

STANDING COMMITTEE OF TYNWALD ON PUBLIC ACCOUNTS

SUB COMMITTEE ON IT PROJECTS

EPTPACIT050511B

AFTERNOON SESSION: 2.02 p.m. – 3.07 p.m.

Douglas, Thursday, 5th May 2011

*The Committee sat in public at 2.02 p.m.
in the Legislative Council Chamber,
Legislative Buildings, Douglas*

[MR GILL in the Chair]

Procedural

The Chairman: Fastyr mie, everybody.

I welcome you all to this meeting, which is the continuation of this morning's sitting of the Sub-Committee of the Public Accounts Committee to hear evidence in public session. For those of you who were not present this morning, I should explain that the PAC was established by Tynwald on 22nd March 1983, and our remit has been amended several times over the years. It is too lengthy to read out today but, in brief, our remit is to examine the expenditure of Government funds and to scrutinise the efficiency and effectiveness of the implementation of Government policy.

This Sub-Committee is examining the procedures for dealing with Government IT systems and we have, therefore, invited officers from a cross-section of Government Departments to give evidence to us, to give us a wide range of experiences to enable us to reach our conclusions.

This morning we heard evidence from the Department of Health and the Department of Economic Development and, this afternoon, we have in attendance officers from the Department of Education and Children. On 12th May, we will hear evidence from the Department of Social Care; and, on 26th May, we will be with the Director of the Information Systems Division.

May I, first, introduce my colleagues on the Sub-Committee: Mr Dudley Butt, MLC and Mr Cregeen MHK, and our Clerk, Mrs Marilyn Cullen.

The *Hansard* Editor is Mrs Callister, who is assisted by Mr Todd Pilling. Mrs Callister is responsible for recording today's proceedings. Could I remind everyone to ensure that mobile phones etc are switched off to avoid any interference with the recording. Could I also ask everyone to ensure that only one person is speaking at all times, to enable us to produce a clear recording of what is said.

Could I now call our first witnesses from the Department of Education: Mrs Brooks and Mr Kinrade.

25 **Q167. The Chairman:** Can I commence by asking you both to state your name, current title and a brief description of your responsibilities in the Department.

Mrs Brooks: Sally Brooks, Head of Services for Children at the Department of Education and Children. My responsibilities include safeguarding and overseeing Special Needs, as well.

30 *Mr Kinrade:* Graham Kinrade, IT Adviser, Department of Education and Children: responsible for IT systems across the Department.

The Chairman: Thank you very much.

To assist in preparing for today's evidence session, we sent you a list of questions which we will be putting to you. Is there anything either of you would like to say, before we start on that list of questions?

35 No in both cases.

40 EVIDENCE OF MRS S BROOKS AND MR G KINRADE

The Chairman: Maybe I could turn to my colleague, Mr Butt, to just give, for my benefit, as a former member of the Education Department but not a current serving member, a bit of context about your IT situation, with your agreement.

45 **Q168. Mr Butt:** Yes, thank you Chairman.

Good afternoon. Could I just ask, first of all, the history of your IT in Education. I believe, initially, you were a stand-alone organisation and you now come under the remit of ISD. Is that correct?

50 *Mr Kinrade:* That is correct, yes.

Q169. Mr Butt: When did that happen?

Mr Kinrade: That happened about three years ago, when I took up the job that I currently hold.

55 **Q170. Mr Butt:** So, prior to then, how did it work in Education?

60 *Mr Kinrade:* We used our own budget from within Education to build and manage and maintain a network infrastructure across the Island, feeding networks into the schools. That came to a point where it required review and renewal and, on looking at what Connect Mann had to offer, that became a fairly obvious step to move into that fold and come onto the infrastructure that had been built up within Government.

Q171. Mr Butt: So prior to that you had your own service?

65 *Mr Kinrade:* We had our own service and, to an extent, we still do, so although we operate on the Connect Mann infrastructure, which is managed and maintained by ISD. We do offer our own services on there and we still have some servers within schools, although I think we are going through the process of trying to bring those together.

70 **Q172. Mr Butt:** Thank you. Could you explain the difference between how you manage the primary sector and the secondary schools, in terms of the IT you provide?

75 *Mr Kinrade:* Yes, primarily we offer a managed service to our primary schools. So our primary schools are a hundred percent Mac in their usage, as opposed to PC computers, and we manage that from a central office, running on the Connect Mann network.

80 Secondary schools, being larger organisations, tend to have their own servers on site at the moment and have been funded in such a way that they can make their own choices as to which IT solution they choose, so we would have a mix across our secondaries. At the moment some would be Mac, some are PC and some are actually a mix of both.

Q173. Mr Butt: So the secondary schools have their own budget and they decide what they spend on

servers, and what they spend on equipment.

85 *Mr Kinrade:* Correct.

Q174. Mr Butt: And you have an overseeing role on that, do you?

Mr Kinrade: We have an advisory role on that, yes.

90 **Q175. Mr Butt:** The Macs in the primary schools, how do you manage those?

Mr Kinrade: We manage that from a small central team. So I have a small team, based at Pulrose, of two engineers plus a project manager, who manages all of our Connect Mann and connectivity issues, as well as the computers, so it is necessary to have two engineers to oversee that system at the moment.

95 **Q176. Mr Butt:** Just for information, because I think it is quite interesting, how many computers, how many Macs, do you run in the primary school system with the two technicians?

100 *Mr Kinrade:* Currently we would have about 4,200 devices out there.

Q177. Mr Butt: With two technicians.

Mr Kinrade: Across our 35 schools, yes, with the two technicians.

105 **Q178. Mr Butt:** Why do you need so few for those?

Mr Kinrade: Because we run the network as simply as we can. We run the devices as simply as we can and we try to keep it clean and straightforward, so that it can be easily managed centrally. We deploy a couple of central technology solutions that enable us to do that, but we try to keep things as clean and simple as we can make them, thereby not layering technology that requires more and more support from us.

Q179. Mr Butt: Are they run on your own servers, your original standalone self servers...?

115 *Mr Kinrade:* At the moment, they are managed centrally and they authenticate centrally. They have storage locally, so they each have a server in school where the children's documents are stored, but we are going through conversations with ISD at the moment that I would like to see our progress away from that, more into a cloud-based solution where that storage goes online so that students are able to access their work from home and from school. At the moment, they can only access their work in school because that is where it is stored.

Mr Butt: Okay, thank you.

125 **Q180. Mr Cregeen:** When you said about your servers, would that be going on to the main Government server, or would you hope that would be a standalone server that would be separate?

Mr Kinrade: Because they are Macintosh computers, I should point out at this stage that, although we operate on Connect Mann, the infrastructure that has been built and runs very effectively, I have to say, we have our own what they call VRF, or our own space, on there, so we do not connect with the central Government network in any way, shape or form.

