually, out of what he has just quoted, is available for somebody leaving school at 16 and wishing to go on a course at Isle of Man College? Is there any funding available or do they just get the course fee and then they have to live off family allowance? What funding is available between 16 and 18?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

450 The support for apprentices is: for when they have left school, there is a VTAS scheme. Is the Hon. Member asking, are there maintenance grants for those people over the age of 16? If she can clarify: is that what she is asking for – is there some sort of maintenance grant that she is looking at?

455 **The Speaker:** Hon. Member

Ms Edge: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

460 Yes, I am happy to clarify. There are a number of students that do leave school at 16 and they have no form of income if they are on a course at the Isle of Man College. So is there any opportunity for them to access anything at 16 – they can work from 16; or is it purely, they get the course paid for and then the family have to support that student between 16 and 18?

The Speaker: Minister.

465 **The Minister:** Thank you, Mr. Speaker.

There is no maintenance assistance for those students.

ENVIRONMENT, FOOD AND AGRICULTURE

1.6. Energy Efficiency Scheme – Number of households eligible

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Callister) to ask the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture:

Pursuant to his announcement of 20th May 2019, how many of the Island's households will be eligible for the Energy Efficiency Scheme?

The Speaker: Question 6. I call on the Hon. Member for Onchan, Mr Callister.

Mr Callister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

470 Further to his announcement on 20th May 2019, how many of the Island's households will be eligible for the Energy Efficiency Scheme? If I can ask the Minister for the Environment, Food and Agriculture.

The Speaker: Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture to reply.

475

The Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture (Mr Boot): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

For the financial year 2019-20 a single person earning up to £29,000 per annum or a couple earning up to £43,000 per annum are eligible for the Energy Efficiency Scheme.

480 The Department's estimate is that approximately 15,000 individuals are eligible for the scheme.

1.7. Provenance labels – Number of firms awarded

The Hon. Member for Arbory, Castletown and Malew (Mr Moorhouse) to ask the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture:

How many firms have been awarded a provenance label for (a) product of the Isle of Man and (b) made in the Isle of Man?

The Speaker: Question 7 and I call on the Hon. Member for Arbory, Castletown and Malew, Mr Moorhouse.

Mr Moorhouse: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

485 I would like to ask the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture how many firms have been awarded a provenance label for (a) product of the Isle of Man and (b) made in the Isle of Man?

The Speaker: Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture to reply.

490

The Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture (Mr Boot): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

495 I thank the Hon. Member for Arbory, Castletown and Malew for this Question. As part of my Department's Food Matters Strategy we launched the Isle of Man provenance label in 2016. The Isle of Man provenance label is used to indicate produce that is grown, reared, caught and/or processed in the Isle of Man and/or contains mostly Manx ingredients. Currently there are 30 producers within the product of Isle of Man category and 18 producers within the made in Isle of Man category. There are currently 698 products in the categories mentioned.

Its creation forms part of the Food Matters Strategy to grow the value of Isle of Man food and drink to the economy.

500

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Moorhouse.

Mr Moorhouse: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you, Minister.

505 Once a product has received permission to use the provenance label is there any assessment on whether the branding actually appears on produce?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you.

510 New businesses have the option of receiving the provenance label as stickers directly from the Department once their application has been authorised. Over the last year we have allocated over 20,000 stickers to businesses, with a number of businesses also adding the provenance label to their packaging in their own right.

515 I think, having gone through the process of obtaining a provenance approval, as far as we are aware, producers are using those labels.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Moorhouse.

Mr Moorhouse: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you, Minister.

520 Recently the Department has placed adverts in local newspapers encouraging firms to adopt the provenance label. How successful has this advertising been?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

525 **The Minister:** Thank you.

The adverts placed in the newspapers had two rationales: they were to remind Manx consumers about the Isle of Man provenance label and each time we advertise a provenance label we see an increase in businesses applying and consumers asking about the label via our social media and email feeds. The provenance label has grown very successfully since 2017, which can be shown by the increased number of producers and businesses that are now using the label on the Island.

The Speaker: Supplementary, Mr Moorhouse.

535 **Mr Moorhouse:** Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you, Minister.

Extending slightly from that raising awareness, how does the Department plan to keep the labelling fresh and relevant in such a fast-moving marketplace? And since the initial idea was brought to the table how much has the Department spent on developing this strategy?

540 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

545 My Department has a marketing plan that continues to advertise the label both on and off Island. The label was designed as a result of consumer feedback in 2017. Over the last two years, since its launch, the label can now be used by Manx butchers as well – we have a Manx butcher's provenance label – cafés and restaurants, as well as businesses producing non-food products directly on Island, such as sheepskins and wax wraps.

550 In terms of how much we have spent, I cannot break that out without doing some detailed research. If you would like me to do that I would be happy to do that and let you know, but it forms part of the budget, quite a large budget, within the Department for promotion of Food Matters and other things so it is part of that overall strategy and budget.

**1.8. UNESCO Biosphere conference, Dublin –
Role played by the Island**

The Hon. Member for Arbory, Castletown and Malew (Mr Moorhouse) to ask the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture:

What role the Island played at the International UNESCO Biosphere conference recently held in Dublin?

The Speaker: Question 8. I call on the Hon. Member for Arbory, Castletown and Malew, Mr Moorhouse.

555 **Mr Moorhouse:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I would like to ask the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture what role the Island played at the International UNESCO Biosphere conference recently held in Dublin?

The Speaker: I call on the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture to reply.

560

The Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture (Mr Boot): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The Isle of Man played a significant role at the UNESCO Man And Biosphere programme (EuroMAB) conference in Dublin Bay Biosphere.

565 EuroMAB, 1st to 5th April, was attended by 300 delegates from 30 countries in Europe and North America. The event, held every two years, brings together biospheres to discuss common concerns and share sustainable solutions.

The 2019 event explored local actions for global challenges and discussed issues pertinent to the Isle of Man.

570 The event provided an opportunity to the Isle of Man delegation to engage with key personnel within UNESCO MAB, including the programme's Global Director. The Island helped deliver workshops on protecting and promoting coastal and marine life, protecting and promoting indigenous languages, arts and culture and tackling marine plastics.

