



HOUSE OF KEYS OFFICIAL REPORT

RECORTYS OIKOIL
Y CHIARE AS FEED

PROCEEDINGS

DAALTYN

HANSARD

Douglas, Tuesday, 6th December 2011

*All published Official Reports can be found on the Tynwald website
[www.tynwald.org.im/Official Papers/Hansards/](http://www.tynwald.org.im/Official%20Papers/Hansards/)Please select a year:*

Reports, maps and other documents referred to in the course of debates may be consulted on application to the Tynwald Library or the Clerk of Tynwald's Office. Supplementary material subsequently made available following Questions for Oral Answer is published separately on the Tynwald website, [www.tynwald.org.im/Official Papers/Hansards/Hansard Appendix](http://www.tynwald.org.im/Official%20Papers/Hansards/Hansard%20Appendix)

Volume 129, No. 7

ISSN 1742-2264

*Published by the Office of the Clerk of Tynwald, Legislative Buildings,
Finch Road, Douglas, Isle of Man, IM1 3PW. © Court of Tynwald, 2011*

Present:

The Speaker (Hon. S C Rodan) (Garff);
 The Chief Minister (Hon. A R Bell) (Ramsey);
 Hon. D M Anderson (Glenfaba); Mr L I Singer (Ramsey);
 Hon. W E Teare (Ayre); Mr A L Cannan (Michael); Hon. T M Crookall (Peel);
 Hon. P Karran, Mr Z Hall and Mr D J Quirk (Onchan);
 Mr R H Quayle (Middle); Mr J R Houghton and Mr R W Henderson (Douglas North);
 Hon. D C Cretney and Mrs K J Beecroft (Douglas South);
 Hon. C R Robertshaw and Mrs B J Cannell (Douglas East);
 Hon. J P Shimmmin and Mr C G Corkish MBE (Douglas West);
 Mr R A Ronan (Castletown); Mr G D Cregeen (Malew and Santon);
 Hon. J P Watterson, Mr L D Skelly and Hon. P A Gawne (Rushen);
 with Mr R I S Phillips, Secretary of the House.

Business Transacted

Page

Questions for Oral Answer

1.1. Town and Village Regeneration Scheme – Funds; success	191
1.2. Reserve Capital Portfolio – Revaluation	192
1.3. Five-year rebalancing plan – Details and progress	193
1.4. Standard & Poor’s – Credit rating downgrade	195
1.5. Motorsport photographers – Awarding of contracts	197
1.6. Motorsport Development Group – Membership; salaries; previous experience	198
1.7. Motorsport Development Group – Staff and consultancy costs	199
1.8. North One – TT brand rights	201
1.9. Farmers’ and contractors’ vehicles – Waste deposits on highways	202
1.10. Sub-marine power cables – Anticipated income; contracts	204
1.11. Bus services – Boxing Day	205
1.12. Post Office – Management pay deal	206
1.13. Fatstock Marketing Association – Directors’ details and objectives	209
Standing Order 3.5.1(2) suspended to allow continuation of Question Time	211
1.14. Care Quality Commission – Department of Health participation	212
1.15. Sexual Health Strategy – Young people	215
1.16. Sarah’s Law – Working party progress	217
1.17. Residential homes – Staff absence	217
1.18. Residential homes – Impact of staff absence	220
1.19. Residential homes – Temporary staff cover	222
1.20. Park Road School – Future plans for site	223

Questions for Written Answer

2.1. Legal Aid – Treasury spending	225
2.2. NHS hospital food – Cost	226
2.3. Prison Service – Food costs	228
2.4. Planning approval expiry dates – Definition of ‘special circumstances’	228
2.5. Planning approval – Extension of expiry dates	229
2.6. Planning approval – Consideration of Strategic Plan	238
2.7. Planning and Building Control – External consultants	238
Procedural	238

The House adjourned at 11.52 a.m.

House of Keys

The House met at 10.00 a.m.

[MR SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

5 **The Speaker:** Moghrey mie, good morning, Hon. Members.

Members: Good morning, Mr Speaker.

The Speaker: The Chaplain will lead us in prayer.

PRAYERS

The Chaplain of the House of Keys

Questions for Oral Answer

CHIEF MINISTER

Town and Village Regeneration Scheme Funds; success

1.1. The Hon. Member for Rushen (Mr Skelly) to ask the Chief Minister:

10 *How much of the £8 million fund for the 2009 Town and Village Regeneration Scheme has been spent and allocated, broken down by town and village; whether the Scheme has been successful for the towns and villages; and if he will ring-fence the funds and extend the Scheme?*

15 **The Speaker:** Hon. Members, we now turn to Item 1 on the Order Paper, Questions for Oral Answer, and I call the Hon. Member for Rushen, Mr Skelly.

Mr Skelly: Ta mee shirrey kied yn eysht y chur ta fo my ennym.

20 **The Speaker:** I call on the Chief Minister, Hon. Member for Ramsey, Mr Bell, to reply.

The Chief Minister (Mr Bell): Mr Speaker, the total amount spent from the Town and Village Centre Regeneration Fund is £656,287. This figure, broken down into towns and villages, is: Castletown, £29,325; Douglas, £327,835; Laxey, £20,774; Peel, £31,416; Ramsey, £212,064; Southwest, £27,598; and others, £7,275.

25 The total amount allocated from the fund is £1,757,101. This figure, broken down into towns and villages, is as follows, although I should point out that some of this allocation has already been spent: Castletown, £176,725; Douglas, £789,223; Laxey, £28,523; Peel, £266,113; Ramsey, £440,895; Southwest, £42,346; and the rest, £13,275.

30 Mr Speaker, the Hon. Member asks whether the Scheme has been successful. Regeneration work has sparked a real interest in our town and village centres and the vital part they play in supporting the local community. In the last two and a half years since the Town and Village Scheme was established the work is well underway and the foundations have been laid, the

framework is currently being built and it has started to deliver tangible improvements in our towns and villages.

35 In terms of hard facts, between 6,000 and 7,000 people took the time to complete questionnaires, attend focus groups and put comments into regeneration consultations. Seventy-seven applications have been made to the fund, 59 of which have been from the private or voluntary sector. Nearly £½ million of private or voluntary sector money has been spent or
40 allocated on regeneration improvements to property in regeneration areas. Two new business or trade associations have been established; 85% of the allocated funding has, or will be, spent on-Island in the construction sectors. Footfall and the take-up of grant applications from individual land owners has been measured before the schemes in the public realm took place and will be measured in the future to compare.

45 Turning to the question as to whether the Fund is ring fenced, I can reassure the Hon. Member that the Regeneration Fund is ring fenced and interest has increased the fund to £8.9 million.

Finally, the need to consider extending the Fund has arisen because local regeneration committees have identified regeneration priorities, which, if they were all constructed, would cost more than is currently in the Fund. When the Chief Minister's Steering Group was established in 2009, it envisaged that the Fund might be added to in the future. The current financial situation,
50 coupled with the local regeneration committees' priorities for funding, necessitated a review of that expectation. Careful consideration has been given as to the way forward for the important work of regeneration.

Mr Speaker, I am pleased to say that myself and my fellow Ministers on the Regeneration Steering Group will be working closely with Treasury over the next three to four years to identify opportunities for additional funding above the current fund. The additional funding and the current fund will be used over this longer timescale to implement the regeneration priority schemes across the Island which have community backing, raised the quality of the physical environment and support the economy.

60 **The Speaker:** Mr Skelly, a supplementary.

Mr Skelly: Gura mie eu, Loayreyder.

Thanking the Chief Minister for his comprehensive reply, can I ask if he will consider revising the Scheme as it currently has no minimum award levels against the fund and should provide for a
65 more equal method of allocating the funds?

The Speaker: Chief Minister.

70 **The Chief Minister:** We are always prepared to look at proposals which are put forward, Mr Speaker, but at the moment we have no plans to revise the Scheme. It is a very tightly targeted Scheme.

The Speaker: Mr Quirk, Hon. Member.

75 **Mr Quirk:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Could I ask the Chief Minister regarding those that may not have put any schemes forward, is the Working Group still happy to accept schemes to come forward to support the economy?

The Speaker: Chief Minister.

80 **The Chief Minister:** Within the context of the criteria set by the Regeneration Committee, Mr Speaker, we are always prepared to accept new ideas.

TREASURY

Reserve Capital Portfolio Revaluation

1.2. The Hon. Member for Douglas North (Mr Houghton) to ask the Minister for the Treasury:

To what extent his Department has recently revalued the Reserve Capital Portfolio; and

- 85 (a) what the total amount was following revaluation;
(b) when and how the revaluation took place;
(c) when the previous revaluation was undertaken;
(d) what the total valuation was at that time; and
(e) what the variance is?

90 **The Speaker:** We turn to Question 2, Hon. Member for Douglas North, Mr Houghton.

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name, sir.

95 **The Speaker:** I call the Minister for Treasury, Hon. Member for Ayre, Mr Teare.

The Minister for the Treasury (Mr Teare): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Treasury receives monthly valuations from each of its investment managers, reflecting the current market values of the investment held. The last reconciled valuation was at 31st October 2011.

Turning to part (a), the value of the Reserve Fund at that time was £403.9 million.

Part (b), in relation to when and how the revaluation took place, the fund's market value is reported to Treasury at the end of each month by the investment managers.

105 Moving on to part (c) of the Question, the previous reserve valuation was at 30th September 2011, and (d) at that time the valuation was £391.7 million and (e) the variance between the two amounts over the month was therefore £12.2 million, a growth of 3.1%.

Five-year rebalancing plan Details and progress

1.3. The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Hall) to ask the Minister for the Treasury:

With regard to his November press release statement that Government is successfully delivering its five-year rebalancing plan which is on track –

- 110 (a) when the 'five-year rebalancing plan' was formulated and precisely what period it covers;
(b) what adjustments have been made to the plan to compensate for the reduced Treasury income arising from the 2011 revisions to the revenue sharing arrangements with the UK;
(c) what the target outcome is, on the basis of the applicable figures for each year of the plan and at the end of the five-year rebalancing period; and
115 (d) if he will publish the latest versions of the plan and the evidence demonstrating that Government is on track in successfully delivering it?

120 **The Speaker:** Question 3: again, I call the Minister for the Treasury to reply to the Hon. Member for Onchan, Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: I beg to ask the Question standing in my name.

The Speaker: Mr Teare, please.

125 **The Minister for the Treasury (Mr Teare):** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The original five-year rebalancing plan was published in the 2010 Budget and covered the period up to 2014-15. The plan has been updated to take account of the 2011 revision to these arrangements as part of our preparation for the 2012 Budget and it will be published at that time, sir.

130 **The Speaker:** Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

135 Does the Hon. Minister understand my concerns that the Government might not have a realistic rebalancing in place?

140 Could the Treasury Minister explain what provisions and plans are in place to meet a downturn caused by whatever unexpected eventuality, given that we have had quite a few of these unexpected eventualities in recent years, costing us hundreds of millions of pounds, and we have just had the scrapping of the fuel duty increase that will affect the Treasury revenue and the downgrading of the growth forecast for the UK which is likely to affect Manx businesses and jobs and, therefore, Treasury income?

The Speaker: Minister for the Treasury.

145 **The Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The Hon. Member has a good point but the Hon. Member, really, with respect, is a bit schizophrenic.

150 I am glad he brought up the subject of the fuel levy of 3.1%. If my memory serves me right, he was encouraging the Treasury to waive that income. He has also been in touch with the Treasury, asking for tax concessions on various groups of individuals. So I do not see how, on the one hand, he can say we should be balancing the budget – which I totally agree with – and on the other hand, we should be giving tax concessions. The two just do not add up, sir.

155 **The Speaker:** Hon. Member for Douglas South, Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Does the Minister still believe that perhaps we continue not to learn lessons from history, as he himself speculated as a new MHK during his contribution in the Budget debate in February 2005?

160 Would the Minister put me, as a new MHK – and the general public – in a position where we can think long and hard – as he himself put it back then – about the issues raised in the Question by supplying the information about his proposed 2012 Budget at an earlier stage than in the past so that a consensus can be established? Could he give Hon. Members an indication as to when we will receive those detailed Budget proposals and how long we will have them before we are expected to support them?

165 **The Minister:** Thank you, sir.

As the Hon. Member said, my contribution was part of the Budget debate, so I would respectfully suggest that she makes a contribution at that time.

170 **The Speaker:** Hon. Member, Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

175 Would the Minister agree with me that it is important that the issues at the heart of my original Question are the subject of informed debate next year? Therefore would he discuss with his colleague in the Council of Ministers the possibility of amendments being tabled to the Budget during the course of the debate and the Budget being voted on clause by clause, so that we have a genuine informed debate to reach a consensus?

180 **The Speaker:** Minister.

The Minister: That is the best advertisement for pork barrel politics that I have ever heard, sir.

185 **The Speaker:** Question 4, Mr Hall – (**Mrs Cannell:** Mr Speaker!)
I beg your pardon, Mrs Cannell.

Mrs Cannell: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

190 Does the Treasury Minister consider himself as being savvy in the political arena, to be making such comments as he has just made? Will he reflect on them and not use them again, please, and take the issue seriously?