130 That probably suits both parties: the thought of 13,000 children on the Government network could make some people nervous. But because they are Macintosh computers, they do not integrate fully with those systems, so we operate our own servers, that are also Macintosh servers, that offer the management of our services that we require.

135 **Q181. Mr Cregeen:** So where would the servers be based: would it be within Education?

Mr Kinrade: Because those servers, at the moment they are based in DC1, they are based with all the Government servers... we just have our own racks up there and they are hosted within that datacentre.

140 **Q182. Mr Butt:** The repair and maintenance of those, who does that for you?

145 **Mr Kinrade:** We have our own repair and maintenance, so when we joined Connect Mann, part of that joining was to put in place a memorandum of understanding between ourselves and ISD so we each understood who was expected to fulfil what role and that was really a comfort piece from our side and probably from ISD's side, as well. Part of that was that one of my two technicians has access into DC1 as and when required to attend to the servers that we need to attend to.

150 **Q183. Mr Butt:** So, is there any problem if it suddenly goes down during the day or the middle of the night: you have no problem with access to get in there to repair?

Mr Kinrade: No problem at all.

155 **Q184. Mr Butt:** When you try to start a new system, or bring on something new, onstream, you have to go through the service request form, I think. You have to do that as well, presumably?

Mr Kinrade: Yes, we follow the same methodology.

160 **Q185. Mr Butt:** How do you find that system works?

Mr Kinrade: I probably have different views from other Departments. Having come from running something entirely on your own, to then step into someone else's methodologies is not an easy step to take.

165 I think the system is warranted and I can see the value in the planning procedures that should be around, bringing systems like this on line. I think sometimes, when you are working to another person's methodologies, they can seem long winded and if you do not fully understand them and you do not feel part of them, they can be quite a disempowering situation to be in, where suddenly you feel like something is being done *to* you, rather than you being able to manage something through yourself. But that could be six of one and half a dozen of the other, as to where the fault for that lies.

170 The main issue, I suppose, I would have around that is, again, it comes down to that lack of full understanding of what the expectations are from the other side. You can place in a request, it can then come back to you to be told that is not the right form of request, it should be this sort request, and it should go over here. So you place it there and those things become frustrating but, really, those are communication issues and those are conversations we have with ISD quite regularly to try and iron these out and clean that communication channel between ourselves and them.

175 **Q186. Mr Butt:** And is that working? Is that conversation working?

180 **Mr Kinrade:** Yes, I believe so. They are fairly robust conversations sometimes, but that is how I like to operate. They are regular conversations.

185 We have regular steering board meetings which, again, were set up at the inception of us coming in. I think there was a recognition that we are a very large Department – maybe not in Civil Service numbers, but in students that we support and devices that we support we are a large Department – and we have regular meetings every month where I have an opportunity to escalate issues if I need to escalate them.

Q187. Mr Butt: You seem to indicate that there were some frustrations with the systems –

Mr Kinrade: I think there are always going to be frustrations.

190 **Mr Butt:** – and I think the word you used was 'control'. You said you would lose control over your project because it goes through other people.

195 **Mr Kinrade:** I think it is the same issue I would face as trying to offer a service into schools – and, I dare say, schools would say exactly the same back to me – that if we just step into a school and we decide that 'we are going to centralise all of your services', they would feel disenfranchised from that service and their ability to run their business, based upon that service. So that is quite a difficult line that we have to tread, as a Department, with the schools we offer services to.

200 There are benefits in centralising those services, but I think that is a conversation for us with each school about 'what is it you are doing, what is it you want to achieve, which are the best services to centralise?' – and which services may, actually, be best left in the control of the school, if they understand it better and require it to deliver their business. I do not always feel I sit in that space, when dealing with

it centrally.

205 **Q188. Mr Butt:** It seems as if your lack of control is an issue for you. How does that relate to you as the customer? You are the customer of ISD: how do you feel you are treated as a customer?

Mr Kinrade: I am not saying it is necessarily a lack of control; it is a *perceived* lack of control. I think it is the –

210 **Mr Butt:** So what is the customer experience, then?

215 **Mr Kinrade:** The customer experience will vary. In some instances, taking 40 schools from the network we were on in July of the year it was done, whatever that is mathematically, within a six-and-a-half, seven-week period all 40 schools had been moved onto the Connect Mann network, and I think that should not be under-estimated, as being a huge challenge to deliver.

220 There were many people who thought it would not be delivered, and it was. It was delivered on time and the schools opened on the first day, and we all had connectivity, so I think frustration may vary dependent on what it is you are trying to deliver and how successful you feel you have been in delivering that particular project. So if we looked at the move to Connect Mann, I was not frustrated at all. I was astonished, to some extent, that it was done so quickly and cleanly and efficiently.

There are some projects that we try to push through where, yes, levels of frustration can run high.

Q189. Mr Butt: Can you give us examples of those? The pupil database, I think, is an example?

225 **Mr Kinrade:** Yes, the pupil database is a protracted project.

Q190. Mr Butt: Can you go through it from the beginning, how it has developed, please?

230 **Mr Kinrade:** Yes, one of my first tasks, when I took this job – so that would be November, 2007 – I was asked to look at centralising pupil data systems for the Department. The Department operates a number of management information systems, both across its primary schools and within its secondary schools and there was a wish for the Department to have a central view of that data of students to enable planning and management etc. We approached ISD with a view of where we would like to go with that.

235 We fell into the methodologies of SIRs and SRFs, as you mentioned before. We have now just gone live: well, we are just in the testing phase, in the live phase, but that has taken three years to get to that point and that has been fairly protracted. I could not sit here and say it has been any individual or Department's fault.

240 There have been a number of issues along the way, but there have been times through that project where, as a Department, you feel we are not fully in control of where this is going and where we want this to go. Some could look at that from the outside and say, well, some of that communication issue may also sit with us. It is not all just one sided, this fault, and I think more work from our side and possibly from ISD side needs to be put into that communication channel, managing the expectations of where we are going and when we may get there.

245 **Q191. Mr Butt:** If you were still in charge of your own destiny, in terms of your computers, say prior to four years ago, how would you have managed that project then? How long would it have taken? We are talking about 2007 to 2011, aren't we? That is four years.

250 **Mr Kinrade:** Yes, three and a bit, I could have my own... [*Inaudible*]

Q192. Mr Butt: If you were still with your own servers and your own systems, what would have happened then?

255 **Mr Kinrade:** It would undoubtedly have been delivered considerably quicker, yes. There is no denying that; but we would have done that by not following the methodologies that are followed centrally and I am not necessarily saying that that is the right way to go, either – to just abandon all methodology and say, 'We'll have one of those, please', buy a server, put it in, install it and create connectivity. We could have done that within a matter of weeks, I am sure.

260 **Q193. Mr Butt:** Would you follow proper security protocols doing that?