UNESCO MAB tells its story globally through one-minute ProudToShare films linked to the UN Sustainable Development Goals. These are hosted on its website and YouTube channel.

575 UNESCO Biosphere Isle of Man was amongst 75 biospheres that submitted films to EuroMAB and among just 10 chosen to be screened at the gathering plenary session. The film demonstrated the Isle of Man's support for local food and drink producers and encouragement for sustainable production.

580 UNESCO Biosphere Isle of Man appeared on the stage on a panel to speak about the collaboration and to promote UNESCO Biosphere Isle of Man.

Isle of Man produce was provided for an ethnic evening, at which delegates shared information and practices surrounding their cultures. The Island's high profile role in EuroMAB attracted interest both at the event and since from other biospheres, with whom we formed valuable partnerships.

585

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Moorhouse.

Mr Moorhouse: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and thank you, Minister for such a detailed Answer.

590 Given that level of success, the next question is going to be relatively easy to answer. How does the Department assess the benefits of participating in such conferences and how many such events does the Minister expect our representatives to attend in the next 18 months?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

595 **The Minister:** Well, EuroMAB takes place every two years, so we will not be attending that within the next 18 months. Obviously, we attend a number of other events and conferences that occur during the year which cover environmental issues, farming conferences, and other matters – waste management, green energy and things like that.

600 In detailed terms, I cannot tell you how many we will attend. I suspect in the last year we probably attended five or six, and I anticipate a similar number over the next year, and a similar number the following year.

HOME AFFAIRS

1.9. Licensing Act 1995 – Plans to update

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Callister) to ask the Minister for Home Affairs:

When the Licensing Act 1995 will be updated; and if the Minister will make a statement?

The Speaker: Question 9 and I call on the Hon. Member for Onchan, Mr Callister.

Mr Callister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

605 Can I ask the Minister for Home Affairs when the Licensing Act 1995 will be updated; and if the Minister will make a statement?

The Speaker: I call on the Minister for Home Affairs to reply.

610 **The Minister for Home Affairs (Mr Malarkey):** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I am grateful to the Hon. Member for allowing me to give you an update on the Licensing Bill. I am pleased to say that the Licensing Bill is a high priority for my Department and drafting instructions have already been prepared. At the present time, the Attorney General's Chambers Legislative Drafting section is working on producing three Bills for my Department: the Sexual Offences Bill; the Administration of Justice (Miscellaneous Provisions) Bill; and the Domestic Abuse Bill. In this connection, subject to necessary approvals, the First Reading of the Sexual Offences Bill will be before the House this summer.

620 Having completed this Bill, I hope Chambers will then be in a position to commence drafting of the Licensing Bill. This has been held up somewhat for some Brexit legislation that has been going on before us.

I would hope therefore that we will be in a position to progress the Bill into the House early in 2020. The other good news is that the Bill is to be an enabling Bill. The Department has been working with the licensing industry, the Police, the licensing advocates, representing the Law Society, and completed all considerations to make secondary legislation an easier requirement. This means that there should be few delays in bringing the legislation into force once it has passed its sessions through the Keys.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Callister.

630 **Mr Callister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I thank the Minister for a very positive Answer this morning. I know he has said he is working with the licensing trade, but can I ask him if he will carry out a short consultation with the trade before bringing the draft Bill to the House?

635 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

640 A long consultation has actually been taking place with the trade over the last 18 months, in fact, ever since I came into the Department, and before the instructions were sent to the AG's office. Once we have a draft Bill it will go out for public consultation as well, so there will be plenty of opportunity for anybody to have their say on the Bill.

645 The Licensing Bills in the Isle of Man are all over the place. This really is a very big tidying-up exercise, which will make life a lot easier for the courts, for the licensing trade, basically for everything. It covers the music licences, it covers off-licences, it covers just about everything there is and hopefully this time next year we should be making great progress with it, Mr Speaker.

1.10. Domestic abuse disclosure scheme – DHA plans for legislation

The Hon. Member for Douglas Central (Mrs Corlett) to ask the Minister for Home Affairs:

Whether his Department is considering bringing forward legislation to provide a domestic abuse disclosure scheme?

The Speaker: Question 10. I call on the Hon. Member for Douglas Central, Mrs Corlett.

Mrs Corlett: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

650 Could I ask the Minister for Home Affairs whether his Department is considering bringing forward legislation to provide a domestic abuse disclosure scheme?

The Speaker: I call on the Minister for Home Affairs to reply.

655 **The Minister for Home Affairs (Mr Malarkey):** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I can confirm that the Department is currently drafting legislation relating to domestic abuse. As part of this new legislation it is intended that consideration be given to a disclosure scheme of this type being implemented on the Island.

660 Prior to introducing this new legislation into the Branches we plan further targeted consultations with those parties from both Government and other sectors who are responsible for providing services to victims of domestic abuse. This consultation will take place during the summer recess with the view to introducing legislation in the form of a draft Bill before the Branches, hopefully this coming October.

665 **The Speaker:** Supplementary question, Mrs Corlett.

Mrs Corlett: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

670 I am very pleased to hear the Minister's reply there that he is considering it. Would he agree that there is a real need to consider this as things like the use of online dating websites – the fact that the population has increased generally means we know people less well than we used to?

675 Would he also agree in a domestic abuse case recently the perpetrator was told by the court to inform Probation if he formed a new relationship; the reason for this is that any new partner *could* be at significant risk, but would not have the right to either ask or the right to know? Would he agree that relying on the perpetrators of domestic abuse to disclose this information is perhaps the wrong way around?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

This is quite complex these days, with data protection, as to how much information can be disclosed.

We are aware that the UK government did do some trials on this: four police forces between 2012 and 2014 did some trials and then it was rolled out. It is not statutory on the books of the UK, which is something we would like to look at in more depth for the Island. But it is not something I am prepared to rush at because of, as I said, the complex issues of data protection, it works both ways in a situation like this.

But certainly the Department is taking this extremely seriously. It is commonly known, I think, as Clare's Law which was introduced – Clare Wood – going back to 2009, if memory serves me right.

POST OFFICE

1.11. Post Office retail network – Number operating in past, present and future years

The Hon. Member for Ayre and Michael (Mr Baker) to ask the Chairman of the Post Office:

How many post offices were operating within the Isle of Man Post Office retail network at 31st May in each year from 2000 to 2019; and how many the Chairman expects to be operating at 31st May in each year from 2020 to 2025?