Returning to the Question on the Paper, can he tell the House when the five-year rebalancing plan started?

The Speaker: Treasury Minister.

195 **The Minister:** It was part of the 2010 Budget presentation, as I mentioned in the original Answer to the Question.

**Standard & Poor's
Credit rating downgrade**

1.4. The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Hall) to ask the Minister for the Treasury:

(a) *What discussions he had with Standard & Poor's (S & P) before downgrading of the Island's rating;*

200 (b) *when and to what extent S & P was made aware of the changes to the Island's revenue sharing with the UK and Government's five-year rebalancing plan and the progress in achieving it; and when, and to what extent, data was provided to S & P that clearly reflect the Island's external position along with evidence of the economy's ability to diversify further away from financial-sector related activities;*

205 (c) *what measures he is undertaking to address the Island's 'external vulnerabilities' as referred to in the report S & P published to explain the downgrade;*

(d) *whether S & P are correct that the Island's 'lack of monetary flexibility' because the Island uses 'the currency of a larger sovereign' is a credit weakness for the Isle of Man and, if so, what the Government strategy is to address this; and*

210 (e) *what other measures is he taking to enable an upgrade of the Island's sovereign credit rating and whether he plans to make data available that clearly reflect the country's external position, along with evidence of the economy's ability to diversify away from financial sector related activities, as suggested by S & P?*

215 **The Speaker:** Question 4 and again, Mr Hall, please.

Mr Hall: I beg to ask the Question standing in my name.

The Speaker: Mr Teare to reply.

220 **The Minister for the Treasury (Mr Teare):** Thank you sir.

In respect of part (a) to the Question, I had no direct discussions with Standard & Poor's, although I was kept informed of discussions between Treasury officers and the company prior to the announcement.

225 In respect of part (b), Standard & Poor's were informed of the changes to the revenue-sharing arrangements most recently in July this year, following the announcement in Tynwald. They have had sight of previous financial rebalancing plans as they are published in the Budget. Data on the Island's external position has been shared with Standard & Poor's, as it has been requested since the rating was established in 1999. This includes national income information, which shows the make-up of the Island's economy.

230 The external vulnerabilities referred to in part (c) of the Question are, really, things we can do little about. They relate to a reassessment by the rating agency of the risks of holding large banking deposits relative to the overall size of the economy. The fact that we have substantial bank deposits is, in my view, a success story and we should not be trying to reduce them to address this concern.

235 In respect of part (d), no, I do not believe that this is a credit weakness.

In respect of the final part of the Question, the advice we have received would indicate that there is little we can do to facilitate an upgrade. If it was simply down to provision of more information, we would certainly have done this by now, sir.

240 Thank you.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

245 Does the Hon. Minister recall last week confirming to my friend and colleague, the Hon. Member for Douglas South, the Isle of Man does indeed have external debt, thus correcting the erroneous belief of some of my colleagues and the wider public that the Isle of Man has no external debt?

Does he also recall hinting at the possibility of rolling the bonds over when they mature, as repayment would seem difficult?

250 Would the Minister agree that the downgraded rating makes it more expensive to refinance the bonds, because of the perceived increased risk of default due to the Island's external vulnerabilities, as assessed by Standard & Poor's? If not, would the Minister perhaps avail himself

of a refresher course from the credit risk professionals, in order that he can understand the external lenders would view a rating downgrade as a reduction in creditworthiness?

255

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: As a former credit risk manager, sir, I fully understand the risks.

260

The Speaker: Hon. Member for Douglas South, Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Does the Hon. Minister agree that managing the credit ratings we have is exceptionally important, especially given the extra borrowing that the Isle of Man Government related entities might have to make in the future?

265

The Speaker: Minister.

The Minister: I do. It is recognised that it is important, but the other side of the coin, too, is – the Hon. Member who has just resumed her seat mentioned – in the future. We have to deal with issues as they arise.

270

The Speaker: Hon. Member for Douglas North.

275

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

As a former credit manager, can the Treasury Minister join with me in considering, really, this whole issue is a sop by Standard & Poor's to downgrade other countries who are doing well, such as this little country here, in order to placate the concerns of the United States when they had their rating downgraded to the one that now 'assimilates' ours, sir?

280

The Speaker: Reply, sir.

The Minister: Well, the interesting thing is that I looked at Bloomberg's this morning – they are one of the leading reference agencies, leading financial agencies providing information – and there is a quote on here by a member of the Central Bank Governing Council of Austria. I cannot really pronounce his name, I apologise for that, sir! He said, in an interview, that the move by Standard & Poor's in relation to the European Union position highlights the problem that rating agencies increasingly are assuming a political role.

285

290

The Speaker: Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Could the Minister advise this Hon. House how much this managing of ratings is costing us each year, both in direct payments to Standard & Poor's, but also from other activity?

295

The Speaker: Minister.

The Minister: It is outside the remit of this Question, sir, but off the top of my head, I think it is £20,000 a year.

300

The Speaker: Chief Minister.

The Chief Minister: Mr Speaker, could I ask the Hon. Minister if he could confirm, first of all, that the downgrade is only by one of the credit agencies and, in fact, that the Isle of Man still has a AAA credit rating with Moody's, which is an equally important agency?

305

The Speaker: Reply, sir.

The Minister: This is a step, as my hon. colleague has said, which has been taken by one of the agencies. We still have AAA for Moody's and really, I think that does reflect the Isle of Man's strong financial position with no immediate need to borrow, sir.

310

The Speaker: Mr Houghton.

315 **Mr Houghton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.
In view of what the Minister has said thus far, can he answer why, then, the Royal Bank of Scotland is uprating its interest on loans in line with Standard & Poor's grading of the Isle of Man?

320 **The Speaker:** Minister.

The Minister: It is within the terms of the facility letter. The facility letter is, in effect, a contract between the borrower and the lender, sir.

325 **The Speaker:** Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I would just like to follow on from the Chief Minister's response: would the Hon. Minister advise this House whether there have been any discussions with Moody's and whether he is expecting Moody's to follow Standard & Poor's in downgrading the Isle of Man's credit rating?

330 **A Member:** Hear, hear. (*Interjections*)

The Minister: As I said in the Answer to the original Question, we do have regular dialogues with the rating agencies, sir.

ECONOMIC DEVELOPMENT

Motorsport photographers Awarding of contracts

1.5. The Hon. Member for Ramsey (Mr Singer) to ask the Minister for Economic Development:

335 (a) *What contracts his Department has with photographers to photograph the TT and its associated events and other motorsport events;*
(b) *whether these contracts have been awarded to Island-based photographers; and*
(c) *whether the employees of off-Island photographers are required to have work permits?*

340 **The Speaker:** Question 5, Hon. Member for Ramsey, Mr Singer.

Mr Singer: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name.

345 **The Speaker:** I call the Minister for Economic Development, the Hon. Member for Douglas West, Mr Shimmin.

The Minister for Economic Development (Mr Shimmin): Thank you, Mr Speaker.
My Department does not currently have any contracts with photographers to photograph the TT, its associated events or other motorsport events. Photographers and photographic agencies have been engaged by my Department from on and off Island, depending on the scale of the work to be undertaken, the location of the work and any specific distribution requirements.

355 In answer to question (c), under the current Work Permit legislation, photographers who are part of a reporting process are not required to have Work Permits, subject to a maximum aggregate period of 30 days per annum.

The Speaker: Mr Singer.

360 **Mr Singer:** I thank the Minister for his Answer.
Can I ask him, as he says that sometimes they will use on-Island photographers and sometimes off-Island photographers, what sort of events would he say our local photographers cannot undertake that he has to go to an off-Island photographer?

The Speaker: Mr Shimmin.

365 **The Minister:** The best way I can answer this, Mr Speaker, is that the most recognised
photographer who is engaged by the motorsport team is a gentleman called Mr Stephen Davison,
who has his own agency and is used when we particularly want to use his work for promotional
purposes, and/or we wish to access his distribution network. Influential publications such as
370 *Motorcycle News* do have a preference for his type of work. Therefore, where possible, it will be
on-Island.

However, I would advise that between 220 and 250 photographers are issued with press passes
at the TT and around 70 at Manx Grand Prix. To be issued a press pass, they have to have
experience and letters from relevant editors and representatives, in order to get the message of how
wonderful the Isle of Man is to a much wider audience. This is often better done by the contacts
375 that these photographers can bring to the table, sir.

**Motorsport Development Group
Membership; salaries; previous experience**

1.6. The Hon. Member for Ramsey (Mr Singer) to ask the Minister for Economic Development:

- (a) *Who serves on the Motorsport Development Group;*
- (b) *what their individual salaries are; and*
- (c) *what their former occupations were?*

380 **The Speaker:** Question 6, again, Hon. Member for Ramsey, Mr Singer.

Mr Singer: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I beg to ask the Question in my name.

385 **The Speaker:** Minister for Economic Development to reply.

The Minister for Economic Development (Mr Shimmin): Mr Speaker, there is nobody
within my Department called the 'motorsport development group'. However, I have answered on
the basis that the Question refers to the DED Motorsport Section within the Tourism Division.
390 This section was formed as a result of the motorsport policy agreed by Council of Ministers in
September 2009.

Mr Speaker, although I am loath to give out individual civil servants' names in a Question in
this House, for clarity, because of uncertainty in this area, I am prepared to do so on this occasion.
The seven staff employed in the section are Trevor Hussey, Paul Phillips, Sian Christian, Paul
395 Moore, Sophie Lowney, Ed Swain and Bruce Baker. Within the team there is one SEO, three
HEOs, two EOs and one AO equivalent. The salaries paid fall within the Civil Service pay spines
for the applicable grades which are published at annex C1 of the Isle of Man Civil Service
Regulations.

With regard to part (c), the former occupations before appointment to the current posts were
400 Trevor Hussey, civil servant; Paul Phillips, IT support finance sector; Sian Christian, civil servant;
Paul Moore, civil servant; Sophie Lowney, civil servant; Ed Swain, civil servant; Bruce Baker,
technician in the oil and gas industry.

405 **The Speaker:** Mr Singer.

Mr Singer: I thank the Minister for his Answer, which was a little vague, I think, but can he
tell me, of these people, how many in fact have had experience of organising major sporting
events, prior to their appointments?

410 **The Speaker:** Mr Shimmin.

The Minister: Mr Speaker, I do not have that information available.

However, anybody who is an observer of motorsport in the last couple of years will have seen
an enormous increase in improvement (**Several Members:** Hear, hear.) in the quality,
415 performance, publicity, coverage, attendance, and an all-round professionalism which has been
brought, in the main part, by this group of individuals who have been brought together for the
skills they bring to the table, sir.

A Member: Hear, hear.

**Motorsport Development Group
Staff and consultancy costs**

1.7. The Hon. Member for Ramsey (Mr Singer) to ask the Minister for Economic Development:

- 420 (a) *How many people work in the Motorsport Development Group;*
(b) *what the total cost is of employing them;*
(c) *whether these employees work on a full-time or consultancy basis; and*
(d) *why it was necessary to spend £57,000 on consultants to study a possible TT World Series?*

425 **The Speaker:** Question 7, Hon. Member for Ramsey, Mr Singer.

Mr Singer: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name.

430 **The Speaker:** Again, I call Mr Shimmin to reply.

The Minister for Economic Development (Mr Shimmin): Mr Speaker, as explained in my previous Answer, my Answer is based on an assumption that the Question refers to my Department's Motorsport Section.

435 The salary costs of the DED employees within the Motorsport Section is £249,244. Members of the DED Motorsport Section are employed full-time and are in permanent Civil Service posts, with the exception of Bruce Baker, who is employed on a part-time contract.

In addition to the DED posts, the Department of Home Affairs currently employs four people on a consultancy basis and is responsible for payments to these consultants. A report will shortly be submitted to the Council of Ministers, following consultation between my Department, the Department of Infrastructure and the Department of Home Affairs, setting out proposals for the future management of motorsport activities.

440 In answer to part (d), my Department is tasked with developing existing business opportunities and identifying new revenue streams. The TT World Series is a concept that is worthy of exploration but this is a complex area and requires expert research and advice. Whilst we acknowledge we have a great deal of in-house experience of promoting the domestic event, an international event, and the commercial opportunities and challenges, is an entirely different matter. It will involve consideration of complex legal contracts within a number of different jurisdictions, in order to provide opportunities for participating organisations to benefit commercially, whilst protecting the TT branded assets of the Island and our own commercial interests. These contracts could involve issues such as circuit preparation, television rights, circuit advertising, transport, team incentives, prize money and other commercial opportunities.

455 The Department, in consultation with the Motorsport Section, concluded that this was not a piece of work that could confidently be taken on in-house. The appointment of the Sports Consultancy was made following a competitive tendering exercise overseen by the Treasury. They offered a competitive tender for the work and were able to demonstrate significant experience in the assessment and organisation of high-value sporting events on the international stage, including the complex legal and commercial issues that arise. We believe they are the right people to do this work on our behalf. They have been contracted to produce a feasibility study only.