265 **Mr Kinrade:** Not as heavily as they are being followed at the moment, and I am not saying that is... I think it is a positive thing that those security protocols are in place. Yes, they add to the timescale, yes, they add to the complexity, but when we are dealing with student data, I think they are required.

Mr Butt: Okay, thanks.

270 **Q194. The Chairman:** Can I just ask, on the required security level, there are different levels of security requirements for different types of information.

Mr Kinrade: Absolutely.

Q195. The Chairman: Some of the information that you will be dealing with is very sensitive –

275 **Mr Kinrade:** Correct.

The Chairman: Some of it is not, but all of it seems to be... Am I understanding this right? All of it has to meet the strongest security test all the time?

280 **Mr Kinrade:** Yes, I can see what you are saying. Again, I should point out that with us being on the slightly different levels of the network, our data does not live in the central Government Realtus system, so those are not the levels of security that we meet. We are actually creating our own different layered security systems, so data in a school would be considerably more accessible than data in our secure data areas in DC1. But, yes, if you take a server and put it into a secure space where it has to be accessed by
285 particular levels to factor authentication on a network, if you then add other systems to that same server, they all have to be accessed to that same level.

Q196. The Chairman: Am I right in asking is there automatically, therefore, a cost in time and money that attends to that?

290 **Mr Kinrade:** I do not think that would follow, no. Maybe there are people better qualified to answer that than me. I think once the server is in and is serving systems, to add another service to it is not necessarily a huge cost to do so.

295 **Q197. Mr Butt:** Can I just follow on from that? Could I ask Mrs Brooks a question on this?

What effect has that had on the actual education system, the way children are dealt with? If you had had it in three years ago, would things have been different from what they are now? You are a former teacher as well, I believe.

300 **Mrs Brooks:** Yes, I was part of a group that was on a secondment at the time, looking at data as well, so we fed into what Graham was planning. It would make it a lot easier for us to have information centrally for planning and resourcing, if we did have that information. It would make it a lot easier to get that into a central position. It would be nice if we had had it, but we have to carry on in any case, without it. Hopefully, it will be there very shortly.

305 There is no point for me... I have got to work in where we are and wishing for it... Yes, it would be nice, if it was there, but it is not. So it does mean that we have to collect information from schools in a more time consuming way, at the moment. So for instance, if we are looking at special needs information, so to collate the Special Needs Register, we have to ask each school in September and then again, six months later, we ask for an update, but it is all done on paper – it is all done electronically via e-mail, but
310 it is not something that we can easily access on a day-to-day basis, to see things as they are now. We cannot access the attendance, for instance, of children centrally at the moment. It is something that we are waiting for that to be part of the whole system.

315 **Q198. Mr Butt:** So when this was starting – in November 2007, I think you said –

Mr Kinrade: Yes, could be. I have not got the exact date with me so I would not like to nail –

Mr Butt: What was the reasonable expectation?

320 **Mr Kinrade:** I seem to remember having a wish to have it in in six months.

Q199. Mr Butt: And it is still not in, as such?

325 *Mr Kinrade:* It is actually in, and there is an end-to-end live test scheduled for next week.

Q200. Mr Butt: Do you think that is reasonable? I know there are lots of reasons to say why it might have been extended, but that does seem longer than I would expect.

330 *Mr Kinrade:* As I said at the beginning, it has been a protracted project and I would say there have been issues on both sides. I think some of those are around the legalities of taking that software in and ensuring that we are properly covered and maintained in that software, but I think there are also issues both for myself, from a Department of Education and Children view, and also from ISD's view of taking two large organisations and networks and enabling them to work together. That has posed some issues on both sides, so I would not sit here and say, 'Oh, yes, it is all their fault.' It is not. I think we also have made some errors along the way with this. But, yes, it has been a long time to do it.

Q201. Mr Butt: Another question which may be a bit naïve.

340 It seems from my experience of how you work, that the Apples in primary schools seem to function without any great problems, with very few staff and ISD is very much Microsoft based, isn't it?

Mr Kinrade: They are, fundamentally.

Q202. Mr Butt: I know we are trying to compare chalk and cheese here but is there any merit in, perhaps, ISD relaxing their policy of Microsoft and moving to a –

345 *Mr Kinrade:* I really do not think I would be qualified to make that statement. I think the services I offer in a primary or a secondary school are considerably different from the services that ISD offer.

350 I often make the case that, in a primary school, I am protecting a picture of a horse and a child's story of what they did at Tynwald Hill last week. That is not quite the same as what is being protected, if it is my tax records. I would wish to see different levels taken.

So I think I would need a much greater understanding of ISD and the function that they fulfil right across Government, before I could answer that.

355 **Q203. Mr Butt:** I asked the question from a naïve point of view, in that one of our remits is to see how we can save money. It does appear that, in terms of number of staff employed by the Apple machines is a lot less than it is to do with Microsoft.

360 *Mr Kinrade:* We choose Apple for a number of reasons. One is total cost of ownership: they are incredibly cheap for us to run and maintain, they are incredibly reliable in the format that we run them and, yes, it is true to say we do not deploy an awful lot of Microsoft software on them, because even in the Education pricing, I find it considerably more expensive than most other software that I can get my hands on, that I require for educational delivery.

365 **Q204. Mr Butt:** May I just ask one further question. This is slightly separate. You mentioned to us in a previous meeting that you tried to get some terabytes of hard drive?

Mr Kinrade: I think, again, I suppose every Department would sit here and say we are a bit different, wouldn't they?

370 I will sit here and say we are a bit different, in that, because we brought two networks together, yes, there are new servers that we now operate, that ISD have built and supported and maintained and delivered services for us from, but there are also servers and services that I brought in from the old network, which are wholly our responsibility and we are finding sometimes we have issues around where I want to add something to one of those older servers. As a temporary measure in this particular instance, I required some backup on the back of a server. Before we decide what we do with that, long term, whether we centralise into the new systems, or whether we... And that became difficult. My view of cost for backup for that was a few hundred pounds. ISD's view was different.

Q205. Mr Butt: Can you give us the figures on that?

380 *Mr Kinrade:* Well, I believe they have changed now, so I do not think I am going to... The authority on the new costs of disk storage within DC1, but they were tens of thousands, as opposed to the hundreds

I was looking for.

385 **Q206. Mr Butt:** Did you end up buying the tens of thousands worth?

Mr Kinrade: No, in fairness – and this is where communication comes in – ISD have enabled us to deploy what I want to deploy and that is being deployed right now.

390 **Q207. Mr Cregeen:** When you talk about records and it has taken nearly four years to get in, what was your initial cost? You were saying it was going to be a six-month scheme, that you hope will be up and running in six-months, what would you say time... because they must be your man hours and everybody else is going to... Would you say it is still within the budget that you were hoping it would fit into for the six-month period?