The Speaker: We turn to Question 11. I call on the Hon. Member for Ayre and Michael, Mr Baker.

Mr Baker: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I would like to ask the Chairman of the Post Office how many post offices were operating within the Isle of Man Post Office retail network at 31st May in each year from 2000 to 2019; and how many the Chairman expects to be operating at 31st May in each year from 2020 to 2025?

The Speaker: I call on the Chairman of the Post Office to reply.

The Chairman of the Post Office (Ms Edge): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I can confirm that the following number of post offices were operating between 2000 and 2019: between the years 2000 and 2002 there were 33 offices operating; between 2003 and 2006 there were 31 offices operating; in 2007 there were 29; 2008, 28; between 2009 and 2010 there were 27; between 2011 and 2013 there were 25; between 2014 and 2018 there were 24; and in 2019 there are currently 23 offices operating.

In answering the Hon. Member for Ayre and Michael, Mr Baker's question regarding how many we expect to be open between 2020 and 2025, the Board of Isle of Man Post Office are currently in the process of looking at the future strategy of the retail network, which will be coming to the other place in October this year. I am also unable to foresee if a sub-postmaster, for whatever their reason, wishes to give notice on their private business.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Baker.

Mr Baker: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

715 Could the Chairman give an explanation as to the approximately 30% decline in the number of post offices between the start of the period and the current date and could she explain what, if anything, the Post Office is doing to address this decline?

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

720

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Obviously if you look at those figures it has been an average of one per year in the last 10 years, and that seems to be continuing. With regard to what is the Post Office doing, as I have said, we are bringing a retail strategy forward to all Hon. Members to Tynwald in October for debate and that is where the retail network will be debated.

725

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Peake.

Mr Peake: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

730 I would be grateful if the Chair of the Post Office could just confirm to me, please, if these sub-post offices ... they are private businesses, aren't they? They are actually owned by the business and it is not actually the Post Office that owns them.

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

735

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr Speaker, and I thank the Hon. Member for Douglas North for that question.

Yes, these are all individual private businesses providing a service for the Isle of Man Post Office.

740

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Shimmins.

Mr Shimmins: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

745 Does the Chairman agree that the sub-post offices, which are private businesses, some of them are closing due to lack of footflow and that this is because customers are choosing, their choice, to do their business using more convenient methods? And does the Chairman also agree that all organisations, big and small, need to adapt to changing consumer trends, technology and customer demands if they are to remain relevant to our community?

750

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr Speaker and I thank the Hon. Member for Middle.

755 Yes, I do agree. The challenge that Isle of Man Post Office are facing is the footfall through each individual sub-post office and the individual sub-postmasters are making their own business decisions with regard to this.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Hooper.

Mr Hooper: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

760 I have got a number of questions which I will try and keep together. The first one is actually could the Hon. Chairman please provide a breakdown – I appreciate she will have to circulate this information – of those closures split between the Crown offices and the private businesses? Not all of those post offices that closed were in fact private businesses as has just been stated; some would have been Crown post offices.

765 Also, if she could provide a breakdown as to the number of those offices that were closed as a result of a decision made by the Isle of Man Post Office Board and the number that were closed because the sub-postmaster resigned and the Board simply decided not to re-advertise that position – if she could provide that breakdown that would be quite useful.

770 My other question for the Hon. Chairman is what factors are considered when it comes to closing a post office, so what factors does the Post Office consider when making a decision as to whether or not to close or simply not re-advertise the position; and does the Post Office have a policy on this that could be circulated to Members?

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

775

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I am happy to circulate the breakdown that the Hon. Member has suggested. There were two Crown offices which closed; obviously one of them was in the Hon. Member's area in Ramsey.

780 As a Board, Isle of Man Post Office has a board structure, and we do consider all of the relevant factors from an individual point of view. The majority of footfall through our sub-post office network is from our MiCard customers, now, they are a service which we provide for the Department of Health and Social Care. So we consider all elements before making any decision on whether to allow a sub-postmaster ... A sub-postmaster will resign if they choose to, a lot of them are reaching retirement age, and we look at every element and what impact that is going to have on all of our customers.

785

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Baker.

Mr Baker: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

790

The Chairman acknowledged the point from the Hon. Member for Middle that organisations need to adapt and remain relevant in changing times. Does the Chairman feel that the Post Office Board is properly embracing that challenge and is actually coming forward with the vision and direction that the organisation needs? Or is it simply effectively falling victim to the circumstances and everything is happening around it?

795

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

800

I genuinely believe that the Board is working really hard to look at every option open to Isle of Man Post Office to make it sustainable for the future. Within the Post Office Act we have to be financially responsible and sustainable, and that is what we are looking for.

As I have said, we are bringing the retail strategy forward for Members to debate in October.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Dr Allinson.

805

Dr Allinson: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

810

I would like to thank the Chair of the Post Office for reaffirming that the retail strategy will be presented. Can I ask, over the last 10 years, when we have a loss of 10 post offices, has there been a clear strategy for post offices and sub-post offices and has that strategy been reviewed in the last 10 years, particularly in terms of the terms and conditions that sub-post offices have to function under?

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

815

The Chairman: I can certainly comment on since I have been Chairman and, yes, the contract for sub-postmasters has been reviewed. I cannot comment for previous Chairs. Obviously on the

network we have a number of people who are on different contracts because of the time that they took up their post with Isle of Man Post Office.

820 But I thank the Hon. Member for Ramsey for acknowledging that we are bringing this strategy forward in October.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Moorhouse.

Mr Moorhouse: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

825 Are there any plans to extend the use of stand-alone machinery and possibly even develop pop-up shops at key times like Christmas?

The Speaker: We are starting to stray a little. Chairman, if you are in a position to reply to that question.

830

The Chairman: As I have stated, the retail strategy will be coming forward with a number of options in it.

The Speaker: Mr Callister, supplementary question.

835

Mr Callister: Yes, thank you, Mr Speaker.