460 Decisions about the progression of a TT World Series will be made by the Department, following the submission of the consultant's report. There will be an expectation that the decision we make about any possible future investment in a TT World Series is made after careful consideration of the potential benefits, based on a thorough and independent analysis. The appointment of the Sports Consultancy will ensure that we meet that expectation.

465 **The Speaker:** Mr Singer.

Mr Singer: Can I thank the Minister for that detailed answer.

470 Just one question: does the Minister accept that a TT World Series could, in fact, direct sponsorship from the TT itself and into the Series, should that concept ever go beyond the drawing board?

The Speaker: Mr Shimmin.

The Minister: I am not prepared to speculate, Mr Speaker. We will look at the results of the report and make a decision based on the information.

475

The Speaker: Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Would the Hon. Minister provide information to this Hon. House about the procurement timetable for the TT World Series consultancy, specifically: when and where the call of expressions of interest were made; when shortlisting took place; when and where the shortlist was published; where the tenders were submitted; and when the tenders were evaluated and the successful tenderer was contracted?

480

485

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: Yes, Mr Speaker.

The Speaker: Hon. Member for Michael, Mr Cannan.

490

Mr Cannan: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Could I ask the Minister whether three phone calls, one to the BBC, one to ITV, and one to Sky would not simply have clarified whether a potential World Series was feasible, given that the success of any of these sorts of events is presumably based around the broadcast and television rights?

495

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: No, Mr Speaker, I think that over-simplification of something which we are attempting to do – build the economy and on our biggest brand of the Isle of Man – would not be satisfied by such phone calls.

500

The phone calls would have to be explaining what the purpose, what the outcome, the deliverability and a whole range of measures which would make it a purely pointless conversation between an Island which had no idea where it wanted to go with the co-operation with such as those mentioned, which would have far more questions than we would be in a position to answer. I believe it would make the Isle of Man look foolish.

505

Members: Hear, hear.

510

The Speaker: Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

What precisely are the deliverables specified for the TT World Series consultancy contract, including the precise specification of any reports to be produced?

515

The Speaker: Reply, sir.

The Minister: Mr Speaker, as is quite normal within departmental areas, I have delegated this aspect to one of my colleagues, who is leading it on, so I do not have that information available.

520

If the Hon. Member wishes to pursue this line of enquiries, he is more than welcome to come to my Department. We have no reason to be embarrassed in any way, other than being keen to promote something positive for the Isle of Man economy. If it is to work, then I would hope the House would support us.

525

A Member: Hear, hear.

The Speaker: Mr Cannan.

Mr Cannan: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

530

Could I ask the Minister what track record the Sports Consultancy had in delivering such motor sports events?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

535 **The Minister:** I do not have that information available. However, the tender process, which I have indicated I will be circulating, will provide information and if Hon. Members have a concern about this, please bring it to our attention.

540 We do not have all the answers. We believe we are doing what we are tasked with doing, which is developing the economy and opportunities for the Isle of Man. I am unsure as to why so many Hon. Members seem to consider that an investment of this level is something which is anything other than a major step forward for the Isle of Man. It is attempting to exploit something which has been, particularly in recent years, a massive success, and I hope that everybody will start rallying behind that, sir.

**North One
TT brand rights**

1.8. The Hon. Member for Douglas North (Mr Houghton) to ask the Minister for Economic Development:

545 *Whether the contractor for film rights for the TT is North One (now in receivership); and, if so, what contractual rights North One has to the TT brand and how many unexpired years remain?*

The Speaker: Question 8. Hon. Member for Douglas North, Mr Houghton.

550 **Mr Houghton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name, sir.

The Speaker: Again, Minister for Economic Development to reply.

555 **The Minister for Economic Development (Mr Shimmin):** Mr Speaker, firstly, I regret I must express my concern that Questions, which contain such significant inaccuracies are allowed to be asked in this House and thereby be open to comment in the public domain. Such comments can be damaging to firms engaged in commercial activities and accusations of receivership might result in a loss of confidence, both in any company concerned and the manner in which the Government seeks to develop contractual agreements.

560 I am pleased to confirm that the rights of the TT Races are very firmly held by my Department on behalf of the Isle of Man Government. They are not, and never have been, held by North One Television Ltd. Therefore the question of unexpired years does not arise.

565 With regard to the statement that North One is now in receivership, I would like to again clarify the situation for the benefit of Members and the public. North One Television Ltd is *not* in receivership and continues to provide excellent coverage of the TT as part of the existing contract that continues until 2013. North One Television has been a significant partner in generating additional economic benefit for the Isle of Man through its coverage and the highlights programme was watched by record audiences on ITV4 during the 2011 TT Festival.

570 I am pleased to announce that the company's efforts have resulted in the TT coverage being shortlisted for the best sports programme category in the 2011 broadcast awards. In addition, a great deal of footage was supplied to the CinemaNX documentary *TT 3-D Closer to the Edge*, DVD sales of which were surpassed only by the latest Harry Potter film in the UK last week. In addition, the contract awarded to North One Television in relation to the generation of sponsorship income for the TT is similarly unaffected.

575 However, Mr Speaker, and in order to further clarify the situation, I would like to advise as follows. North One Television sold its sister company, North One Sport, which owned the rights to the World Rally Championship to Convers Sports Initiatives in February this year. It would appear from media reports that this company has encountered financial difficulties, but these are of no consequence to my Department. There are no direct ownership links between North One
580 Television and Convers Sports Initiatives or North One Sport.

Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The Speaker: Mr Houghton.

585 **Mr Houghton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.
Can the Minister advise how long North One has been trading with the Department in this contractual arrangement?

Can he also advise that, in the third year of its trading with the Department, there was going to be a bumper year in the contract: what are the receipts received by the Department in the bumper year, namely this year, I understand?
590

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: Mr Speaker, I have no knowledge of those details, but we will look at *Hansard*, take the question from the Hon. Member, and circulate it to all Members, sir.
595

Mr Houghton: Thank you.

INFRASTRUCTURE

Farmers' and contractors' vehicles Waste deposits on highways

1.9. The Hon. Member for Ramsey (Mr Singer) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

Whether farmers and contractors are obliged to wash their vehicles before entering a highway from a field or site; and, if so,
600 *(a) what enforcement action his Department takes against those who fail to comply;*
(b) how many times his Department has taken enforcement action in the last five years; and
(c) who is held responsible if an accident occurs on the highway because of mud or other waste being deposited on roads by farm or contractors' vehicles?

605 **The Speaker:** Question 9. Hon. Member for Ramsey, Mr Singer.

Mr Singer: Thank you.
I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name.

610 **The Speaker:** I call the Minister for Infrastructure, the Hon. Member for Douglas South, Mr Cretney.

The Minister for Infrastructure (Mr Cretney): Mr Speaker, in answer to the Hon. Member's Question, I can advise that details regarding responsibility for dealing with mud on roads are contained within section 48 of the Highways Act 1986.
615

This section applies where vehicles are driven from any land onto a highway and deposit mud on the highway or another highway in the vicinity, so as to cause danger or inconvenience to vehicular traffic. The legislation states that the person responsible must place warning signs at each end of the length of highway affected and, within reasonable time, take such steps as are reasonably practical to remove the mud.
620

Failing to comply with these requirements constitutes an offence and may result in the Department itself taking steps to remove the mud and recover the cost of doing so.

The Department has not taken any such formal action during last the five years. However, staff have, from time to time, contacted landowners direct or via the Police to advise farmers and contractors of their obligation in this matter. If an accident were to occur as a result of mud deposited on the road and the person responsible had not complied with section 48 of the Highways Act, then it is likely that they would be held liable.
625

The Speaker: Mr Singer, a supplementary.

630 **Mr Singer:** Would the Minister agree with me that this problem has been going on for many years? Can he really explain to me why no action has been taken, certainly in the last five years? Is he aware of a recent accident in my area where it is alleged that a car travelling at normal speed hit mud on the road that was left there from a building site? That car hit another car: a girl was trapped and injured. Who would, therefore, be responsible?

635 Would the Minister agree that somebody at least should be taking action against this building company for, in fact, not cleaning the road up? How is he trying to enforce that building companies, or farmers in fact, clean up the roads after they have left the mud on it?

640 **The Speaker:** Mr Cretney.

640 **The Minister:** I cannot answer in relation to the last five years in terms of enforcement. All I can say is that, during my period of office in this particular role, if a matter requires to be enforced, it will be.

645 What I did say in the original response was that, from time to time, officers in the Department did make contact with farmers or others to make them aware of such situations. I am not aware of the particular example the Hon. Member quotes.

645 **The Speaker:** Mr Houghton.

650 **Mr Houghton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

650 The Minister quotes, in his initial Answer, from an Act in 1986. Surely also he is aware of an amendment in respect of mud on the road in a recent Bill, sometime in the last seven or eight years – a Road Traffic (Amendment) Bill, I recall. What is the difference in the amendment that was in that Bill and what he has just quoted? Can he quote that to this House this morning, sir?

655 **The Speaker:** Mr Cretney.

655 **The Minister:** No, I cannot, but I will find out.

660 **The Speaker:** Mr Quirk.

660 **Mr Quirk:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

665 Could I ask the Minister, in his Answer, he said ‘reasonable time’. Could the Minister give us an indication of what a reasonable time is? Also, if there are repeat offenders – and the Department does have lists of repeat offenders – what action is he prepared to take if there are repeat offences?

665 **The Speaker:** Minister.

670 **The Minister:** Mr Speaker, I made it quite clear that if there are offences, which are considered by my officers to be of such a serious nature that enforcement action should be taken, then we will not hesitate to do so.

670 I would like to thank, actually, the Hon. Member for Ramsey for giving me the opportunity to make clear today, that this is the situation and that people should take these matters seriously.

675 **The Speaker:** Mr Singer.

675 **Mr Singer:** Can I thank the Minister. I am very pleased to have helped him in that respect.

680 Can he tell me, does he not think that... or is it not within planning regulation and planning permission that a building site should have wheel washing facilities for vehicles before they leave the site to go onto the road?

680 **The Speaker:** Mr Cretney.

685 **The Minister:** I think on some larger developments, that is the case. I do not think it is the case on all developments.

685 **The Speaker:** Mr Houghton.

690 **Mr Houghton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

690 In response to my question to the Minister about a more updated Act or Bill that went through this Hon. House some recent time ago, the Minister came back to say he could not advise on it. He has been asked this morning in a parliamentary question in relation to this. He should have been so advised.

695 Can he advise that he will look into this, find out exactly what it is, which he has promised to do, and then circulate his answer to Hon. Members, just in case there is an impediment in the original Answer he has given?

700 **The Speaker:** Minister, I believe you did answer that.
Minister to reply.

The Minister: I did, Mr Speaker, but I am very happy to confirm again to the Hon. Member and all Hon. Members that if there is a more recent piece of legislation, which I have not included in my response this morning, I will of course examine that.

**Sub-marine power cables
Anticipated income; contracts**

1.10. The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

705 (a) *How much the Isle of Man Government will receive by way of capital payment and annual royalty for approving the application by NGET/SPT Upgrades Ltd under the Submarine Cables (Application for Authorisation) Regulations 2004 for consent to install marine power cables in Isle of Man waters as part of the proposed Western High Voltage Direct Current (HVDC) Link marine cable route between Ardsneil Bay in North Ayrshire, Scotland and Leasowe in the Wirral, England; and*
710 (b) *if he will publish any contracts proposed to be entered into by Government in connection with this project, including the amount of money expected to be received, and seek approval for them from Tynwald Court prior to consent being granted?*

715 **The Speaker:** We turn to Question 10. Hon. Member for Douglas South, Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: I beg to ask the Question standing in my name.

720 **The Speaker:** Again, Minister for Infrastructure, Mr Cretney, to reply.

The Minister for Infrastructure (Mr Cretney): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

725 With the completion of the first United Kingdom to Ireland gas interconnector pipeline in 1993, the Department ceased to charge a single capital payment for a lease of easement through territorial waters for such infrastructure projects. Since 1993, all subsequent cables and pipelines have been charged with annual rent for the necessary lease of easement and that would be the Department's intention for this cable, should matters progress.

730 The rent that will be charged for this cable, should the application be progressed and be approved, would be based on available, comparable commercial rents, including those already being paid for existing cables and pipelines. Negotiations are some way from being completed with representatives of the applicant and as these negotiations are commercially sensitive, it would be inappropriate to disclose the Department's position at this time.

735 There are currently three pieces of legislation which impact on an application to lay a submarine cable, namely the Harbours Act 2010, the Submarine Cables Act 2003 and the Government Departments Act 1987. The provisions that the Department is entitled to grant under the Harbours Act and Submarine Cables Act do not require prior Tynwald approval. However, as ownership of the territorial sea and seabed is vested in the Department, the provisions of the Government Departments Act 1987 apply to the granting of permission to lay the cable. In particular, if the permission extends for more than 21 years, Treasury concurrence is required.

740 There is no requirement under the legislation to seek prior Tynwald approval. The Department will comply with the appropriate legislation in considering the matter. Myself and my officers are quite content to privately brief the Hon. Member or any other Hon. Member on any further details required, so as not to expose the commercial confidentiality aspect.