395 *Mr Kinrade:* The initial project never got to the point of budget, so I do not have a comparative budget to say, 'I could have done (a) for this much; but we have had to do (b) for this much.'

400 **Q208. Mr Cregeen:** So when you see the price you are getting now, would you say that you think it is reasonable?

Mr Kinrade: Yes, I think, fundamentally.

405 'Reasonable' is an interesting word. These are expensive systems to put in and run. But the majority of the cost, although there is consultancy time in there for the support from ISD, the majority of the cost is to the software supplier. These are not cheap systems.

Q209. Mr Cregeen: On the consultancy, were you allowed to choose your own consultant or was it chosen for you; and do you have any say in what they are actually doing?

410 *Mr Kinrade:* The consultant was supplied for us.

Q210. Mr Cregeen: Who was that?

415 *Mr Kinrade:* The consultant was supplied for us from ISD. We use them... all of our interactions between DEC and ISD are now handled through Alan Sandford, who I would speak very highly of on all occasions. I have no issues there.

420 I think projects of this size and of this scale and the fact that that data, as you rightly pointed out earlier, is both valuable and requires different levels of access from different people across various areas of Government. Those projects are very complex and require very careful planning and very careful delivery. Whether we could have delivered that without the services of somebody like Alan Sandford, I would question. So yes, there is a cost there, but I think it is an acceptable cost to ensure those things are delivered correctly.

425 **Q211. Mr Cregeen:** So, when you are looking to bring a project forward and you go to ISD, do they give you any choice on who your consultant will be?

430 *Mr Kinrade:* I am not quite in that position any more because we have that relationship with ISD where I have regular meetings with Allan Paterson and with Peter Clarke, and with anybody else who is... and Alan Sandford is always there as well. I have somebody who understands exactly what the two relations are, so I am never in a position where somebody turns up who I do not know, who is going to project manage.

Q212. Mr Cregeen: This is an external consultant, not somebody from within ISD?

435 *Mr Kinrade:* Correct.

Q213. Mr Cregeen: And he attends all your meetings with...

Mr Kinrade: Correct.

440 **Q214. Mr Cregeen:** And would you say that is necessary all the time?

Mr Kinrade: He does not attend every meeting blithely. He attends meetings he is required to attend. If I want to go across and talk to Allan about something, I do not expect to find Alan Sandford sat there as well. He attends by invite.

445 Is it necessary to have somebody involved? For us, yes. Again, it comes back to this joining of two networks. Where I am working under somebody else's protocols and systems and processes, you require help to find your way through those and to ensure that you interact with them correctly, and that is what those consultants do for us.

450 **Q215. Mr Butt:** When you come to repairs of faults in the secondary schools, do you have technicians employed in the secondary schools – not you, but the schools themselves?

Mr Kinrade: Schools will employ technicians of varying numbers, yes.

455 **Q216. Mr Butt:** How many have they got, do you know?

460 **Mr Kinrade:** It will vary across the secondary schools, and although you would probably say there are between two and maybe four, dependent on the school, in each one they would also have other functions, I think, as well. So they will support AV and projectors and televisions and all sorts of other things, as well as just computers.

Q217. Mr Butt: So if there is a problem, do they do a heat call to ISD, or do they do deal with it themselves?

465 **Mr Kinrade:** Again, that will vary. If they have purchased the kit from a catalogue through ISD, then if there is a problem they will raise a heat call through ISD and the support will come back that way. If there is legacy kit that was not purchased in that way, they will support it themselves.

470 **Q218. Mr Cregeen:** So when you say that you raise a heat call, will you then be charged for that person to come to fix your machine?

Mr Kinrade: No, that is part of the PISAM agreement, that we pay an annual fee for that level of support.

475 **Q219. Mr Cregeen:** So you pay an annual fee for them to maintain it?

480 **Mr Kinrade:** I pay an annual fee on the PISAM contract – well, it is not the PISAM contract now, I am not sure. But I pay an annual fee that offers that support across all of the PCs within DEC – within the schools in DEC, sorry.

Q220. Mr Cregeen: So when you look at the catalogue and you see the prices in the catalogue, would you say it is a competitive price or slightly weighted?

485 **Mr Kinrade:** I think there is no simple answer to any of these things. When you look at the price of a PC in a catalogue, I am quite sure some of our schools would say, 'I can buy it cheaper from Misco or whatever.' Well, yes, you can but you will not get the five-year swap out with it. You won't get the call out through 'Heat'. Also, the prices in the catalogue invariably include unboxing, tagging, testing, installation of software, installation of system.

490 So, again, you are back to comparing apples and pears. You have to look at those prices and look at exactly what that price is including and then I think it is for an establishment to decide, 'Do I buy the equipment ready to plug in and go – and I have paid more for that – or do I buy it cheap and then employ somebody to do that work for me?'

495 **Q221. Mr Cregeen:** That is computers. But if you look outside the computers – and you could go telephone, fax machine, or something like that – other consumables that you are looking at, surely the price wise on that... it is like a disposal cost, really, isn't it?

500 **Mr Kinrade:** Not an easy one for me to comment on because that is not the type of thing I would be buying into schools. What we tend to do is buy into schools high quality pieces of equipment, with support and maintenance on the back of them. What I do not want is equipment that becomes integral to the delivery of a piece of education in a school – that if it breaks, we have not got a support contract that

says it will be repaired.

505 **Q222. Mr Butt:** Can I ask about priorities?
ISD service the whole of Government – every Department. (*Mr Kinrade:* Yes.) If you have a project that needs, you think, to be dealt with fairly urgently and you are competing against Health and Treasury and other people, is there any method for you to move up the queue? How do you control that?

510 *Mr Kinrade:* I am not sure I can control it and if there is a method for prioritising that, I am unaware of it.

Q223. Mr Butt: You take your chance then.

515 *Mr Kinrade:* Yes, I survive reasonably well in the he-who-shouts-loudest methodology.

Q224. Mr Butt: Is that the way it should be done, though?

520 *Mr Kinrade:* I am not saying that is the way it should be done, but I have no knowledge or influence across what happens with other projects. I have responsibility to deliver the projects for DEC and I do the best I can to deliver those.

525 **Q225. Mr Butt:** If something was very urgent and needed to be done – say the safeguarding monitoring and you needed a new system for child protection *now* – how would you deal with that with ISD?

Mr Kinrade: I would raise the appropriate paperwork and raise at the steering board that this had become a critical issue and I required instant action on it. To be honest, I would anticipate that that would probably be heard and dealt with. I have never been in a position where I have been told, ‘Yes, well, bad luck, you’re number 47 in the queue, out you go.’

530 Where we have had issues that needed very rapid responses, I have received rapid response.

Q226. Mr Butt: Can I just ask about small matters: when you need, say, small changes to a web page or you need to bring in a very small program. Do you have to go through ISD to do those things, as well?