I fully acknowledge, as a couple of the previous speakers have said, this is private businesses, but could the Chairman just clarify that it was the Isle of Man Post Office Board that has not allowed for a new sub-postmaster to come forward and to provide a service in St John's; and if that is the case can I ask why Isle of Man Post Office has made this decision and what evidence that is based on?

840

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

845

I am sure the Hon. Member will get his answer to that question in the next Question on the Paper.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Baker.

850

Mr Baker: Thank you, Mr Speaker, final one from me.

The Chairman has basically said that the decline is primarily down to individual sub-postmasters choosing to exit their businesses. Can she confirm that in every situation when a sub-postmaster decides to do that, they do actively consider and actually do go out and look for a replacement? And can she also confirm that the Post Office Board does actually look at the reasons behind why this is actually happening?

855

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

860

I am sure all Hon. Members in here are fully aware of the Digital Strategy of the Isle of Man Government which is part and parcel of some of the decline in footfall through the sub-post office network, but I can assure the Hon. Member that we look at everything. We certainly have full communication with the sub-postmaster and his or her reasons for any resignation, we fully communicate that. They also have a union connected to the sub-post office and we are in full communication with them.

865

The Speaker: Final supplementary on this Question, Mr Hooper.

Mr Hooper: Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

870 Really, my final supplementary is pretty much the same as the last one I asked, which is, what factors are considered when making a decision as to whether or not to close or not re-advertise a sub-post office? I appreciate the Chairman might not have this information to hand, but if she could circulate a list of the things that are considered and taken into account every single time one of these closures happens.

875 I would also like to ask the question that was asked by my hon. colleague from Ramsey – I appreciate that a new strategy is coming forward in October but were these closures over the last 20 or so years part of a wider Post Office strategy or has the Post Office not had a retail strategy over the last 20 years?

880 **The Speaker:** Chairman to reply.

The Chairman: I am happy to circulate any of the information that the Hon. Member for Ramsey has requested.

1.12. St John's post office – Resignation of sub-postmaster; effects of proposed closure

The Hon. Member for Ayre and Michael (Mr Baker) to ask the Chairman of the Post Office:

When Isle of Man Post Office was notified of the resignation of the sub-postmaster at St John's; what effect the proposed closure of St John's post office will have on the Isle of Man Post Office's annual income and expenditure; and what assessment has been done on the social impact of this closure on the local community?

885 **The Speaker:** We turn to Question 12 and I call on the Hon. Member for Ayre and Michael, Mr Baker.

Mr Baker: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

890 I would like to again ask the Chairman of the Post Office when Isle of Man Post Office was notified of the resignation of the sub-postmaster at St John's; what effect the proposed closure of St John's post office will have on the Isle of Man Post Office's annual income and expenditure; and what assessment has been done on the social impact of this closure on the local community?

895 **The Speaker:** I call on the Chairman of the Post Office to reply.

The Chairman of the Post Office (Ms Edge): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

900 Isle of Man Post Office was notified of the sub-postmasters resignation on 9th May 2019. I can confirm that as a result of the closure at St John's Post Office the estimation of proposed loss of income for Isle of Man Post Office is £4,264.13. However, the approximate savings that will be generated from this office will be £21,337.66.

St John's local store provides post office services under a contract in store as part of its retail offering within the local community. Isle of Man Post Office understands it is the intention of the landlord of the property in which the post office is currently housed to continue the local store.

905 The elected politicians for Glenfaba and Peel, the local commissioners and our commercial partners that Isle of Man Post Office provides services on behalf of at St John's have all been advised of the closure and we have issued a press release.

We have assessed the impact of the closure on customers and our public sector service obligations. The Isle of Man Post Office Board has given special consideration to its important involvement in providing benefit payments on behalf of the Social Security Division of Treasury. 910 Sixty seven customers currently choose to use St John's post office for the payment of their benefits. There has been full consultation with the Social Security Division of Treasury. Arrangements are in place with their customers and they have been contacted and are already starting to choose an alternative post office to collect their benefit payments. The MiCard service also allows claimants to elect a proxy to collect their benefit on their behalf.

915 The Board took into account the fact that there are digital alternatives and other post offices in the local area to satisfy the demands of customers in respect of other postal and commercial services, including the conveyance of letters provided by Isle of Man Post Office, section 2(1) in the Post Office Act. St John's is just over two miles travelling distance to either Peel or Foxdale, whilst Kirk Michael is four miles. Each of the nearest post offices is accessible using public 920 transport.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Baker.

Mr Baker: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

925 Could the Chairman clarify what consideration was given to re-advertising for a replacement sub-postmaster; and could she also comment that if the net benefit is, as she says, £17,000 per annum to Isle of Man Post Office in closing this sub-post office, is this a reflection of what we will expect to see from the strategy coming forward in October, given that clearly it seems as though the fewer post offices you have, the better the outcome, as far as the Isle of Man Post 930 Office Board is concerned?

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

The Chairman: I keep saying it – we are coming back with this full strategy in October and 935 that will give Hon. Members the opportunity to be involved in what options (**Two Members:** Hear, hear.) they choose to go forward with for Isle of Man Post Office.

I do not want to get into a debate on the individual ideas that have come forward. We have had focus groups, we have had a consultation and we have taken on board everything that has been part and parcel in the community with our customers, to come forward with our retail 940 strategy. We will be presenting that. We will be asking Hon. Members to help us decide the future way forward for Isle of Man Post Office, and that is coming back here in October.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Hooper.

945 **Mr Hooper:** Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

I wonder if the Chairman could confirm then that the reason for this was purely financial, it was purely a financial decision taken.

And I would appreciate an answer to my last question which was, is this part of a wider retail strategy that already exists within the Isle of Man Post Office or is it the case that the Isle of Man 950 Post Office does not currently have, and has not had for the last decade or two, a retail strategy?

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

The Chairman: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

955 As I have already said, I have been the Chairman for three years and we are bringing forward a retail strategy. I am uncertain as to whether there was one prior to that but I will certainly check and answer the Hon. Member's question with regard to that.

960 With regard to the closures, obviously we have contracted service providers to Isle of Man Post Office. As soon as they hand in their resignation or choose to retire, we negotiate with them.

I really would like to thank the sub-postmaster for St John's for being quite open and honest with Isle of Man Post Office as to the difficulties he has experienced within his sub-post office.