745 **The Speaker:** A supplementary, Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

750 Would the Minister agree with me that the territorial seas which the Isle of Man owns consist of 87% of the Island's territory and that this represents significant opportunities for our future economic development? Has his Department been involved in negotiating any planning gain from this application for the 72-kilometre marine power cable to run, buried in our rocks, beneath our sea, and does it receive any income from the other numerous cables and pipelines which the proposed marine power cable will cross?

755 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: I have indicated that there are a number of other cables etc from which the Department does accept some income.

In relation to the part about planning gain, I am not in a position to answer that at this time.

760 **The Speaker:** Mr Hall.

Mr Hall: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

765 Is the Minister aware that the Isle of Man territorial seas are surrounded by international waters on three sides before the territorial seas of the nations across are reached, and that it is proposed that over 80 km of cable will be laid in these so-called 'international waters'? Will the Isle of Man be seeking to extend any benefit it can possibly negotiate from this opportunity up to the median line between the Isle of Man and the neighbouring islands inside a quasi-exclusive economic zone or EEZ?

770 **The Speaker:** Mr Cretney.

The Minister: Yes.

775 **The Speaker:** Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

780 Will the Minister confirm whether the Isle of Man will be indemnified for any cost of accidents and third-party claims and such like; and what is the situation regarding compensation for the disruption and the lost income in our fishing, transport and other marine activity during the cable laying and the decommissioning and during the use of the cable?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

785 **The Minister:** I find myself, Mr Speaker, for the second week, making it clear that there are technical questions that are being asked by the Hon. Member which would be much more easily responded to if the Hon. Member or others did me the courtesy of letting me know in advance the areas they are concerned about.

I am very happy to be as open as possible. I have a telephone; I have an office, of which the door is open. I will come back to the points that have been raised, in writing.

COMMUNITY, CULTURE AND LEISURE

Bus services

Boxing Day

1.11. The Hon. Member for Douglas North (Mr Houghton) to ask the Minister for Community, Culture and Leisure:

790 *Whether his Department will operate a bus service on Boxing Day?*

The Speaker: Question 11. Hon. Member for Douglas North, Mr Houghton.

795 **Mr Houghton:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name, sir.

The Speaker: I call on the Minister for Community, Culture and Leisure, the Hon. Member for Peel, Mr Crookall.

800 **The Minister for Community, Culture and Leisure (Mr Crookall):** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

As the Hon. Member will already be aware, we did not operate buses on Boxing Day last year. The timetable published in April this year contains a note on page 8 that there will, again, be no services on Boxing Day. This decision was made after confirming that major retailers are again
805 planning to be closed on this day. With little shopping traffic and a premium paid for drivers, the Department concluded that the limited demand did not justify the cost of providing a service.

As a snapshot, the bus network continues to do well, with passenger figures currently around 10% higher than the previous network, despite having 12 buses and drivers less. With the budget cuts, we have decided to make difficult choices, and this is one we have made.
810

The Speaker: Mr Houghton.

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

In view of the fact that the Hon. Member answering the Question now is the new Minister of
815 the Department, can he confirm whether he has reviewed the Department's decision last year, and reviewed it with a view to providing a small skeleton service along just the major routes, allowing people to get about to visit their families on this Island during Boxing Day – not necessarily for shopping?

820 **The Speaker:** Mr Crookall.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Yes, I can confirm I have reviewed the situation for Boxing Day, I appreciate that some people
825 will be put out by this, with visiting the likes of the Hospital – I do appreciate where the Member is coming from – but at the expense, sir, I am not prepared to go to.

POST OFFICE

Post Office Management pay deal

1.12. The Hon. Member for Douglas North (Mr Houghton) to ask the Chairman of the Post Office:

What the recent pay deal with the Post Office management is; and how it correlates with overtime claims and severance payments during this fiscal year?

830 **The Speaker:** Question 12. Hon. Member for Douglas North, Mr Houghton.

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name, sir.

835 **The Speaker:** I call on the Chairman of the Post Office, the Hon. Member for Douglas West, Mr Corkish.

The Chairman of the Post Office (Mr Corkish): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I am pleased to be able to advise this House that management graded staff within the Isle of Man Post Office recently agreed a 3.5% pay increase effective from 1st April 2011, which is in
840 line with that paid to other workers employed there. This award has been agreed after lengthy negotiations with the representative body and is, I believe, fully compliant with the Government freeze on public sector pay budgets.

The award is fully funded in this financial year through, amongst other things, the payroll savings achieved by one managerial post being made redundant and the abolition of overtime
845 payments to managerial grades. I am not sure how the Hon. Member defines a severance payment in the context of this Question, but I confirm, as previously stated, that one managerial post has been made redundant. The employee has left the business following a voluntary selection process

and has received a payment in line with statutory redundancy terms. No other severance payments have been made, sir.

850

The Speaker: Mr Houghton.

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

855

Can the Chairman of the Post Office clarify exactly what fiscal meaning he has to the fact that there has been a redundancy; and what application of the salary of the person made redundant has to the pay deal?

The Speaker: The Chairman to reply.

860

Mr Corkish: The payment of... is all... Sorry.

The Hon. Member is asking why... Sorry, can the Hon. Member repeat that question?

The Speaker: Mr Houghton, will you repeat the supplementary question.

865

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Just to repeat the essence of it, which is actually set out in the main form of the Question: how does the pay deal correlate with a redundancy, sir?

870

Mr Watterson: No increase in staff budgets.

The Speaker: Mr Corkish.

875

Mr Corkish: Mr Speaker, the agreement with the Post Office and Government was that a pay deal could be brokered, but there was no new money. Therefore, between us, the Post Office and the unions and the workers were able to reach an agreement funded from within through voluntary redundancy and agreed by it at certain costs which will help protect the long-term future of the company and service levels in a commercially competitive world, for the benefit of staff. Surely, that is a good and honourable goal for the company: short-term pain for some long-term gain for all concerned, sir.

880

The Speaker: Mr Singer.

885

Mr Singer: Could I ask the Chairman, is he therefore saying that if there had not been this redundancy, there would have been a 0% pay rise for management?

The Speaker: Chairman.

890

Mr Corkish: The instruction from Government was quite clear, Mr Speaker: there was no money to fund increases in wages.

Mr Singer: So the answer is yes.

The Speaker: Mr Houghton.

895

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

In relation to the circumstances of the pay deal, how can the Chairman propose to deal with overtime work, when no claims will be allowed – or time off in lieu, when no claims are allowed – when mail has to be delivered on time?

900

What is the difference in the pay deal and the operation policy of the Post Office, now that both of those have been taken away, sir?

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

905

Mr Corkish: Mr Speaker, the payment of overtime is restricted to front-line operational managers and technical managers required to work outside normal business hours. This arrangement has ceased with this agreement on pay. All managers are now expected to manage their own workload and recover additional time during quieter periods. It is all part of a cash-saving strategy to fund an increase in basic pay.

910 **The Speaker:** Mr Houghton.

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
Again, in relation to the pay deal, does he have a documented system controlling unscheduled leave, and if so, can he explain that system?

915 **The Speaker:** Chairman.

Mr Corkish: Mr Speaker, there will be a system. I cannot explain it. That is something that is an internal management problem, which I am sure is in place in the Post Office.

920 **The Speaker:** Mr Houghton.

Mr Houghton: Mr Speaker, this is a legitimate parliamentary question to the Chairman of the Post Office, to answer the questions as set out of this pay deal. If the pay deal is in the public domain, why can he not answer that question?

925 Mr Speaker, I would invite, once again, the Chairman of the Post Office to answer my question.

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

930 **Mr Corkish:** Mr Speaker, it is certainly in our interests and those of the company that such concerns are addressed fully. I cannot do that here, but I will take them away and revert to the Hon. Member at the earliest.

935 **The Speaker:** Hon. Member for Douglas East.

Mrs Cannell: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
Can I ask the Chairman of the Post Office that when he does so he circulates that information to *all* Members of this House, in the interests of openness and transparency.

940 **The Speaker:** Chairman.

Mr Corkish: My pleasure, Mr Speaker.

945 **The Speaker:** Mr Houghton.

Mr Houghton: Thank you, Mr Speaker.
My final supplementary question to the Chairman of the Post Office, Mr Speaker.
Can he assure this Hon. House that there are no inconsistencies of the management of various sections of his mail division, which is currently causing low morale; and, if he can assure this Hon. House, can he go back to the Post Office in the mail section and assure those people there who are most important?

The Speaker: Chairman to reply.

955 **Mr Corkish:** I can agree with the Hon. Member that the workforce is most important. I have no knowledge of low morale, but I shall certainly ask questions when I get back to the Post Office, and can I say again, as I have to the Hon. Member, if he has individual questions – and I am sure this has arisen from within – should such persons wish to explore the problems that they perceive, and perhaps the Hon. Member perceives, I am quite happy to explore those with the Member in private.

960

ENVIRONMENT, FOOD AND AGRICULTURE

**Fatstock Marketing Association
Directors' details and objectives**

1.13. The Hon. Member for Michael (Mr Cannan) to ask the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture:

(a) Who the newly appointed executive directors of the Isle of Man Fatstock Marketing Association are;

(b) what their objectives are; and

(c) what timescales have been implemented in respect of their objectives?

965

The Speaker: Question 13. Hon. Member for Michael.

Mr Cannan: Mr Speaker, I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name.

970

The Speaker: I call on the Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture, the Hon. Member for Rushen, Mr Gawne.

The Minister for Environment, Food and Agriculture (Mr Gawne): Gura mie eu, Loayreyder.

975

Firstly, it is important to clarify that the Isle of Man Fatstock Marketing Association is a private company owned by farmers. As such, questions regarding its governance and strategy should, in the first instance, be addressed to the company direct.

980

Nevertheless, I can advise that the former directors of the FMA have resigned. The outgoing directors appointed two replacement and subsequently they invited a further three individuals to join them on the board. The full board was established on 14th November and now consists of Graham Crowe as Chairman, Allan Skillicorn, Geoff Taggart, Pentti Christian and Shaun Dean.

In regard to their objectives, it is not for Government to dictate what these should be or establish any timescales. The new directors have been in position for a relatively brief period, but in a press release issued on 30th November the company stated:

985

'Time is very much of the essence and a transparent strategy to provide a cost-effective service to producers and consumers has to be formulated in order to stem the haemorrhage of cash from the company and quality livestock from the Island. Several options will initially be investigated to mitigate the present losses and improve the trading position, but if no viable plan comes to fruition the recommendation of the previous board of directors to wind up the company may have to be instigated. It therefore remains a possibility that the agricultural directorate's previously announced new co-proposal may have to be revisited and backed by a structured business plan.'

990

FMA Chairman, Graham Crowe, has subsequently stated on Manx Radio that the directors are assessing the financial situation of the company and intend to call an early AGM, at which point they would hope to be able to present proposals for either taking the business forward or for winding it up. Whereas the directors recognise the urgency of the situation, no timescale has been established.

995

Gura mie eu.

1000

Mr Cannan: Supplementary.

Can I just clarify, there: is the Minister saying to us that, despite the fact that the FMA and the Meat Plant has received numerous subsidies and support from Government – i.e. from the taxpayer – it is of no interest, from the Department's perspective, what the objectives are of the new directors and what their timescales are, given that this actually is a matter of national importance?

1005

The Speaker: Mr Gawne, Minister.

1010

The Minister: I must be in a different room, because certainly, that is not what I said.

Mr Singer and Mr Cannan: It is!

The Minister: Clearly, I am very interested in what is going on, but it is not a matter for me to set the strategies and the timescales and the policies for a private company. Clearly, if that

1015 company wishes to have Government support, then I will be very interested in setting priorities and timescales, and I will make it absolutely clear what those are. But at the moment, the FMA directors are not coming to me asking for public money.

Yes, I am interested. Yes, I have assisted in many, many ways. We have facilitated meetings so that we can get new directors on. We have done all manner of things. I have met the board on 1020 three occasions already. I am meeting them again next week, so very, very interested in what is going on, but it is not for me to tell them how to run their private company. If I start telling private companies how to run their affairs, I would imagine there would be more Questions asked in this House.

1025 **The Speaker:** Mr Cannan. (*Interjections*)

Mr Cannan: Supplementary. Thank you very much, Mr Speaker.

Can I ask the Minister, has the FMA received public funds at any point in the last two years; and are they likely to receive public funds at any point in the next two years?

1030

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: Well, I know the Hon. Member knows that, because we have provided him with that information via the Tynwald Library. So, yes, indeed, money has been provided to the FMA. 1035 Money is often provided to private companies and it is provided on certain conditions. Those conditions, as far as I am aware, have been met. So I do not really understand what the issue is that the Hon. Member is getting to.

I would point out, however, that I have asked the Hon. Member on a previous occasion to come and meet with me in the Department, so I can fully explain what we are doing. If he is really 1040 that interested, I would very strongly urge him to come along, talk to us, because we have got a lot of good ideas that we are working with, with the FMA, but as I said, it is not for me... Perhaps it is just the way he worded his Question, but it is not for me to tell this Hon. House what the objectives and timescales of the FMA are; that is their role. If it was my role, then we may as well just give up on the FMA and just say, 'Let's take it over' – actually, it is something remarkably 1045 similar to what was suggested by the former Agriculture Minister.