535 *Mr Kinrade:* On a Government website, yes, you would have to do that.

We do not operate any of the schools in that space, for that very reason. Our schools operate websites on our own servers, and they are different websites than Government would want to see on their servers, anyway. These are added to by children and commented on by children. They are used to deliver work and they are very live sites. Typically, our web server would see 300 to 400 changes to the websites per day, with updates from staff and children. That is not an environment we could operate the school sites in.

Q227. Mr Butt: The DEC website – you would have to –

545 *Mr Kinrade:* The DEC website, that is exactly how it has to be managed, yes.

Q228. Mr Butt: Can I just raise a small program that Mrs Brooks knows about, the personal education plans for children who are looked after. I know ISD helped in the end to help make that happen, but that was a small simple program, Mrs Brooks, which I believe you have managed to bring in very quickly and cheaply. Could you just go through that very briefly?

550 *Mrs Brooks:* It was something I had seen while I was working at Ballakermeen and when I had been to a ‘Looked after children’ conference in London. We had had issues with trying to ensure that personal education plans were completed for children in care and we wanted to up the percentage of those who completed.

555 I had seen this software, so Graham and I got the company to come over to do a demonstration for us. We then tried to work out how we could get that implemented – I think that was probably about the January, I am not sure, I cannot remember now. It was probably round about January or February 2009 and we had that implemented in September 2009. That was because it could go onto our own servers, I believe, so that would be... My part of it was, we got the people over and looked at it and then looked to
560 see how we could get that implemented.

565 **Q229. Mr Butt:** Right, so by using your own servers, you are able to do things quite quickly and get a program in, which is quite crucial for serving a number of children. It has actually been done quite quickly by having your own server. So, I am really asking the question about the merits of having a server, stand alone, for things... [*Inaudible*]

Mrs Brooks: There have been benefits, as we were able to get that in place quickly. The issue will be trying to move that to be much more widely accessed.

570 At the moment that is accessible on Department of Education childrens' sites – and I am sure Graham will correct me if I get this wrong – and it is accessible on Social Care sites as well. It is not accessible anywhere else and in order to get that to be more widely accessed, for instance, for children in care to be able to access that in the care home or those that are being fostered, in the foster home, we would have to go through an awful lot of security hoops in order to get that.

575 Again, I can understand why we do have to go through a lot of the security, because my understanding is that, as an Island, we are wanting to publicise ourselves as a very safe place to work for e-commerce. So I think there are hoops that need to be gone through to show that we are a very secure place for that, so I believe – this is my understanding of it – that is why there has to be that security and we cannot just open up access, particularly for children in care, we cannot open access to data about those children in care, without having the right protocols in place to have the right checks and balances, to ensure that is safe. I think that would take a much longer process in order to open that up to St Christopher's Children's Centre and to homes, to people in the wider community, because it is access to data about children in care.

580 **Q230. Mr Butt:** But, at the initial level, things can be done quite quickly and flexibly. With ISD's consent, they can be flexible when they need to be?

585 *Mr Kinrade:* I think any IT system is more agile and more simply managed, the smaller it is. As systems become bigger and bigger... If I had had 27 other systems running on that server that Sally wanted to install on, it would have been considerably more difficult for us to say, 'That's fine, we can add that service.' That is just the nature of IT. That is what the Department of Education and Children will have to watch, going forward, is that if we centralise everything and make the centre big and complex, that is going to slow down the agility of schools. There has to be a balance there. That is a balance we have to be aware of, within our own Department.

595 **Q231. Mr Butt:** We have heard from Health this morning that the main hospital system, MedWay, is on the same server as Axapta, the main Government finance package, and that has caused problems. So I see the same as Education, then: the smaller they can be and more self-contained, so you can put things in with them, will be better, from your point of view, than one big, one central point?

600 *Mrs Brooks:* I think they have to be checked. Whatever you are going to put onto that server, you have got to check that there is no conflict. So you are testing it against everything else that is on there as well. So the smaller system is then more flexible, in that you do not have as many checks to do.

605 *Mr Kinrade:* But from a Department of Education and Children standpoint, that is exactly what we are being delivered centrally. We will have our own servers that we can deliver these services from that are not part of the main Government system. We have our own separate domain.

Q232. Mr Butt: Is that because, historically, you were on your own? Do you still...?

610 *Mr Kinrade:* I think it probably comes back to 13,000 children on the Government services. I do not think Government and what Government wishes to deliver, and Education and what Education wishes to deliver, naturally meet in the middle. The infrastructure and the sharing of the infrastructure, absolutely fine; but the services are fundamentally different and that was a very early conversation that we had with ISD, that we are fundamentally different in our school space and the flexibility we require is considerably more than you would want to see on a Government network.

Q233. Mr Butt: But as you said before, every Department could say that, can't they?

620 *Mr Kinrade:* They probably would, yes. (*Laughter*)

Mr Butt: Thank you.

625 **Q234. The Chairman:** Can I just talk a little bit about Connect Mann. You seem, to my impression, almost have the best of both worlds, in that you have the ability to have an immediate programme that you can put on your own server, which is standalone, or you can operate Apple Macs, or you can go into the bigger Connect Mann service, so you almost have a menu of choices – is that right?

630 **Mr Kinrade:** That is probably a fair description, yes, depending on how... If we want to deliver something just to our schools, that is quite easy for us to do. If I want to deliver something on the internet... Sally's ePEP with a... that is a more difficult... not undoable, but it is a more difficult, step to take.

635 **Q235. The Chairman:** So you have got that flexibility that is not enjoyed by other parts of Government.

Mr Kinrade: I certainly have that, yes.

640 **Q236. The Chairman:** Yes, you do, and I know you cannot answer for anybody else, but from your experience that flexibility is not a position that other Departments of Government would be able to enjoy?

Mr Kinrade: I am not aware of any other Departments that are quite like us, no.

Q237. The Chairman: So your experience is quite separate to that of others?

645 **Mr Kinrade:** I would think so, yes.

The Chairman: Thank you.

650 **Q238. Mr Cregeen:** We heard this morning that people could be seen to be not wanting to rock the boat with ISD because they are, at the end of the day, the only people that you can go to. Are you aware of this concern across Departments, that people are afraid to actually say there is anything wrong because the request could be going to the bottom of the pile and things may not work out the way you would like them to?

655 **Mr Kinrade:** I have no reason to suspect that that would happen within ISD. I have no evidence that would say to me, 'Oh, yes, that's how I'd be treated if I...' I feel I should sit here and speak honestly about what I am being asked.

However, some of the issues that I may or may not feel I have are possibly issues between two personal individuals, and they are best dealt with between two personal individuals.