965 **The Speaker:** Supplementary question, Mr Baker.

Mr Baker: Thank you, final supplementary from me. Now that the Chairman has directly answered the question from my hon. friend from Ramsey, she might want to answer the question that I did ask as the first part of my last one: what consideration was given to re-advertising for a replacement sub-postmaster in St John's?

970

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

975 **The Chairman:** Obviously, it is very difficult for Isle of Man Post Office at the present time without a way forward for our retail strategy. To advertise something that we cannot tell an individual what it is at this moment in time, I do not think would make any business sense for anybody. Who would want a business that you do not know what the future outcome is going to be until it is debated by Tynwald? (**A Member:** Hear, hear.)

980 I just feel that I do need to remind the Hon. Member for Ayre and Michael of his comments within the health debate recently, that to do a role successfully – this is talking about the board structure of the new Hospital:

If it is to do that role successfully, it must be able to clearly and properly direct the organisation with the minimum of distraction.

And another comment was that the Court:

... together need to find that solution for the people of our Island and it needs to be a solution that is fair, that is equitable and sustainable, a solution that does not simply change a known problem ... These are long-term financing challenges that we have got to face, but they must be tackled.

985 The Isle of Man Post Office is tackling the financial challenges it has got head on and we are coming forward with solutions.

The Speaker: That concludes Questions for Oral Answer.

Procedural – Notices re Written Answers

990 **The Speaker:** Item 2 is Questions for Written Answer and I have a few notices on this one: with regard to Written Question 1, I have given permission to the Chief Minister to not answer the numerical part of this Question on the grounds of its disproportionate effort, but there will be elements of it regarding the policy that will be answered; with regard to Written Question 3, additional time has been granted due to the significant amount of information that needs to be gathered for answering that Question; Written Question 8 will be held over to 25th June; and Written Question 10 has been resubmitted for answer in Tynwald next week.

2. Questions for Written Answer

CHIEF MINISTER

2.1. Foreign air forces at Ronaldsway – Terms and frequency of use

The Hon. Member for Douglas East (Miss Bettison) to ask the Chief Minister:

Under what agreements the Isle of Man hosts foreign air forces at Ronaldsway; which international air forces have utilised the airport over the past five years and how many times; under what circumstances the UK rescinds permission for air forces to be part of any such agreement; and under what circumstances he could refuse to host a nation's air force aircraft under such an agreement?

995 **The Chief Minister (Mr Quayle):** The Isle of Man Airport is licensed for public use and, when open, is available for the take-off and landing of aircraft for all persons on equal terms and conditions. All types of aircraft, including military aircraft, are accepted. This is normal for any commercial airport and no individual agreements are in place.

1000 There is no centrally held data to determine which international air forces have used the airport over the past five years and how many times. The Department for Infrastructure does not have the resources available at this time to undertake the research and collation of the relevant data, to answer the second part of the Hon. Member's question.

The UK is constitutionally responsible for the Island's defence and international relations. The relationship with other nations' air forces is a matter for the UK government.

POLICY AND REFORM

2.2. Golden goodbyes for Government employees – Sums over £100,000; subsequent return to Government work

The Hon. Member for Arbory, Castletown and Malew (Mr Moorhouse) to ask the Minister for Policy and Reform:

Pursuant to his Answer of 14th May, of the Government employees who received such lump sums of above £100,000 in each of the last five years (a) what the highest sum paid was (b) what the lowest sum paid was (c) how many such payments were made (d) what the average sum paid was; and how many of those who received such payments subsequently returned to work for the Isle of Man Government?

1005 **The Minister for Policy and Reform (Mr Thomas):** In my response on 14th May 2019, I advised that 20 exit payments have been made in the last five financial years of £100,000 or more.

1010 Of these, the highest sum paid was £369,386 and the lowest was £103,115. Both of these payments were in respect of redundancy. The average sum paid was £156,655, and 13 of the payments were below this level. The median value of the payments was £120,800.

I am able to confirm that none of those who have received such payments have subsequently returned to work for the Isle of Man Government.

**2.3. Public assets sold for over £100,000 –
Sale details**

The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Policy and Reform:

If he will list the public assets sold since October 2011 with a value in excess of £100,000; to whom they were sold; and what the sale prices were?

The Minister for Policy and Reform (Mr Thomas): The information requested is taking longer to compile than the normal timescales allow.

1015 I anticipate being in a position to provide the information by 28th June 2019.

**2.4. Golden goodbyes for Government employees –
Settlement agreements with confidentiality clauses**

The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Policy and Reform:

Pursuant to his Oral Answer on 14th May, how many of the settlement agreements contained confidentiality clauses?

The Minister for Policy and Reform (Mr Thomas): Neither MARS nor Redundancy Scheme payments normally involve confidentiality clauses, whereas settlement agreements normally do. On that basis, I can advise that five of the cases mentioned in my Answer from 14th May did so.

ENTERPRISE

**2.5. Fairy houses story –
DfE economic assessment**

The Hon. Member for Douglas East (Miss Bettison) to ask the Minister for Enterprise:

How many of the views of the fairy houses story have prompted visits to the Island; and how his Department assesses such economic benefit?

1020 **The Minister for Enterprise (Mr Skelly):** It is important to emphasise at the start that the Fairy House project was not designed to prompt visitors to visit the Island in isolation. It was part of a broader and ongoing campaign to raise the awareness of the Island as an extraordinary place for people to visit and have a wide appeal to a range of target markets. Consequently we have not sought to capture any data on any visitors that have simply come to see the houses and it is unlikely to be a material number.

1025 As part of the overall plans to establish and promote the Isle of Man as a quality visitor destination, Visit Isle of Man, an agency of the Department, work with their contracted public relations team to design and deliver a number of unusual and original marketing initiatives to increase awareness of the Isle of Man and support the message that the Island is 'a special place to work, live and visit'. The 'little people' installations are one of these initiatives.

1030 The installations are a form of 'ambush marketing' which aims to surprise and delight visitors and make an impression. This in turn creates excitement and encourages engagement. Visit Isle

of Man is using the installations to generate awareness and goodwill through use of Manx folklore while at the same time showcasing our stunning natural environment.