I think we just need to have a little bit of a reality check here. When you have got a board of directors of a company, it is for them to set the policy for that company.

1050 **Mr Cannan:** Supplementary.

The Speaker: Mr Cannan.

Mr Cannan: Sir, Mr Speaker, I think the reality check will come when the taxpayer is asked to bail out the FMA yet again.

1055 I do have the smallest pang of sympathy with the Minister, in that he is dealing with somewhat of an ongoing problem; but will he agree that it is imperative that we retain the facility to slaughter our own meat and, despite the economic conditions, that we must take whatever steps are necessary to get this matter resolved, in terms of the failings at the Meat Plant?

1060 Will he therefore ask... and indeed set relative timescales and objectives to achieve this, even though, as I have said, we are suffering tough economic conditions? It is important and imperative, I am sure he will agree, that the Meat Plant is retained.

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

1065 **The Minister:** The Hon. Member for Michael seems to be quoting from my various speeches on the topic over many, many years. Please do not warm me up to the topic of agriculture –

A Member: Hear hear! (*Interjections*)

1070 **The Minister:** – because I have already been warned by the Speaker (*Interjection by the Speaker*) for getting too passionate about the topic!

I do agree, it is really important. Yes, of course we are doing everything we can. I am not going to dictate to the company how it should run its affairs, but it is absolutely essential, in my view, that we have a facility on the Isle of Man to process our own meat. I think what has amply 1075 been demonstrated, over the last two or three weeks, is that we cannot rely on our lifeline link to

bring food into the Isle of Man. We need to be absolutely able to produce our own food on the Isle of Man. Without a Meat Plant, that would be all but impossible.

1080 **The Speaker:** Mrs Cannell.

Mrs Cannell: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1085 Would the Minister agree with me that, whilst the Department recognises that it is a private company and cannot dictate and while the Department cannot dictate to this organisation, it would be true to say, would the Minister agree, that the Department is *encouraging* this organisation?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

The Minister: Gura mie eu, Loayreyder.

1090 Yes, I can certainly agree with that. Perhaps again, the way in which the Question has been asked and the way in which I have answered, implies that I am not interested, but nothing could be further from the truth. I have regular meetings, as I say, with the FMA directors. I have worked... I have done very little else, I have to say, but try to come up with solutions to work with the FMA directors to find long-term solutions to sort out this particular problem. It is absolutely vital for Manx agriculture that we get a long-term strategy to allow us to have the Meat Plant for the rest of
1095 this century at the very least.

The Speaker: Mr Cannan.

Mr Cannan: Supplementary.

1100 Given the Minister's answers, and thorough answers, over the last five minutes or so, could he therefore confirm that he will seek timescales and objectives from the FMA?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

1105 **The Minister:** Gura mie eu, Loayreyder.

Perhaps the first timescale is in relation to additional support. Clearly, the Meat Plant is in vast... in deep problems, perhaps is the best way to put it. It will need further support and the timescale is that, if they do not receive support in the next three or four months, then it is likely that the company will have to be wound up.

1110 So the timescale which we are working to at the moment with the FMA is that we need to get an application in for the Agricultural Development Fund, which was approved by Tynwald specifically for the purpose, so any suggestion that, in some way, we are propping up a failing company and we did not know anything about it is nonsense. This is something that we have known about. We knew that we needed this money for this particular purpose, so we need to get
1115 that application in to Treasury, and the sooner we can get that in, the better.

Standing Order 3.5.1(2) suspended to allow continuation of Question Time

The Speaker: Mr Henderson.

Mr Henderson: Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.

1120 Ta mee shirrey kied yn eysht y chur ta fo my ennym. I beg to ask the Question in my name.

The Speaker: Well, sir, we have reached the end of our allotted time for Questions.

Mr Henderson: I beg your pardon, Vainstyr Loayreyder.

1125 I beg to move the relevant Standing Order to allow for the putting of the remaining Questions on the Order Paper.

Mr Houghton: I beg to second, sir.

1130 **The Speaker:** The motion is that Standing Orders be suspended to allow the remaining Oral Questions to be taken.

Those in favour, say aye; against, no. The ayes have it.

A division was called for and electronic voting resulted as follows:

FOR	AGAINST
Mr Quirk	Mr Bell
Mr Hall	Mr Teare
Mr Karran	Mr Watterson
Mr Ronan	
Mr Crookall	
Mr Anderson	
Mr Singer	
Mr Quayle	
Mr Cannan	
Mr Cregeen	
Mr Houghton	
Mr Henderson	
Mrs Beecroft	
Mrs Cannell	
Mr Robertshaw	
Mr Shimmin	
Mr Corkish	
Mr Cretney	
Mr Skelly	
Mr Gawne	
The Speaker	

The Speaker: With 21 votes for, 3 votes against, the motion therefore carries.

HEALTH

Care Quality Commission Department of Health participation

1.14. The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Health:

1135 *What progress his Department has made in re-establishing contact with the Care Quality Commission; and what progress the Department has made in investigating the extent to which the Isle of Man can become part of the Care Quality Commission's system of monitoring care?*

The Speaker: I call on the Hon. Member for Douglas South, Mrs Beecroft.

1140 **Mrs Beecroft:** I beg to ask the Question standing in my name.

The Speaker: I call the Minister for Health, the Hon. Member for Glenfaba, Mr Anderson.

The Minister for Health (Mr Anderson): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1145 As the Hon. Member may be aware, the former DHSS utilised the services of the then Healthcare Commission to undertake an inspection of various aspects of Noble's Hospital, which resulted in a report that was published in 2006. At that time, such arrangements were able to be satisfactorily entered into, notwithstanding that the constitution of the Healthcare Commission was, strictly speaking... *[Technical interruption]* ...United Kingdom NHS facilities. It was the intention of the DHSS that, into the future, the Healthcare Commission would be considered for
1150 further work in the Isle of Man.

The Healthcare Commission was merged with those other inspectorates that had been responsible for Social Care facilities and for Mental Health to create the Care Quality Commission (CQC), which began operating on 1st April 2009. The Department has been in contact with the CQC since its inception, to inquire as to the willingness and availability of the CQC in the event
1155 that the Department may wish to engage them to undertake work.

On more than one occasion, the CQC has made it clear that their deployment in the Isle of Man is unlikely. The reasons that they have given were: that they are too busy continuing to respond to structural changes resulting from their relatively recent creation; that they were already over-committed to work within the English NHS to take on further offshore work tasks; and, in any

1160 event, notwithstanding their earlier agreement reached with the Healthcare Commission, the CQC
now felt they were not mandated to work beyond their own jurisdiction.

The Department will, when it wishes to engage external review of services, look for
appropriate agencies to undertake this work, which may well include the CQC. However, Mr
Speaker, it should not be considered that healthcare services provided by the Department are
1165 therefore unmonitored. Considerable effort goes into maintenance of clinical governance and other
standards. For example, internally, we have put in place a number of measures, which ensure that
we are continually monitoring our services. These include incident reporting systems which
highlight untoward and unexpected incidents in care provision; clinical audits; patient safety
‘walks’ undertaken by senior clinicians and patient and public representatives; observations of
1170 care, high-level service and care reviews when things go wrong. Our senior clinicians – including
the Medical Director, Director of Nursing and Midwifery and the Director of Community Nursing
– work in clinical practice on a regular basis and monitor the standards of care given. We also
have observations of care and audits undertaken by patient and public representatives. All these
matters are regularly reported to the Department.

1175 As well as this, within the Health Service there are a number of external and regulatory audits
of validation of services that take place to ensure that we meet professional requirements and
educational standards. These include the validation of pre-registration, post-registration and
specialist public health nurse training by the Nursing and Midwifery Council UK, who are
responsible for regulating all nurses in the Isle of Man, and the regulation of GP and junior doctor
1180 training by the Mersey deanery on behalf of the General Medical Council.

In addition to this, we have an obligation to ensure that we meet certain statutory requirements
for continuous supervision for certain practitioners. For example, the midwifery profession: for
our midwives who practise here on the Isle of Man, within the Nursing and Midwifery Council’s
standing orders they must have the overall supervision from a local supervising authority. We
1185 commission this from the Northwest. This consists of not only supervision advice and support but
also an annual midwifery audit of care and service delivery programmes of education for our
midwives. The clinical practice visits of NHS dentists is undertaken under contract by the UK
NHS Dental Reference Service and GP practice visits are performed as part of the equality
outcomes framework element of their contract.

1190 We also periodically request external inspections and reviews of services from the Royal
Colleges and ask for their expertise and advice. Many of the services that we work in shared
partnership with tertiary centres on, such as our responsibility with Alder Hey for cystic fibrosis,
are audited and monitored along with our tertiary centres at the time of their audits. In these
circumstances we receive an external report on the quality of our services.

1195 Mr Speaker, I apologise for the length of this Answer but wanted to provide a full picture to
show monitoring within the Health Service is a constant.

The Speaker: Supplementary question, Mrs Beecroft.

1200 **Mrs Beecroft:** Thank you, Mr Speaker and I thank the Minister for his comprehensive reply. I
am glad to hear that there is constant monitoring, but it is not the same as an external audit.

1205 Would the Minister agree with me that, in April 2011 – I quote from *Hansard* – when he said
there was a complication that CQC has no legislative power to act outside the UK, but we do not
believe that this should be a barrier to achieving an arrangement, which will accord the same level
of scrutiny and assurance for our services as is accorded to the English health service...? Surely
that means that, without this independent scrutiny, we do not have the same assurance as the
English health services?

1210 Would the Minister not agree that there are other places within the UK that we could be
looking to and getting this service from, if the English health service is too busy?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

1215 **The Minister:** Mr Speaker, as I indicated in my formal Answer, the Care Quality Commission
has indicated to us it would be difficult for them to provide the service we require. Indeed, we will
do exactly what the questioner asks, that we will continue to look at other areas that can provide
this service when relevant.

The Speaker: Mrs Beecroft, a further supplementary.

1220 **Mrs Beecroft:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Would the Minister circulate when he does contact these other areas and inform us of their responses? Does the Minister not agree with me that it is vitally important that medical treatment and care is of the highest standard possible? (**A Member:** Hear, hear.)

1225 Does he not also agree that emphasis should be given to areas found to be failing and in particular, because we do not have an independent audit, that any areas of concern raised by the independent review body should be treated urgently and acted on? Does he not further agree that in one of their reports issued in June 2010 they found that the basic needs of an elderly patient had been neglected and they found evidence of systemic failure and in fact, recommended an external audit?

1230 Does the Minister not agree that these findings should ring alarm bells and a way of having an external audit conducted should be a matter of priority?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

1235 **The Minister:** I agree with much of what the Hon. Member says, Mr Speaker. However, we will continue to use the co-ordinating systems we have and follow those up. However, I will circulate when we do contact the relevant organisations in the UK outside the CQC to see if they are willing to take part in an audit.

1240 A regular audit, as I put in my original Answer, is something that does take place. An external audit does take place from other agencies and I have already quoted statutory obligations that we have and educational qualifications that need to be looked into, and I quoted various organisations that did that. We will continue to monitor the situation and when we have people actually commissioned to take part in providing audit for the Department, those details will be provided to the Hon. Member.

1245

The Speaker: Mrs Cannell.

Mrs Cannell: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1250 Can I agree with the Minister that, yes, there is a statutory obligation to ensure that expertise is maintained across the workforce within the health services, but can he explain to the House what he means when he says, when he is rebutting the idea of external audit of the whole health scene in the Isle of Man, not just targeted areas of expertise that he has to comply with, but the service as a whole... what he means when he says that we will 'contact' or make contact, or try to secure the relevant external audit 'when relevant'. What does he mean: 'when relevant'? Is it when something serious happens and then they will call in somebody to try and protect the health service?

1255

1260 Would he agree with me further that, in fact, to have an external audit of the whole of the health service, as the delivery of the whole of the health service is a very good and healthy thing and gives – apart from reassurance to the patient and to the people of the Isle of Man – also focuses the mind of the hospital management, in terms of rectifying the shortfalls that are highlighted by such an external audit?

The Speaker: Reply, sir.

1265 **The Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I would agree with much of what the Hon. Member says. The audit in 2006 was clearly an in-depth audit, which flagged up many areas that needed relevant follow up and that has been done in many areas.

1270 In relation to my rebutting of not having an overall audit, I think it is important that we investigate the areas that need investigating and the ones that are causing concern and our focus in the future will be on that.

The Speaker: Mrs Beecroft.

1275 **Mrs Beecroft:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Would the Minister not agree with me that the independent review body recommended an external audit and that the very minimum was an internal audit of a certain area, and that his Department chose to take the minimum requirement?

1280 Would he further give assurance that he will treat this matter of obtaining the services of a body for the external audit as a matter of priority and keep Members of this House fully informed?

The Speaker: Minister.

The Minister: Mr Speaker, I have nothing to add to my further comments.