660 I think it is very easy, as I said before, if you lined the schools up and said, 'Here are some stones, would you like to throw them at Graham?', there are a few that probably would. That does not necessarily make them right or me wrong. I think you need to be very careful; I need to be very careful of the perception that I give. On the whole, we operate one of the best services into schools across the UK.

665 If I go into the UK and people ask me what I have at my disposal – we are currently centralising management information systems from secondary schools – in speaking to the authorities in the UK and speaking to the company that deliver that, if I say to them, 'I have got this central service that is being delivered, it is broken across two data centres on virtualised servers with automated backup and I have got 1G fibre that links into it', they laugh at me. They are nowhere near that. We must not lose sight of the fact that what we are delivering here is a very, very high quality, fast network, but on the scale of Government, that we want to deliver it, it is always going to bring challenges. It is never, ever going to be smooth and easy.

670 In IT, we all think we know best! I am certain I know best for Education – but I also know, at the back of my mind, that that is probably not actually the case. You are always going to have those trade-offs and just because I may have issues over certain things and I have robust conversations about them, that does not mean that is an issue that cannot be resolved. I think that is normal business methodology. I think that is how we work through things. I think there are some fundamental issues that might be looking at, and I would come back to what I said earlier about communication. That, to me, is the crux of a lot of this, both me to ISD and me down to schools. It is about communication.

680 **Q239. Mr Cregeen:** Do you consider it could be a 'knowledge is power' thing, because, as you have got a reasonably sized IT network with you and some of the other Departments are trying to bring

services forward, you have probably got a bigger stick to bat with than some of the smaller Departments. So could they be feeling they are outgunned when they go to ISD and say, we only want something simple and they go, well, really, in the pecking order we know best.

685

Mr Kinrade: That may be possible. I am not sure I could comment on how other Departments are perceived or feel they are perceived within ISD.

690

I feel if I go to ISD with an issue, I am listened to; they may well argue and usually would have a view on some of the things that I want to do, because we are fundamentally different and, sometimes, I do not feel I get the answer I want, but then, life is not like that: you do not always get the answer you want.

695

That just causes me to go back and try again from a different perspective. That does not necessarily make me right and them wrong, or them right and me wrong, that is just about finding a compromise that enables us to deliver our business and ISD to feel that they have delivered what they need to deliver, as well. I am not sitting here in a fear of saying what I think.

Q240. Mr Cregeen: Do you have any concern that, with your use of Apple somewhere down the line they may say: right, we are drawing this to an end and now you will procure PCs?

700

Mr Kinrade: I think in olden days there might well have been that fear. I do not believe that is the case now. I think our education is known widely outside of the Isle of Man and the UK and I think we are regarded as doing good work within schools and IT.

705

I think also there is a recognition that the days of education being about training children to use a PC and Word are long gone. This is a much wider sweep of IT, enabling learning across all areas of the curriculum, so I do not get any indication from ISD that they think they know education better than us and are going to step in and dictate delivery, apart from which we covered all that in the memorandum of understanding when we first joined Connect Mann. That is about knowing very clearly what you want as a Department and laying that on the table.

710

Q241. Mr Cregeen: Whereas, because you were outside, you were able to come up with that memorandum, that is your ultimate 'I have got this and you have said this,' whereas possibly across the rest of Government, they haven't... you know, 'You're logged in with us, so you have not got that memorandum.' Do you think that would be helpful for other Departments to have?

715

Mr Kinrade: I find it a very helpful tool to have, yes, but us, as a Department, to have very clear views and visions about what we want and where we want to go and to be able to articulate that, so that then ISD have some idea as to what our expectations are for deliveries.

Q242. Mr Cregeen: Or it might be helpful for other Departments to have that agreement with –

720

Mr Kinrade: Yes, it is a helpful tool for me.

Q243. Mr Butt: Can I just mention, then, you use words like 'robust conversations', 'challenges', 'frustrations', 'communication problems' –

725

Mr Kinrade: That is –

Mr Butt: I will go further: you used... there are obviously some conflicts on there, without going into specifics.

730

You run a system, which I think is acknowledged, almost worldwide, as being one of the best education systems based on IT... I think so, as well. You are on more than twice the number of machines that ISD run, don't you? So if you could be, say, in charge of ISD, how would you change... (*Laughter*) I am not saying you should be – but I am saying how would you change... You run a successful network of over 5,000 machines – is that right? How would you change – or maybe 7,000 machines – what ISD do to make it simpler, better, 'faster, cheaper and quicker' I think that is the three words they use?

735

Mr Kinrade: I am not sure I can answer that. I think what I could say is what do I concentrate on to run my own network. I could not take the methodologies that I currently operate to deliver IT to a primary school and automatically say that is going to work in Government, in Treasury.

740

Mr Butt: You have said that, yes.

745 **Mr Kinrade:** So one thing I am very clear on, from day one of taking this job, is that whatever we do with IT in the future has to not repeat some of the mistakes I think have been made over the last 10 years. I am speaking of DEC now, of our own organisation, where IT has to enable the end user. That is the function of IT, and if it does not enable the end user then we have to question what we are doing and why, and if the end user does not feel in control of that process, whether that end user be an individual, a child or a Department, then there is something fundamentally wrong with the process.

750 So everything we are doing within DEC is to try and say, yes, some things we need to centralise, but some things we need to leave with that organisation to empower that organisation to operate under their own remit and deliver what they are meant to be delivering. I think if we take too much of the IT back, then you actually disenfranchise people from the process and they feel that they are no longer able to deliver their business.

755 **Q244. Mr Butt:** It seems to be that technology takes precedence over the outcomes in some cases.

760 Would you say, then, from something this morning about the servers being crucial here, it is not where the servers are but the size of the servers and what is on them, like smaller servers with different applications on them, separate from each other so they are more manageable, rather than the big mass server? Would that be part of your ideology? You said at the beginning, 'We keep it simple,' with your Macs.

765 **Mr Kinrade:** We do. It is a remarkably straightforward and simple network. Yes, there is benefit. We took the decision, when we put the servers into the primary schools, not to centralise all of the storage into one massive space, which may well have been cheaper for us to do. Actually, as I say that and do the sums very quickly in my head, I am not sure it would have been, but if, for example, that had been, that also brings risks, and we have to look at it and say, 'Well, which solution that we deliver will most empower that school to continue to work, even if we have an issue with the IT? Are we going to put something in where they will all just stop working, or are we going to put something in where they can still stand and feel like they have some autonomy in what they are trying to do?' I think that is even more important in a secondary school, that autonomous feeling that we have some control over our destiny with the use of this technology.

Q245. Mr Butt: So you are treating customers nicely, keeping them happy. Keeping the customer happy.

775 **Mr Kinrade:** Yes. I think you need to challenge, and I am not sure all the secondary schools would say we achieve that, but certainly that is a goal that we set out. There is no point in me making everybody feel that we have taken the power away, because then I think IT does not deliver what you want it to deliver.