1035 By creating a memorable experience for both visitors and residents, it also increases the likelihood that they, or someone who has heard about it, will tell their friends about the campaign. The initiative therefore attracts people to the Island to visit the 'little people' installations in a self-perpetuating way and it will form part of their itinerary when on the Island.

1040 The coverage surrounding the project is estimated to have reached over 6.5 million people, with an Advertising Equivalent Value (AVE) of £367,570. The return on the investment is 14 times the cost of the initiative if measured in these terms.

The Department therefore believes that in terms of the intended goal, increased awareness and visibility of the destination to a broader market, the houses have indeed been successful in generating significant global press coverage which has also included in the majority of cases much more information about the Island, and basic information such as how to get here.

1045 Visit Isle of Man have been delighted with the response from locals and visitors to the fairy houses, with several people on social media commenting they had visited or were intending to visit the Island to search for the houses. This is a supplementary bonus to the overall project objective 'to raise awareness of the Isle of Man through public relations activity'. Such activity, combined with advertising (both traditional and online), social media activity and content marketing promoting the Island's offering, all play a role in attracting visitors to the Island. It is often difficult to measure the impact of certain types of campaigns in isolation on attracting visitors and therefore standard recognised marketing metrics (such as 'reach' and AVE) are used to measure campaign effectiveness in these instances. Each individual marketing campaign and initiative is designed to help achieve Visit Isle of Man's overall objective to increase visitor numbers.

1055 The Department would add that a trail map highlighting Manx folklore, including the 'little people' installations and other folklore activities and sculptures, will be launched in summer 2019. The aim of the map is to promote our culture through an enjoyable interactive activity for families, creating a new and interesting way to explore the full breadth of the Island's landscapes while providing a further incentive for those considering visiting the Island.

2.6. Sefton Group grant – Repayment extension

The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Enterprise:

What legislation was used to extend the terms of the repayment of the tourist grant to the Sefton Group; and who made that decision?

The Minister for Enterprise (Mr Skelly): The grant to the Sefton Group in relation to the conversion of the Sefton Suites was made under the former Visitor Facility Improvement Scheme 2007.

1065 This was a general scheme that provided partial financial assistance for tourism developments that sought to introduce or improve new facilities that were deemed to be an improvement in the market.

1070 In this case the assistance at 25% had a number of conditions attached, including that the facilities would remain for tourism purposes for a period of 15 years and any change of use would trigger partial repayment, with 100% being eligible for repayment within the first 10 years, reducing down each year for a further five years until the full 15 year period had passed. Security was taken to protect this position.

Since the assistance was provided, two of the nine suites have been sold within the original 10-year period and the grant has been repaid in full for these on a *pro-rata* basis as the suites have been removed from the hotel's tourism offering.

1075 The decision to novate the conditions and the security to the new owners was made by the Department in March 2019 subsequent to taking legal advice about the matter and in particular taking into account that the suites currently remain available for tourists as part of the hotel's overall offering. The Department would add that the terms of the grant, other than the change of ownership, have not changed from the original offer of assistance and consequently any
1080 further sales of suites that remove them from tourism use will trigger an element of repayment in line with the conditions.

2.7. Douglas Hotel Holdings Limited – Details of new grant; Sefton Group grant repayment

The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Enterprise:

Whether the balance of the tourist grant to the Sefton Group was repaid; whether a new facility for the same amount and with the same terms was granted to Douglas Hotel Holdings Limited; what legislation was relied on to complete the transactions; what conditions Douglas Hotel Holdings Limited have to comply with; and who the beneficial owner is of Douglas Hotel Holdings Limited?

The Minister for Enterprise (Mr Skelly): As referred to in the answer provided at the May sitting of Tynwald, the Sefton Group PLC repaid the grant on two of the nine suites in full plus interest. These repayments were as a result of the change of use away from tourism rather than
1085 any change of ownership.

The outstanding grant on the remaining seven suites was not repaid but novated to the new owners (Douglas Hotel Holdings Ltd) who accepted the associated liability and conditions attached to the previous assistance and the suites remain available as part of the hotel's overall tourism offering.

1090 As part of the novation arrangements new security documentation has been put in place to ensure the Department maintains a mortgage debenture and joint first fixed charge on the hotel for the remaining period of the terms and conditions. The same terms and conditions apply to Douglas Hotel Holdings Ltd as previously applied to the Sefton Group PLC.

1095 The assistance was made under the former Visitor Facility Improvement Scheme 2007. Legal advice was obtained and the novation completed on the basis that as there was no prohibition against novation in the Scheme then a common law resolution by way of novation was permissible.

Douglas Hotel Holdings Ltd has to comply with the terms and conditions of the original offer of assistance. These are set out in the scheme itself.

1100 Douglas Hotel Holdings Limited is incorporated under the Companies Act 2006 and, as such, information about beneficial ownership is not in the public domain.

EDUCATION, SPORT AND CULTURE

**2.8. School staffing –
Vacancies and recruitment 2019**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Ms Edge) to ask the Minister for Education, Sport and Culture:

How many vacancies there were in each school at the end of May 2019; and how many staff have been recruited to start in September 2019?

The Minister for Education, Sport and Culture (Mr Cregeen): Due to the schools being closed, I am unable to answer at this time. I will be able to provide an answer for the Keys sitting on 25th June.

ENVIRONMENT, FOOD AND CULTURE

**2.9. Energy from Waste Plant –
CO₂ emissions**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Callister) to ask the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture:

What the average CO₂ emissions were from the Energy from Waste Plant in each year since 2008?

1105 **Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture (Mr Boot):** I can advise the Hon. Member for Onchan that the average CO₂ emission from the Energy from Waste Plant for the period 2008 to 2018 was 52,035 tonnes.

In detail, the annual CO₂ emission, in tonnes, reported by SUEZ is as follows:

Year	CO₂ (tonnes)
2008	57,020.7
2009	54,142.3
2010	53,426.6
2011	52,614.4
2012	53,586.1
2013	50,479.1
2014	49,793.0
2015	48,405.2
2016	50,671.9
2017	51,488.7
2018	50,763.7

HEALTH AND SOCIAL CARE

**2.10. Treatment at Clatterbridge –
Question withdrawn**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Ms Edge) to ask the Minister for Health and Social Care:

Whether patients receiving treatment at Clatterbridge are entitled to have a family member or friend accompany them during treatment periods?