**Sexual Health Strategy
Young people**

1.15. The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Health:

1285 *What his Department's Sexual Health Strategy is to reduce infection rates of HIV and AIDS with particular reference to younger people?*

The Speaker: We turn to Question 15. Hon. Member for Douglas South, Mrs Beecroft.

1290 **Mrs Beecroft:** I beg to ask the Question standing in my name.

The Speaker: Minister for Health to reply.

1295 **The Minister for Health (Mr Anderson):** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

The Sexual Health Strategy is currently being reviewed and a revised or updated version is expected in the first half of 2012.

1300 Although not directly under the Sexual Health Strategy, the Public Health Directorate has set up several work streams to address the area of sexual health of young people. The approach that Public Health has adopted is based on scientific evidence and that is that it is more cost-effective to address the area of sexual health in general and provide HIV/AIDS prevention programmes as part of such initiatives, rather than target HIV on its own. I would like to mention some of those work streams.

1305 The Department works closely with the Department of Education and Children to ensure that awareness of sexual health issues is raised in schools. Human *papillomavirus* (HPV) vaccine: the Department has been running the HPV vaccine programme for the past two years. HPV is a sexually transmitted virus. As part of that HPV vaccine programme, there is an awareness raising of sexual health issues, aimed at both boys and girls, although only girls receive the vaccine.

1310 The Director of Public Health has set up a multi-agency group on sexual health and alcohol. It is well known that alcohol is a key factor in leading to risk-taking sexual behaviour. This group has set up a programme including a series of focus groups with young people to identify issues for young people and, with their co-operation, identify how to tackle risk-taking behaviour. The Department welcomes young people to attend its genitourinary medicine (GUM) and family planning clinics, as well as GP practices and nurses, where they can speak to healthcare professionals on a personal basis regarding matters relating to their sexual and reproductive health.

1315 A campaign entitled 'It's up to me' is commencing in December to raise awareness of alcohol and sexual health issues during the festive period. The publicity material for the campaign was designed in conjunction with young people from secondary schools and the Isle of Man College, and I hope the Hon. Member will be reassured that the Department is alert to all aspects of sexual health of young people.

1320

The Speaker: Mrs Beecroft.

Mrs Beecroft: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1325 Does the Minister agree with me that, whilst we welcome the medical advances in this area, one of the sad side effects is that many of our young people actually believe that HIV and AIDS is a manageable condition now? What is he doing to dispel this myth?

The Speaker: Minister.

1330 **The Minister:** Mr Speaker, I believe it is an educational issue, and we should continue to deliver that as widely as we can.

The Speaker: Hon. Member for Onchan, Mr Karran.

1335 **Mr Karran:** Can the Shirveishagh also highlight the issue of the breakdown of the age and gender, as far as HIV infection on the Island? Has it changed much from the days when I was Member for Health, when it was actually predominantly in the over-50s female part of the community, as far as the HIV numbers on the Island?

1340 Would the Minister not agree, it is important that the issue is that prevention is better than cure and the issue of the actual cost factor of managing the infection, along with the detrimental health effects, as far as the young people are concerned, need to be highlighted much more progressively?

1345 **The Speaker:** Reply, sir.

The Minister: I would agree with the Hon. Minister that prevention is far better than cure and we must be quite proactive in this area. In relation to the age profile I am not detailed with those details, I am afraid.

1350 **The Speaker:** Mrs Cannell.

Mrs Cannell: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1355 Can I just seek some clarification from the Health Minister, bearing in mind that he was asked a similar Question in this place in the last legislative term. Would he agree with me that, yes, prevention is better than cure, and one way of preventing, other than education, is for the provision, or the availability, of free condoms... is one measure which can be helpful to young people in the prevention against any kind of disease, but particularly AIDS and HIV?

1360 Is he still, as Health Minister, of the same view that we should not issue free condoms to our young people and encourage them to be sensible, but rather they should be taught to abstain from sex altogether?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

1365 **The Minister:** The Hon. Member's interpretation of my position in this is incorrect –

Mrs Cannell: It is in *Hansard*.

1370 **The Minister:** – is incorrect... is incorrect, Mr Speaker. I would ask the Hon. Member to go back and read *Hansard* again.

Mrs Cannell: I did.

The Speaker: Mrs Beecroft.

1375 **Mrs Beecroft:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Would the Minister agree with me that, given the estimated costs of caring for a person with HIV is £12,000 to £15,000 per annum, the cost of supplying free condoms can be seen as a cost-effective way of reducing costs to the Health Service?

1380 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: Mr Speaker, I am not privy to those costs.

The Speaker: Mrs Beecroft.

1385 **Mrs Beecroft:** I think you should be, because you actually put them in *Hansard* the last time it was questioned.

HOME AFFAIRS

**Sarah's Law
Working party progress**

1.16. The Hon. Member for Douglas North (Mr Henderson) to ask the Minister for Home Affairs:

1390 *Whether the joint working party looking at the possible introduction of Sarah's Law will report before Christmas; and whether this group has received all relevant information?*

The Speaker: We turn to Question 16. Hon. Member for Douglas North, Mr Henderson.

1395 **Mr Henderson:** Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.
Ta mee shirrey kied yn eysht y chur ta fo my ennym. I beg to ask the Question in my name.

The Speaker: I call the Minister for Home Affairs, the Hon. Member for Rushen.

1400 **The Minister for Home Affairs (Mr Watterson):** The answer to both parts of the Question is yes.

The Speaker: Mr Henderson.

1405 **Mr Henderson:** I am very pleased to hear that from the Minister, and when can we hear from him in a more wholesome and full response?

The Minister: Next year.

The Speaker: Mr Henderson.

1410 **Mr Henderson:** I thank the Minister for his light-hearted look at something very serious, but in his view, in denigrating this, can he give us something a bit more specific and a little more professional in his answer?

1415 **The Speaker:** Mr Watterson, Minister.

The Minister: Mr Speaker, I have been asked questions and I have given the Hon. Members straight answers to straight questions.

1420 I have not in any way tried to obfuscate this. I thought that simplicity is the best. As the Hon. Member knows from his Question that he asked both here and in another place, this is something that is due to report to me by Christmas and the report I will be considering in the New Year.

SOCIAL CARE

**Residential homes
Staff absence**

1.17. The Hon. Member for Douglas North (Mr Henderson) to ask the Minister for Social Care:

1425 *How many staff are: (a) off sick; (b) off long-term sick; (c) off sick who have previously been off sick in the preceding 12 months; (d) suspended; (e) suspended for over one month; and of those suspended, how many are on (i) full pay and (ii) reduced pay at Glenside, Reayrt ny Baie and Cummal Moorar residential homes?*

The Speaker: Question 17, Hon. Member for Douglas North, Mr Henderson.

1430 **Mr Henderson:** Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.
Ta mee shirrey kied yn eysht y chur ta fo my ennym.

The Speaker: The Minister for Social Care, the Hon. Member for Douglas East, Mr Robertshaw.

The Minister for Social Care (Mr Robertshaw): Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1435 The Hon. Member wrote to me a couple of weeks ago to raise his concerns about the matters covered by this and the next two Questions, numbers 18 and 19. I have in the intervening period since receiving his letter spent time familiarising myself with the three centres concerned. I have met with staff and managers in each centre on site and of course, I know a number of the residents in Reayrt ny Baie anyway, having had reason to visit the home a number of times recently, being, 1440 as it is, in my constituency.

I have also, at my instigation, had a constructive meeting with Mr Steve Salter, who is the representative for Unite, the union, in order to get his take on the matter. I have also read this year's independent inspection reports for each of the three units, which I am pleased to say all produced positive outcomes. I think it is very important at this stage to say that each centre has 1445 many excellent, hard-working members of staff and I wish to thank them sincerely for their continued dedication and loyalty. I do not pay mere lip service here, I really mean it and that applies both to staff and managers. Care home work is different, but not that far removed from, hotel work and I have therefore found it easy to empathise with the managers and staff. This has helped me to establish an understanding of the issues.

1450 I will answer the Hon. Member's specific detailed Question in a moment, but I would advise him that, whilst generally satisfied with what I found, I was also conscious of two concerns. Specifically, the level of uncertainty manifest among some members of staff about the future and worries about the impact of higher levels of sickness being experienced just at the moment. This is higher than would normally be expected.

1455 Turning, first, to the issue of uncertainty about future plans which, as I have said, is on the minds of a number of staff, and something which may be a factor in the current high level of absence: my Department will be making important changes to our older people's residential services, not least the opening of the new Ramsey EMI centre and the Surby Unit in Southlands.

1460 We are planning these changes now, and I will make a public statement in the New Year, which I hope will give everyone more certainty, not least the staff and residents. I hope this will help staff to do what they most wish to do: focusing on the key task of continuing to give good quality care.

With regard to the level of sickness, I have to be honest and say that, coming from the private sector, the amount of sick time available in the public sector in any one year has come as something of a shock to me. The degree to which it is applicable here is obviously of concern, and the impact it is having upon both staff and residents has demanded further consideration. The situation is exacerbated by both the fact that four staff are currently suspended – that is, two at Glenside and two at Reayrt ny Baie – whilst investigations are completed, as well as absence due to genuine medical issues, including at least six staff needing hospital treatment.

1470 In response to this, there are now contingency plans in place to ensure additional staff can be deployed, if needed, over the coming months. As a consequence, I am satisfied that the management have ensured there are sufficient staff on duty to maintain their safety, as well as the required quality of care, for residents for all three centres.

1475 I shall, nonetheless, continue to follow the matters in a more general sense, specifically becoming more conversant, both with the levels of sick pay available and the impact on an operation that applying lengthy suspensions incurs.

1480 Turning now to the specific question laid out in Question 17 on our Paper: part (a), on 29th November 2011 there were 21 staff members off sick across the three centres; part (b), 12 of the staff could be termed long-term sick, in that they had been off for more than four weeks; part (c), of the 21 staff off sick on 29th November 2011, 19 had been off sick at some point in the preceding 12 months. Regarding parts (d) and (e), four staff are suspended, three of whom appear in the statistics above. All four have been on suspension for a month, all four are suspended on full pay and there are no staff on reduced pay: this out of a total staff team of 148 people employed across the three centres in question.

1485

The Speaker: Mr Henderson.

Mr Henderson: Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.

1490 So here, if the Minister would agree with me, we have the shocking results that somewhere in the region of 20% of his total workforce are not at work. Further, with one or two supplementaries,

would he agree with me that my Questions are not directed at the hard-working and loyal staff; my Questions are directed at the management of the situation – if he could agree with that?

1495 Would he further agree that this care of the elderly is so specialised that in no way can it be downgraded to liken it to hotel work, that in fact he would agree that looking after confused elderly patients is a highly specialised and very difficult duty to perform in any circumstances, providing a level of expertise not found anywhere else? Further, what is he going to do to ensure his managers are enforcing properly the sickness policies and procedures that are relevant within his Department, and Government in general, to try and bring this terrible figure down?

1500 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1505 Taking the last part of his question first, with regard to sick pay issues, yes, I have got that under close focus now. I would be happy to come back later on that subject.

I am sorry that the Hon. Member feels that my comparison between hotel work and care home work was inappropriate. I merely mentioned that fact simply to highlight to him – I thought – that I was extremely sensitive to morale issues, which I know he is. That was all that was intended there – nothing more.

1510 As regards the level of absence, yes, it is high. It is a culmination of issues, which I tried to point out at the beginning of my Answer and relates, to some degree, I believe, to uncertainty. I am very mindful of the fact that it is incumbent upon me, as soon as I possibly can, to eradicate that uncertainty. I hope that that, along with the action that the managers are taking in trying to improve the situation and having success in doing so, will assuage his fears.

1515 **The Speaker:** Mr Henderson.

Mr Henderson: Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.

1520 Would the Minister agree, though, that in fact it is the management strategies of his Department that are causing, or having an impact on, these extremely high absentee levels, not only because of the uncertainty – which I am pleased the Minister has outlined and tried to put some certainty towards this morning, because that is a bubbling issue that will come to him in a larger format in the New Year, anyway – but would he agree that the staff-capping mechanism that is being rigidly operated at the minute is being determined by certain managers lower down the scale to mean that they can legitimately operate some of the care homes, whereby there may only be one care worker on a floor or ward at a care home for long periods of time, and that some managers are finding that this dangerous practice is actually acceptable? Is he aware that managers are actually telling concerned staff who are bringing Health and Safety to the forefront, both for staff and patients... that they are being told, when they are trying to put forward a case, 'Tough, that's the way it is'? Would he like to look into that situation so that we can try and alleviate the pressures there, which are causing staff to give up and go off sick?

1530 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1535 Having visited each one of the units and spent a considerable amount of time with the managers and staff, I do not recognise the scenario that the Hon. Member for North Douglas paints. I really don't.

1540 I do accept, as I have indicated already, that the issue of uncertainty is not helping and I am sorry he is so disparaging about the managers, who are equally working hard, just as the staff are. I think the policies that have been in place over the years have worked well and I just think a culmination of factors just at the moment have, as it were, created the stress that the Hon. Member now recognises, but there are very active actions being taken to deal with these and I am confident that the matters will resolve themselves.

1545 **The Speaker:** Final supplementary, Mr Henderson.