780 **Q246. The Chairman:** We had, I think it is fair to say, a less than happy customer conversation this morning with colleagues from the Health Department. Their experience with ISD is they had – I think we could call them FD27 conversations, where FD27 is taken out as the big stick – that is that, that is the end of the conversation; lump it. You might be the customer, but that just involves paying. We do not offer you an explanation, we just say how it is going to be. Is that an experience that is isolated to DoH in your experience?

785 **Mr Kinrade:** I could not directly answer that: I could say it is not my experience.

790 I think we have some issues, for example, over the catalogue and the equipment in the catalogue and its suitability for use in schools, would be an example – so FD27 would say we should be looking at the catalogue and purchasing from there. Some of that equipment is not as we want it to be, but if I have that conversation within this instance, I have had that conversation in ISD... that is fine, tell us what you want, then, and we will put it on the catalogue!

795 I have never come across the sort of, you will do it this way or you walk. What they say is, 'Okay, if that way does not fit, tell us how that way does fit and then we can, maybe, tailor that', so it is back to, as I say, communication.

It is always about communication. I have to be very clear about what I want, so I have to garner that from the schools and then take that forward to say, this is where we need to be. I do not know, but maybe if I went in with something completely off the wall, maybe I would get a different attitude, but –

800 **Q247. Mr Butt:** If you went in and said I want my own servers, saying I want a server for my own particular reason, FD27 would be using... FD27 says you cannot, except in exceptional circumstances.

Mr Kinrade: It does say that.

805 All I can say is, at this moment in time I am not coming across that problem, but some of that is because we operate the Apple platform and there are no servers that ISD will supply that will do what I want to do there and I have put some things in, that I think, initially, they have not necessarily agreed with but, through conversation, we have come to an arrangement – and that is all I would ask. I certainly would not expect ISD to play the yes-man role and just say ‘Yes, do whatever you want, boys’ because, then, what is the point?

810 Somebody needs to be that sort of gatekeeper, but certainly if I was in a Department where I felt I could not influence that, then, yes, I might have some greater concerns.

815 **Q248. The Chairman:** I think part of the frustration, from certainly your Health colleagues, was that there was no meaningful or up-front explanation of what an exceptional circumstance is. ‘It just is, lump it,’ was the way I heard their description.

Mr Kinrade: Right, okay.

820 **Q249. The Chairman:** Is that an experience that you have –

Mr Kinrade: Not an experience I have had, no.

Q250. The Chairman: Is it an experience that you are aware other people might have had?

825 *Mr Kinrade:* I could not recall an instance that has been shared with me, no.

Q251. The Chairman: Thank you.
Is that the same with you, Mrs Brooks?

830 *Mrs Brooks:* I feel like I am here under false pretences. I cannot answer any of this. I have not come across anything like that. I am not really working in the IT field.

835 **Q252. Mr Cregeen:** It probably comes back to your memorandum of understanding that you have got with them, so you do not really need to be coming up against this because you have got... If they take their ball away, you have still got a ball.

That is part of the difference between Education and Children and a lot of other Departments, in that you have still got a ball and it does not matter what they do, you can still run with it.

840 *Mr Kinrade:* Broadly speaking, yes. I understand what you are saying, but I would have to say, I have never come across a situation where I think they are threatening to take their ball away, to use your parlance there. That is not the relationship we have with ISD. Yes, some of the conversations are robust: that is partly down to me! I am fairly robust in the way that I tackle things, which – (*Mrs Brooks:* Yes!) (*Laughter*) Thanks for that, Sally – that was the opportunity to come in and say, ‘No, you’re not!’ (*Mrs Brooks:* Sorry!)

845 But that is about having a clear vision of where you want to go and a belief in where you want to go, and going to achieve that. Sometimes, yes, they will knock me back and things become robust at that point. That is fine. That is acceptable. I do not have an issue with that, provided we get to an end product with it.

850 I would have an issue if we just did that forever and never ever got a solution. Then I would begin to have a problem. Sometimes, of course, I want the solution yesterday, so there is bound to be levels of frustration there. But I think if I realistically look at what we are trying to deliver, there are always going to be those levels of frustration and those robust moments, when you are trying to drive your point home.

855 **Q253. Mr Butt:** Talking about vision for the future, can I ask you do you have any idea what the vision of ISD is for the future? Would it involve you eventually losing your servers and coming off the Macs, and becoming part of the main structure? Has that conversation ever been had with you?

Mr Kinrade: No.

860 **Q254. Mr Butt:** So you think you will maintain your integrity in terms of maintaining your Macs and your Microsoft system in the secondary schools?

Mr Kinrade: Absolutely.

865 **Q255. Mr Butt:** And have the servers... will they stay as they are? You say you still have some...

870 *Mr Kinrade:* I do not think the servers will necessarily stay as they are, but I think that will be a decision for DEC. That is our decision as to how we want to take... So my strategy for the next three years would see those services that are being delivered on those boxes moved, but that is my view, that is the Department's vision as to where we want to take IT for Education.

Q256. Mr Butt: And do you know what the ISD's vision is? Is there any indication of that for people like you in Departments?

875 *Mr Kinrade:* I could not quote it right now, no. That does not mean it is not out there. That means I am unaware of it.

Mr Butt: Okay, thanks.

880 **Q257. Mr Cregeen:** Just one thing. You were saying you have these robust conversations with them.

Mr Kinrade: I am regretting that now, aren't I?

885 **Mr Cregeen:** You have this dialogue when you are having difficulties and there is the communication part of it coming across, where... who knows what. If you came to a point where you are dealing with your colleague in ISD and you feel as if you are banging your head against a wall, where would you go to next? Who would you say was the political lead in ISD?

890 *Mr Kinrade:* I have never reached that point. If I feel I am reaching levels of frustration where I am not getting forward in something, I have never had an issue with picking the phone up directly to Allan Paterson and saying I need to have a chat. He has always found time for me to go and do that and we have always come to a resolution, so I have never had to take it beyond that point, but I think, in fairness, there has been a lot of time on both sides invested over the last three years in creating a relationship where I can do that.

895 As I say, it is very easy to throw stones into organisations that are trying to run such large systems, but from me there is a level of understanding of the difficulties that ISD face. Sometimes, the frustrations, I feel, are down to the fact that they just have not got the manpower to throw at the thing I want them to do. That is just the way it is. We all face that within Government.

900 **Q258. Mr Cregeen:** So who repairs your systems? If there is a problem with it, do you go to ISD or do you have your own people? If it is with your Apples, do you phone, do a heat call, and then –

Mr Kinrade: The Apples are supported by my two technicians.

905 **Q259. Mr Cregeen:** Outside, the PCs, is that –

Mr Kinrade: PCs bought from the catalogue are a heat call.