[Question withdrawn]

**2.11. Off-Island treatment costs –
Expenses claimed by patients in last five years**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Ms Edge) to ask the Minister for Health and Social Care:

What costs were associated with off-Island treatment claimed by patients broken down by (a) boat, (b) plane, (c) accommodation, (d) mileage, (e) taxis and (f) other in each of the last five years?

1110 **The Minister for Health and Social Care (Mr Ashford):** The following table provides a breakdown of the budgeted costs for patient transport for each of the last five financial years.

	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19
Air Travel to UK	£2,444,000	£2,461,000	£2,573,000	£2,661,000	£2,637,000
Sea Travel to UK	£93,000	£105,000	£95,000	£118,000	£158,000
Accommodation in UK	£197,000	£218,000	£219,000	£218,000	£250,000
UK Road Transport	£343,000	£348,000	£365,000	£361,000	£373,000
IOM Road Transport	£116,000	£125,000	£127,000	£121,000	£117,000
Total	£3,193,000	£3,257,000	£3,379,000	£3,479,000	£3,535,000

The figures include costs claimed by or on behalf of authorised escorts and visitors, as these cannot be analysed separately.

1115 The Road Transport figures primarily relate to taxis but include a small amount for mileage claims.

**2.12. Cervical screening –
Possible offer from age of 20**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Callister) to ask the Minister for Health and Social Care:
Whether his Department has considered offering routine cervical screening for women from the age of 20?

The Minister for Health and Social Care (Mr Ashford): The current cervical cancer screening programme invites women for routine screening between the ages of 25 and 64. The Isle of Man screening programme is in line with the UK screening programme which is based on best current evidence. A review is currently taking place to ensure that all adult cancer screening programmes on the Island (cervical, breast and bowel) meet the NHS England programme specifications and quality standards.

Women aged 20 to 24 are not offered routine screening for the following reasons.

Cervical cancer is very rare in under-25s. In the UK, for every 100,000 people diagnosed with cervical cancer:

- About four people are diagnosed under the age of 25 – less than 1% of cases.
- There is an average of zero deaths among under-25s.

Cervical screening has not been shown to reduce the number of cervical cancers in under-25s. We know this because, in countries where cervical screening starts at 20 years old, the number of people under 25 diagnosed with cervical cancer is not significantly different than in countries that start screening at 25 years old.

The number of under-25s diagnosed with cervical cancer is likely to fall even further over the next 10 years thanks to the human papillomavirus (HPV) vaccine.

Research suggests that the risks of offering cervical screening under the age of 25 outweigh the benefits. When you are under 25, it is common to have changes in the cells of your cervix (abnormal cells) and these usually go away by themselves. Knowing about these cell changes could lead to treatment when the changes may simply have gone away on their own. It can also lead to anxiety or upset. There are also potential risks with some treatments, including a slightly increased risk of early (premature) birth if you get pregnant in future.

The evidence summarised above shows that the potential harms or disbenefits of offering routine screening to women aged 20 to 24 outweigh any potential benefits. In view of this, there are no plans to offer routine screening to women in this age group. As with all screening programmes, emerging evidence is kept under review and may lead to changes in the future.

For further information, see:

- <https://www.nhs.uk/conditions/cervical-screening/>
- <https://www.cancerresearchuk.org/about-cancer/cervical-cancer/getting-diagnosed/screening>
- <https://www.jostrust.org.uk/about-cervical-cancer/cervical-screening/cervical-screening-under25>

**2.13. Accommodation allowances for off-Island treatment –
Patients unable to pay**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Callister) to ask the Minister for Health and Social Care:

What process is followed where a patient who attends a UK hospital for treatment is eligible for the per person, per night accommodation allowance, but is unable to pay?

The Minister for Health and Social Care (Mr Ashford): Patients staying in the UK overnight normally stay in hospital. However, there are occasions when patients need to stay in paid accommodation and when this is the case the patient retrospectively may claim a contribution toward this expense from the Department. As Hon. Members will be aware, the contribution payable has recently been increased to £50 per person per night.

I am confident that in the vast majority of cases, the new accommodation rates payable will provide a significant proportion of the costs faced by patients needing to stay in the UK.

I also am conscious, though, that some patients' financial circumstances may be such that they would face real hardship if required to pay for accommodation in advance and then have to wait for reimbursement of this expense. Any patient without the means to pay in advance for accommodation should request assistance at the time of booking their journey. The Patient Transfer Office would in these circumstances do their best to help the patient secure affordable accommodation and, in exceptional cases, may try to arrange direct payment to the accommodation provider in advance of the patient's journey.

**2.14. Director of Nursing –
Job specification; recruitment; number of applicants**

The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Health and Social Care:

When and why the Director of Nursing position was created; what the specification for the role is; what recruitment process was followed; and how many applicants there were?

The Minister for Health and Social Care (Mr Ashford): The interim Chief Executive of my Department identified that in order to fulfil the role of Chief Executive and ensure the voice of nursing continued to be represented at management level (it was previously undertaken by the Deputy Chief Executive), it was imperative that there was an overall Director of Nursing for the Department.

On the formation of the Community Care Directorate, the role and remit of the Director of Community Nursing (who had been in post for 10 years) was extended to include acting as Lead Nurse for both Mental Health and Adult Social Care. The Director of Nursing for DHSC is a further extension and development of this role, links in with the concept of integration across the Department and the person in post agreed that this was a challenge they were able to accept.

If my Department had advertised for this post it would have created an additional new post of Director of Nursing. This would have been an entirely inappropriate use of resources as we already had a Director of Community Nursing in post.

As Hon. Members will be aware, the Department faces a time of significant challenge and change, the post holder we have understands the challenges we have and the challenges we face in implementing the recommendations from the Independent Review of the Isle of Man Health and Social Care System.

INFRASTRUCTURE

**2.15. Public sector housing qualification policy –
Statement**

The Hon. Member for Douglas East (Miss Bettison) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

If he will publish and make a statement on the public sector housing qualification policy?

The Minister for Infrastructure (Mr Harmer): Access to public sector housing on the Isle of Man is subject to two all-Island policies, each of which provides an objective qualification framework for all housing authorities to follow when accessing and allocating public sector housing.