Mr Henderson: Gura mie, Vainstyr Loayreyder.

1550 Will the Shirveishagh, in his not recognising what I am telling him... would he recognise, though, and take my honest word for it, that staff are contacting me, from various areas within his organisation; my union, Unite, are contacting me; and in fact, at the large union meeting that was held last week, the very concerns I am putting to him this morning were put to the regional

1555 industrial organiser there at that meeting, who has since written to at least one of the managers, pointing out those very concerns that were put to him at that meeting for him to forward on to, certainly one manager, if not more? Would he agree to look into those matters, because they are very real and they are concerning staff enough to voice them at a union meeting? Would he take that on board?

I take his points, Vainstyr Loayreyder, with regard to uncertainty – fine, that is one issue. I am raising Health and Safety issues here, if he would recognise that.

1560 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

1565 **The Minister:** Mr Speaker, I am sorry the Hon. Member did not quite understand my original outlined Answer. I am aware of the letter that he mentions there and I actually did myself take the decision to contact Unite and discuss it with them. That is already done and I am happy and satisfied with that meeting and matters will just continue to go forward in a sensible fashion.

Residential homes Impact of staff absence

1.18. The Hon. Member for Douglas North (Mr Henderson) to ask the Minister for Social Care:

1570 *What impact staff shortages in residential homes are having on
(a) resident/patient care;
(b) staff morale; and
(c) staff health and safety;
whether care levels have fallen below acceptable care levels; and what action he wishes to take?*

The Speaker: Question 18. Again, Mr Henderson.

1575 **Mr Henderson:** Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.
Ta mee shirrey kied yn eysht y chur ta fo my ennym.

The Speaker: Minister, Mr Robertshaw to reply.

1580 **The Minister for Social Care (Mr Robertshaw):** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1585 I believe my Department employs sufficient staff in the resource centres to provide a safe and good quality service. This is evident by general positive findings by the registration and inspection unit. Recently, the Department has been experiencing higher than normal levels of absenteeism. We have a range of measures in place to address this situation and they are being effected. Managers have ensured that sufficient staff are on shift, have provided hands-on care themselves, giving extra hours to staff on a voluntary basis, and use relief staff wherever possible.

1590 Regarding part (a) of the Question, I believe the impact on residents has, therefore, been minimal. Quality of care remains the paramount concern. Regarding part (b), my Department is always sensitive to the issue of staff morale. My team is only as good as its staff and, in the main, the Department's staff team is very good, conscientious and loyal. Absenteeism does have a detrimental effect on morale, but the Department is doing all it can to ensure sufficient staff are available and to manage absenteeism as effectively as it is able in consultation with the office of human resources and occupational health. The Department also participates in the staff wellbeing group.

1595 Regarding part (c), my Department takes the health and safety of our staff and residents very seriously. We provide all training and equipment necessary for staff to perform their jobs in a safe manner. We also recognise the need for adequate rest for staff and, even in difficult times, we have honoured all approved annual leave requests. Care standards have not fallen below acceptable levels. There has been one instance where the staffing levels on one night in one resource centre fell below normal levels due to the late notification of absence by a staff member. This was appropriately dealt with by a manager working late and starting early on their shift. My Department is also taking further measures to improve the situation. We have recently advertised several care posts and are in the process of filling these. We regularly advertise for relief staff.

1600

1605 Approval was recently given to use an agency to provide additional staffing resources, as needed. Our Department is also actively looking at creating a pooled relief team.

The Speaker: Mr Henderson.

1610 **Mr Henderson:** Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.

Will the Shirveishagh agree with me that if a homes inspection was undertaken now, the picture may well be very different? Will he take on board the points that I am putting to him this morning, that where he is indicating that staffing levels are providing adequate care, there are reports to him – certainly from the union meeting – that staffing levels are below what is required to provide a sufficient care level? They have made him aware of that.

1615 Is he aware that, in fact, there are still instances where a single member of staff has been left for periods of time by themselves to cope with a floor or ward of elderly folk, who require varying degrees of care, from residential through to full nursing care?

1620 As a further supplementary, Vainstyr Loayreyder, in his pursuance of trying to gain extra staff, which I appreciate, is his Department looking across to the Health Service, to examine ways of utilising any particular bank staff that may be on their books, or care workers, to negate the need for agency workers which I believe may be hired in from across the water?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

1625 **The Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

With regard to his first point about inspections and whether an inspection now would in some way produce a different result from a little bit earlier in the year, when the inspections took place, he is asking me for a judgement on that one. My answer to that is no, I do not. I have read the inspections very carefully. I have very, very recently been to each of the units and spoken to the managers and staff, and my honest impression is that, no, there would not be a significant change at all in those inspections.

1630 As regards staff level, I appreciate the fact that he now understands we are doing all we can to recover the difficulties that we were under, and I think that we are doing everything we possibly can to make sure that is achieved, including an agency across, as he mentioned.

1635 I hope that is a satisfactory answer; if not, no doubt we will hear more.

The Speaker: Mr Quirk.

1640 **Mr Quirk:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

Can I ask the Minister, regarding the absenteeism, is the Department using the facilities for the welfare of the staff that... There is, within Government, a welfare organisation to encourage that. Can I seek an assurance that all means are being used to do that?

1645 Regarding his Answer to part (c) on the Paper, staff Health and Safety, can the Minister assure me that the organisations within most Government Departments have a Health and Safety forum and that those issues are being addressed by staff and managers and then passed on to the higher managers for implementation?

1650 Would he not agree with me, too... I do have concerns with Mr Henderson, as well, and I am also a member of the Unite union, that the issues that have been brought to my... (**A Member:** Attention.) Yes... is that there are concerns about staff and the welfare of patients at night. Would he not agree with me, sir?

The Speaker: Minister.

1655 **The Minister:** I am happy to confirm, in both cases, that my Department is pursuing those two issues, but if the Hon. Member does have any specific concerns that he would like to bring to my attention, I would be more than happy to receive him and do my best to answer.

Thank you, Mr Speaker.

**Residential homes
Temporary staff cover**

1.19. The Hon. Member for Douglas North (Mr Henderson) to ask the Minister for Social Care:

1660 *What representations unions have made to him about dangerously low staffing levels at residential homes; and why managers are not employing temporary staff to cover any shortfall where his full time staff are operating in dangerous health and safety situations, or where residents are not receiving the care or nursing care that they should be receiving?*

The Speaker: Question 19, Hon. Member, Mr Henderson.

1665 **Mr Henderson:** Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.
Ta mee shirrey kied yn eysht y chur ta fo my ennym. I beg to ask the Question in my name.

The Speaker: Minister for Social Care to reply, please.

1670 **The Minister for Social Care (Mr Robertshaw):** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

At no time have my Department's resource centre experienced unacceptably low staffing levels or presented unacceptable Health and Safety issues. Resource centres are regularly inspected by the registration and inspection units, as I have said, and have been found to be satisfactory.

1675 Representatives of the unions regularly bring issues to the office of human resources and I am aware that, recently, the regional industrial officer for Unite attended a meeting with the resource centre manager and a human resource adviser when staffing issues, in particular, were raised. My understanding is that this was a very productive meeting and reassured the union that every effort is being made to address absenteeism and its consequences. As I have already said, I subsequently took it upon myself to meet with the union and, as I indicated earlier, this was also a most constructive and informative meeting and I am grateful to Mr Salter for his contribution.

1680 Residents in my Department's resource centres receive a good quality service and ensuring that quality continues to improve is our main priority. Care is not being compromised. I am satisfied that the measures being taken, as outlined, will alleviate current issues.

1685 **The Speaker:** Mr Henderson.

Mr Henderson: Gura mie eu, Vainstyr Loayreyder.

1690 Would the Shirveishagh agree to arrange an unannounced visit to the three care homes highlighted in my Question (**A Member:** When?) – an *unannounced* visit, and certainly one in the evening shift moving into the nightshift, which is predominantly where the complaints and concerns are that I am receiving and the union are still receiving?

1695 Will he take note, will he give us an agreement that he takes on board, that the concerns have been relayed to him this morning are serious, are real and are happening, and that perhaps, in order to progress a smoother management of care homes, in fact, he is getting a very brief resume from his managers of the actual facts?

1700 Would he further agree, when he states that managers are undertaking extra shifts themselves to try and cover, which bumps the staffing levels up to those required that, in fact, by virtue of the jobs managers are required to do – i.e. administration and management – that, in fact, they cannot be counted as a number on the floor of a ward, which again will leave it in a very low staffing ratio?

The Speaker: Minister to reply.

1705 **The Minister:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.

I think it is very commendable indeed that managers have been willing to step into the breach, as it were, in difficult circumstances and I commend them highly for that.

I cannot accept that I have had a brief briefing on the whole issue. I can only reassure the Hon. Member I have taken the matter extremely seriously and continue to do so, and will remain in that mode until I am absolutely satisfied that all is well.

1710 I am sorry again that I have not portrayed the necessary level of seriousness about this issue and how seriously I take it. I cannot seemingly say enough to reassure him of my interest and concern and that I do take it extremely seriously.

As far as the unannounced visit is concerned, I would need notice of that question, I think, and I would be happy to consider it further and circulate my answer at a later time, Mr Speaker.

EDUCATION AND CHILDREN

Park Road School Future plans for site

1.20. The Hon. Member for Douglas East (Mrs Cannell) to ask the Minister for Education and Children:

1715 *What plans the Department has for Park Road School and land once the school has been vacated?*

The Speaker: We turn to Question 20. Hon. Member for Douglas East, Mrs Cannell.

1720 **Mrs Cannell:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I beg leave to ask the Question standing in my name.

The Speaker: I call the Minister for Education and Children, the Hon. Member for Onchan, Mr Karran.

1725 **The Minister for Education and Children (Mr Karran):** Vainstyr Loayreyder, gura mie eu mooar shoh, Oltey. Thank you for the Question, Member.

1730 Following recent requests from the Treasury, my Department is currently gathering updated information on the Park Road site and building for further consideration by the Treasury and the Strategic Asset Management Unit. We understand that the Department of Social Care has developed proposals for the redevelopment of the site for residential use and the proposal will go ahead in three years' time.

1735 I am unable to report further at this time, but will be able to give a brief to this House further on the Department's proposals, once a strategy for the development of this prime site has been established.

The Speaker: Mrs Cannell.

1740 **Mrs Cannell:** Thank you, Mr Speaker.
I thank the Minister for being open and honest. Can I ask him, though, when Treasury is asking the Department to gather further information, what sort of information are they seeking? Is it the size, scale? What sort of information are they seeking?

1745 Can the Minister offer us any kind of information at all with regard to the intention to develop for residential by the social affairs department – whether that is going to be for sheltered housing, whether it is going to be for the elderly? Does he have any kind of inclination at all, bearing in mind it is not really a fair question to put to him because he is not Minister for Social Care, but clearly they are in discussion with each other. If he can offer some further information, it would be most appreciated.

1750 **The Speaker:** Minister.

1755 **The Minister:** Vainstyr Loayreyder, as further information, obviously Members need to realise that we actually own the whole of that site plus the public house there now. The situation is the Treasury are looking for suggestions and maybe if the Hon. Member has some ideas, as far as that site is concerned, then I am sure they will be very interested, as the constituency Member for that area.

1760 The Department has looked at other areas; the Treasury has considered other ideas. As you may remember, one raised many years ago... and complaining about the amount of Government offices and private sector rental conditions at the present time... That might be an option, as far as the site is concerned. It might be an idea to move other schools onto that site, at a primary level, but at the moment there is no firm commitment, as far as any proposals. Those proposals, at the

end of the day, Vainstyr Loayreyder, will have to go to the Treasury and the Strategic Asset Management side and, of course, to the Council of Ministers.

1765 I do hope the Hon. Member considers putting her input in. I think it is important. This is a particularly large strategic site, which needs to be used, because it will be a once-in-a-lifetime opportunity to develop that site. There are issues with the likes of Murray's Road, where it has no playground. There might be other issues as far as housing. They are competing requirements, the resource or the issue of, obviously, we could do with generating more employment opportunities... So I do hope the Hon. Member makes her representations to the Treasury and I hope that other Hon. Members consider that this is the whole of that site, including the Bowling Green Hotel. It is a wonderful site for something strategic. It needs to be on a long-term basis, as far as the future development of the site, once we have vacated the premises.

1775 **Mr Robertshaw:** Hear, hear.

The Speaker: Mr Cannan.

1780 **Mr Cannan:** A supplementary. Will the Minister assure the House that the relevant Order and the Educational Act will be published before any such development is undertaken?

The Speaker: Minister.

1785 **The Minister:** I am quite sure... I think there has already been notification, as far as that is concerned. There is a question by the Hon. Member about the interpretation of this piece of legislation and, hopefully, he will clarify that point with the Attorney General's department at a later date, but as far as I am aware, obviously we are under a legal requirement to proceed in a different manner than we did with Kirk Michael. I would like to thank the Hon. Member for his answer, for raising it with us...

1790 Gura mie eu.

The Speaker: Mr Quirk.