910 **Q260. Mr Cregeen:** And how do you find that? Is that a satisfactory response?

Mr Kinrade: We operate our own helpdesk, as well, for Education, for schools to come into. It was something I put in three years ago when I took this post.

915 I just have a belief in what a helpdesk should be. You should be able to e-mail the helpdesk. It should e-mail you back and say, 'Thanks – Here is your ticket number and here is a note of your problem,' and then every single person who makes any comment against the job that you have raised, you should be able to see all of that comment down, and every time it is updated you should get an e-mail to say Fred Bloggs, the technician, has said he has looked at it and he has got a problem with this and it is going to be two days before it is fixed. You know then, and that is about empowering people. So I find Heat quite a cumbersome system, personally, to deal with in comparison to what we do now.

920 **Q261. Mr Cregeen:** So it does not do that?

925 **Mr Kinrade:** No. Communication, I would put that under. That comes back to communication. There are times when we feel we do not know what is going on with a particular call that is in. The schools would say, 'We don't know what is happening. We raised a heat call and we don't know where it is, who's got it or where it is up to.' But that is just communication. That is an easily fixed thing, but would make a big difference, I think, if it was fixed.

930 **Q262. Mr Cregeen:** Would you say that the heat system is actually outdated because people have moved on from Heat years ago and –

Mr Kinrade: Maybe I do not know enough technically about it.

935 **Q263. Mr Cregeen:** When something breaks down, you remember how well people deal with it when it has broken down. So if you react quickly, yes, that is great, but if you do not know where you are in the system, like you said, it is very frustrating. Who do you contact? You contact which person?

Mr Kinrade: Lack of communication and lack of management of expectations causes frustration.

940 **Q264. Mr Cregeen:** So you have been in this position now for over three years. How do you feel? You must have commented on this to ISD, and yet we are still in the situation where there is frustration and there is nothing come about. So when does that become an issue for you to say, 'Look, we've had three years of not knowing where heat calls are, not knowing what you are going to do. Are you doing anything about it?' Have you had that conversation with them?

945 **Mr Kinrade:** I think ISD are aware of my views of Heat, and I understand it is being looked at.

Q265. Mr Cregeen: How long? From what time period? Are you being told it is getting looked at this month? Is it next year? Is it in five years' time?

950

Mr Kinrade: I think ISD are aware of the issues with Heat and are wishing to resolve those issues, but I could not speak knowledgeably about where they are up to in that or when to expect a solution for that.

955 **Q266. Mr Cregeen:** So doesn't this come back to the communications? They are not actively communicating to you. You have told them there has been a problem for three years. 'Yes, we are looking at it, but we are still in a situation where they are telling you...

Mr Kinrade: Communication is king in everything you do, isn't it?

960

Mr Cregeen: Thank you.

Mr Butt: I think we have got the point on that.

965 **Mr Cregeen:** Yes.

Q266. The Chairman: Could I just ask, do you think, from your perspective, that the ISD move from Treasury to the Economic Development Department will make any difference?

970 **Mr Kinrade:** That is a very good question. I... Sorry, I am giving that some thought, aren't I?

Q267. Mr Butt: Has it made any difference to you?

975 **Mr Kinrade:** It has not made a difference to me right now. I am trying to foresee if it will in the future. I can understand that there is probably sense in separation from Treasury but, no, I do not think it will fundamentally change the way we operate.

The Chairman: Thank you. Could I talk briefly about data protection?

980 **Mr Kinrade:** Certainly.

Q268. The Chairman: Obviously, a lot of the issues that you deal with are very sensitive and have

data protection considerations. Who and when are those considerations first applied when you are developing or choosing a particular system?

985 *Mr Kinrade:* Not sure I fully understand.

The Chairman: Let us take the example I think we had earlier about the –

990 *Mrs Brooks:* Electronic Personal Education Plans.

Q269. The Chairman: Yes, thank you. That is what you want to achieve. That is what you want it to look like. Who is responsible for making the consideration of the data protection issues that may or may not have to be considered?

995 *Mr Kinrade:* In my eyes, that would be taken through John Gill initially in our Department, who is Legal and Administrative Officer, and then, if required, we would escalate that to Data Protection.

Q270. The Chairman: So if required, how would that requirement be tested?

1000 *Mr Kinrade:* I think it comes down to... In this particular instance, Sally would be the knowledge around the children that are in there, the information that is held and who requires access to that. We would require a system that enabled that granular level of access to be given appropriately to each person. We would then have to test that with John. Whether John chose to take that higher to Data Protection would be John's call, but I would take those questions to John Gill on data protection.

1005 **Q271. Mr Butt:** Can I just come in there? When that was brought in – because I was in Education and I am in Education – I think data protection was at the top of the list all the time because we are dealing with children with a very sensitive lifestyle, sensitive areas... Everything had to be geared round the data protection. Is that right, Mrs Brooks?

1010 *Mrs Brooks:* Absolutely, and it still is. That is still key to it.

Mr Kinrade: Which is why... and I know Sally would like us to move this on, but we started with that system, accessible from a very small number of places, and then we will grow it slowly as requirement dictates and we test each step as we go. Rather than throwing it open to the world and thinking, 'Oh, my word, we need to close this down a bit,' we start from that very tight space.

1015 **Q272. The Chairman:** I do not think I have any more questions.
1020 Could I, before I make my concluding comments, ask if there is anything we have not given you the opportunity to comment upon?

Mrs Brooks: No.

1025 *Mr Kinrade:* I was going to say about communication, but I think I have made my point.

The Chairman: I think you mentioned it. *(Laughter)*

Q273. Mr Butt: Once or twice!
1030 I am taking it now your communication is good with ISD and you are finding improvement over what it used to be some time ago. Is that –

Mr Kinrade: I think our communication with ISD is a thousand times better than it was three years ago, yes.

1035 **Q274. Mr Butt:** So you have moved forward with them.

Mr Kinrade: Always move forward.

1040 *Mr Cregeen:* Apart from on Heat.

Mr Kinrade: Always moving forward.

1045 **The Chairman:** Okay, well, thank you very much. We will obviously consider your comments in *Hansard*. If we do have any further questions, we could come back to you, probably in writing, if we may.

1050 Could I just conclude by, certainly from my own view, thanking you for all the extremely high standard of work that is across the schools and colleges in the Isle of Man, at not only a technical level but, I know, in a very accessible level for the pupils. I think it is a fair comment on my part to make that observation and perhaps you will be good enough to convey that to your colleagues in the Department.

Mr Kinrade: Certainly.

The Chairman: Thank you very much.

1055 That does conclude today and the next sitting is on 12th May in this Chamber at 10.30 a.m. when we will have your colleague from the Department of Social Care with us. Thank you again.

Mr Kinrade: Thank you.

The Committee adjourned at 3.07 p.m.