The two policies, one for general needs housing and one for older persons housing, have two parts; the first part sets out the eligibility conditions for those who wish to join the Island's public sector housing waiting lists; the second part determines, via a pointing schedule, how individual applications are prioritised once a person is accepted onto the housing waiting list.

These policies have been approved by Tynwald and are:

- Public Sector Housing (General Needs) (Allocation) Policy 2019 (SD 2019/75) for general needs housing allocation
- Public Sector Housing (Older Persons) (Allocation) Policy 2019 (SD 2019/74) for older persons housing allocation.

**2.16. Horse trams –
Temporary marquee**

The Hon. Member for Douglas East (Miss Bettison) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

What the cost of the temporary marquee to house the horse trams was; and whether the structure was leased or purchased?

The Minister for Infrastructure (Mr Harmer): The marquee was purchased following Treasury Financial Guidelines at a cost of £24,000. It was bought second-hand, but a new marquee of this type would have cost in excess of £96,000.

There are future plans for its use within Government when the permanent Horse Tram Depot is completed in February 2020.

**2.17. Horse trams –
Passenger numbers during TT**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Callister) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

How many passengers the horse trams carried during the 2019 TT Period?

The Minister for Infrastructure (Mr Harmer): Douglas Bay Horse Tram services commenced at the start of practice week, Saturday 25th May 2019, as scheduled. 1,439 passengers were carried over the TT period.

**2.18. Horse trams –
Running costs during TT**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Callister) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

What the running costs for the horse trams during the 2019 TT fortnight were?

The Minister for Infrastructure (Mr Harmer): The direct additional cost incurred for bringing the tramway into operation during the 2019 TT fortnight was £2,174.40, consisting of £1,087.20 of staffing cost for each week.

MANX UTILITIES AUTHORITY

**2.19. Manx Utilities network failures –
Types; cost of repairs**

The Hon. Member for Onchan (Ms Edge) to ask the Chairman of the Manx Utilities Authority:

If he will provide a breakdown of all network failures by (a) type of failure and (b) cost of repairs, broken down by labour and materials, in each of the last five years?

The Chairman of the Manx Utilities Authority (Dr Allinson): Manx Utilities is responsible for 105km of subsea electricity cable, 105km of subsea fibre optic cable, 530km of overhead electricity lines, 1,300km of underground electricity cable, 1,800km of water main, 600km of public sewers, 66km of gas pipeline across all our utility services in addition to flood risk management where we manage 85km of the Island’s designated rivers.

During the last five years Manx Utilities would have responded to a range of faults on its various networks as a result of third-party damage, equipment malfunction, weather-related issues, etc. but assumes that the Hon. Member for Onchan’s Question is mostly focused on the electricity network. For this network, we analyse information based on an industry standard for the average number of minutes lost per customer in a year and this number is comprised of elements relating to asset failures (which can be as a consequence of poor weather) and failures caused by third parties. We also include data associated with prearranged supply interruptions which relate to our maintenance activities. The table below shows the performance for each year in question:

Electricity (Target max. lost per annum = 30 minutes)

	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19
Avg Customer Minutes Lost – Overall	19.49	17.16	13.62	18.26	17.15
No. of Interruptions Overall	250	306	232	230	323
No. of Customers Affected Overall	6136	4187	4064	6094	6549
Avg Customer Minutes Lost – Faults	6.83	4.55	5.41	8.86	7.23
No. of Interruptions Faults	140	166	135	141	145
No. of Customers Affected Faults	3005	1546	1750	4368	3783
Avg Customer Minutes Lost – Pre-arranged	11.06	12.05	5.9	7.29	8.97
No. of Interruptions Pre-arranged	85	111	67	55	159
No. of Customers Affected Pre-arranged	2477	2411	1226	1191	2429
Avg Customer Minutes Lost – 3rd Party Damage	1.6	0.56	2.31	2.11	0.95
No. of Interruptions Third Party Damage	25	29	30	34	19
No. of Customers Affected Third Party Damage	654	230	1137	535	337
Fault Costs/annum (£)	298,470	237,727	291,472	315,643	333,688
Labour cost	115,831	127,135	135,014	119,662	150,156
Materials cost	182,639	110,592	156,458	195,981	183,532

Utilities are assessed against benchmarks supplied by OFGEM and OFWAT and also agreed with our sponsoring Department, the Department of Infrastructure. Ranking for electricity Distribution Network Operators (DNO) shows Manx Utilities as the second best Distribution Network Operator across the UK.

1220 It is worth noting that our Customer Minutes Lost (CML) are provided quarterly to the Cabinet Office as part of the Programme for Government under the National Indicator of 'We have utilities that support our Island, communities and business'.

For information, indicative information is also provided for the water:

Water (Target max. lost per annum = 40 minutes)

	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19
Avg Customer Minutes Lost – Overall	18.01	16.90	28.41	30.55	21.44
Fault Costs/annum (£)	60,764	162,589	273,679	261,456	159,631
Labour cost	42,399	134,927	246,645	233,856	139,777
Materials cost	18,365	27,662	27,034	27,600	19,853

1225 Consumer impact analysis is not possible for our sewerage and gas networks. Manx Utilities does not always have a direct relationship with the all of the users of its sewerage infrastructure and the gas network is primarily a transmission network serving the power station and Manx Gas.

Order of the Day

3. CONSIDERATION OF COUNCIL AMENDMENTS

3.1. Communications Bill 2018 – Item not moved

The Speaker: With that, Hon. Members, we turn to Item 3, Consideration of Council Amendments to the Communications Bill and I understand that is not to be moved today.

1230

Mr Malarkey: That is not going to be moved today, Mr Speaker, thank you.

The Speaker: Thank you.

4. BILL FOR FIRST READING

4.1. Property Service Charges (Amendment) Bill 2019

The Speaker: We then take Item 4, Bill for First Reading. I call on the Secretary of the House.

1235

The Secretary: Bill for First Reading: Property Service Charges (Amendment) Bill 2019 – Member in charge, Mr Harmer.

The Speaker: That, Hon. Members, concludes the business before the House this morning. We stand adjourned until next week, 18th June, in Tynwald Court.
Thank you.

1240

The House adjourned at 11.02 a.m.