Mr Quirk: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1795 Could I ask the Minister, would he not agree with me one of the major issues that is going to be coming up is the Eastern Local Plan, which is emerging in 2012? That would be, would the Minister not agree with me, one of the issues where the community would get involved, as well as the Government?

1800 **The Speaker:** Minister.

The Minister: Vainstyr Loayreyder, I think, as far as the community getting involved, you are the representatives of the community and ultimately you know what your community wants.

1805 **The Speaker:** Mrs Cannell.

Mrs Cannell: Thank you, Mr Speaker.

1810 Bearing in mind that the Department owns the whole of the site, including the site where the public house is situated, is he aware, as a new Minister, that the tenancy... the tenants, the publicans who are currently operating that public house, have been told that their tenancy is to finish? Is the Minister aware of that?

Further, can he give us an idea of when the site or the school is likely to be vacated completely? Please, will he give us reassurances that it will not end up as a total eyesore of a site because Government cannot agree across the board what it wants to do with it?

1815 **The Speaker:** Minister to reply.

The Minister: As far as the tenancy, as far as the pub is concerned, I am unaware of that. It is not under my jurisdiction of Rheyenn Ynsee, the Department of Education.

1820 As far as the issue of the Bemahague site is concerned, obviously at the present time we are waiting to talk to the Treasury. The Treasury has got a strategic unit, as far as asset management is concerned. The issue is being debated and it will be vacated, at the present time, once the new school is open, but may I say that there are other issues and what I think is important is that it is a

1825 glorious opportunity for this Government of national unity to work together to make sure that we have got the site which is then going to be used for another hundred-and-odd years, so that it can actually be used to maximise its ability for the Island as a whole, and the constituency as well.

The Speaker: Hon. Members, that brings us to the end of Question Time.
There are seven Questions for Written Answer and those replies have been distributed.

Questions for Written Answer

TREASURY

Legal Aid Treasury spending

2.1. The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Hall) to ask the Minister for the Treasury:

1830 *How much his Department spent on Legal Aid in each year between 2000-01 and 2010-11 on:*
(a) *criminal cases, broken down by:*
(i) *advice;*
(ii) *general gaol delivery cases (and higher);*
(iii) *summary court cases; and*
(iv) *juvenile court cases; and*
1835 (b) *civil and family cases, broken down by:*
(i) *advice/help; and*
(ii) *representation?*

1840 **Answer:** This information is not available in the format/categorisation requested.
However, the following tables present an analysis of Legal Aid expenditure by Legal Aid type and they also provide an analysis of the cost of work undertaken under the various Legal Aid schemes over the period requested.

Table 1. Legal Aid Costs 2003-04 to 2010--11

Financial Year	10-11	09-10	08-09	07-08	06-07	05-06	04-05	03-04
	£	£	£	£	£	£	£	£
Criminal								
Legal Aid Costs	2,310,687	1,452,981	1,901,652	1,666,385	580,438	647,242	1,070,319	1,003,442
Green Form (Advice)	45,648	41,089	21,715	10,530	13,493	9,105	7,114	8,977
Police Duty Advocate	400,509	412,589	386,100	259,888	233,274	182,486	172,903	138,890
Court Duty Advocate	249,579	188,415	165,891	136,347	122,872	91,025	87,410	54,395
TOTAL (Criminal)	3,006,423	2,095,074	2,475,358	2,073,150	950,077	929,858	1,337,746	1,205,704
Civil								
Non Family								
Legal Aid Costs	344,746	153,836	166,948	76,763	83,928	98,989	128,403	141,080
Green Form (Advice)	43,798	36,331	17,930	9,174	15,615	15,149	13,783	14,726
<i>Sub-total (Non-family)</i>	<i>388,544</i>	<i>190,167</i>	<i>184,878</i>	<i>85,937</i>	<i>99,543</i>	<i>114,138</i>	<i>142,186</i>	<i>155,806</i>
Family								
Legal Aid Costs	795,676	330,503	344,840	259,656	285,336	243,720	226,958	225,854
Green Form (Advice)	142,588	96,048	40,879	34,991	38,754	38,053	31,206	40,730
Sub-total (family)	938,264	426,551	385,719	294,647	324,090	281,773	258,164	266,584
TOTAL (Civil)	1,326,808	616,718	570,597	380,584	423,633	395,911	400,350	422,390
GRAND TOTAL	4,333,231	2,711,792	3,045,955	2,453,734	1,373,710	1,325,769	1,738,096	1,628,094

NOTES

£600,737 of expenditure included in the grand total for 2010-11 is attributable to irrecoverable VAT. This follows a change to previous practices and accounting treatment upon instructions from Customs and Excise Division of the Treasury.

1845

No breakdown of data is available for the financial years 2000-01, 2001-02 and 2002-03 other than that which is contained within the published Government Accounts, as extracted in Table 2.

Table 2. Extract from Government Accounts

Financial Year	02-03	01-02	00-01
	£	£	£
Criminal Legal Aid	901,144	404,800	208,165
Duty Advocate Scheme	204,030	206,707	172,555
<i>Sub Total</i>	<i>1,105,174</i>	<i>611,507</i>	<i>380,720</i>
Civil Legal Aid	535,282	399,094	372,430
GRAND TOTAL	1,640,456	1,010,601	753,150

HEALTH

**NHS hospital food
Cost**

2.2. The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Hall) to ask the Minister for Health:

How much his Department spent on NHS hospital food in each of the last three years:

(a) in total; and

(b) per patient per meal?

1850

Answer: (a) Meeting patients' dietary needs is a complex and sophisticated multi-disciplinary process. Attention is paid to nutrition and hydration using clinical tools such as MUST (Malnutrition Universal Screening Tool).

1855

The Hospital Catering Services is a vital element that complements the frontline treatment of patients. It provides a daily service to wards and departments based within Noble's; provides a daily meal service to Adult Mental Health, the Island-wide Meals on Wheels service and a busy staff restaurant. The standards of production through the central facility has come under scrutiny over the past few years and has received excellent patient feedback and achieved financial goals, thus offering excellent value for money. We continue to aspire to, or match, the expectations of our patients, their relatives and our staff.

1860

A vital element of the service is to explore and contribute to the Manx farming and catering suppliers by utilising local produce, developing local sustainable business and supporting local enterprise through food purchase. By working in tandem with our suppliers we have managed to control the inevitable rising costs of imported products by reducing our reliance on imported foods. This initiative has proven successful, with food service businesses flourishing within our local sustainable approach (Greeba Mushrooms being a prime example).

1865

This can attract higher prices and we endeavour to control these as best we can. Options are open to us to procure cheaper imported brands (e.g. bread, milk) but the effect on the local producers and economy must be taken into account. To ensure this happens, for the past 10 years we have operated a robust, fair and transparent contract/tender process. This process is entered into every three years in an open tender; all suppliers are invited to tender for products, both local and imported. This process has proved very successful and has allowed us to plan and predict our spend in advance. In 2011, we are the lead Department in the centralisation of food and food-related products across Government. We are assisting and working with our catering partners within Government, the Treasury procurement team and of course, our local suppliers, to create a new procurement process. This will ensure that we can still maintain excellent customer service, value for money and support local producers and suppliers.

1870

1875

As healthcare services develop and types of treatments and therapies become more complex and varied, our in-house catering team work very closely with the dieticians in the production of menus, development of recipes and ensuring that the nutritional content of all our products are benchmarked to a national standard. This system works very well and there is a very close,

1880

1885 productive and outcome-focused approach to meeting the nutritional and specialist dietary needs of all patients. This can be demonstrated by the multi-disciplinary nutritional action team that meets every month to consider hospital food issues and initiatives. We also have on this group members of the public whose input has been vital when developing certain menus and identifying patient needs.

1890 In order to control all these various functions, the catering services operate a catering administration system, which is a complex series of commodity listings, recipes, menus and analysis tools. It allows us to be able to identify individual costs at product level, recipe level and patient level. Every month analytical data is produced to show how many patients have been fed, the cost of this provision, our income streams and patient-per-day figures. Overall, catering services have been striving to look at areas where efficiency savings can be gained. For example, there is a robust ward portions ordering system. This system identifies each ward's dry provision requirements by offering those tasked with ordering a minimum and maximum stock level. These levels are then audited by the provisions team. This single initiative has shown significant saving on budgetary allowances. As shown in Table 1 – using data collected from our system – funding has reduced by £181,851 in the last three years.

Table 1

2008-09	£1,280,595
2009-10	£1,229,078
2010-11	£1,098,744

1900 This can be further broken down into direct patient feeding costs and income received. Shown in Table 2 is the analysis of the direct patient feeding costs over the three-year period and the income received from various streams over the same period. The trend on the direct feeding costs is downward due to the buying strategy previously explained, full analysis of recipe content and standardisation and cost efficiencies within the workflow.

1905 A vital part of these efficiencies has been to address ward-based wastage. The system of meeting patients' dietary needs at Noble's is slightly different from the norm, as the Hospital provides a comprehensive menu service to the ward, which means the patient can decide what they want to eat, when they want to eat it. This ensures that each meal is bespoke to the individual patient and, as a result, each meal is eaten, therefore reducing plate waste whilst ensuring that the nutritional content of the food is adequate. We have seen a reduction in plate waste from the estimated waste in 2009 of an average 12% to the current levels, in October 2011, of 3%. This will contribute significantly to efficiency savings. It should be noted, however, that prices are increasing on an average across all aspects of food procurement on the Island at approx. 11% per year.

Table 2

2008-09	£546,158
2009-10	£530,751
2010-11	£435,267

1915 The provision of income is an area that was developed over the years leading up to, and beyond, the opening of the Hospital in 2003. The success story of the Island-wide Meals on Wheels service has not only contributed to the income stream but provided a vital social service in the prevention of elderly persons being admitted to residential care and/or hospital. This service will continue to develop.

1920 (b) The cost of hospital food is traditionally reported by using a calculation of the cost of feeding one patient a day. This calculation has been used as a hospital food benchmark for many years. However, in the past few years the focus has changed as it was felt this figure only gave a small snapshot of the cost, as some Trusts report differently on their actual food costs. For example:

- 1925
- Hospital A will present a whole food cost which will include food, beverages and dry goods
 - Hospital B will present food costs only, excluding beverages
 - Hospital C will present food costs, provisions and staffing costs

1930 This has led to much confusion and debate, as some hospitals are reporting food costs as low as £1 per day per patient, but on further examination, this is on the hot food provision and no other food service. In Noble's Hospital we use whole food costs plus beverages plus dry provisions. The current average cost across the UK for comparison is between £5.46 and £7.70.

1935 In Table 3 you will see that Noble's Catering Services are in the lower percentage of cost per patient per day. This figure is calculated using statistical data from the bed stat number produced each day at midnight and again at 07.00. These numbers are recorded and placed against the actual ward number ordered on a daily basis.

1940 The system is operated by the ward housekeeper informing the catering department of the actual patient-in-bed requirement between 08.00 and 10.00. This figure is entered into the 'Menumark' system and is further processed into a cost per ward/patient and held for further analysis.

The system will calculate the ward requirements in terms of products, production costs and recipe make-up and this becomes the cost for that ward. The cost is then divided by number of patients actually present, plus the cost of dry provisions, plus cost of any specialist diets or requirements, and this gives the cost per patient per day.

Table 3

2008-09	£5.52
2009-10	£5.35
2010-11	£4.40

HOME AFFAIRS

Prison Service Food costs

2.3. The Hon. Member for Onchan (Mr Hall) to ask the Minister for Home Affairs:

1945 *How much the Prison Service spent on food in each of the last three years;*
(a) in total; and
(b) per prisoner per meal?

1950 **Answer:** (a) 2011-12 (Year to date) = £151,419.44 (*£139,433.70)
2010-11 = £216,484.84 (*£203,222.72)
2009-10 = regrettably, the budget reporting for this and previous years does not provide for isolating food costs from many other types of purchases;
(b) £1.62 average cost per prisoner meal (includes drinks throughout the day).

1955 *these figures are the actual cost of prisoners' meals less other food purchased for staff mess, vending machines and education classes.

INFRASTRUCTURE

Planning approval expiry dates Definition of 'special circumstances'

2.4. The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

1960 *What the 'special circumstances' are under Article 13(2) of the Town and Country Planning (Development Procedure) Order 2005 that would permit the Department to approve a planning application with an expiration date for the commencement of development that exceeds four years?*

Answer: There is no document or policy that sets out what the 'special circumstances' are, or could be, probably because it would not be possible to predetermine or categorise what these

1965 potentially unique circumstances may be. Consequently, it would be for either the Planning Committee or the person responsible for determining the application to consider on the merit of each individual case.

1970 To my knowledge, no planning approval has been given greater than four years in which to commence on its initial determination, although some, upon written request, have been extended beyond the four years, in accordance with Article 13(3) of the Town and Country Planning (Development Procedure) Order 2005.

**Planning approval
Extension of expiry dates**

2.5. The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

1975 *Whether requests to extend planning applications under Article 13(3) of the Town and Country Planning (Development Procedure) Order 2005 are subject to the notice of application procedures as set out in Article 5 of the Order; if not, how the public is made aware that the expiration date for the commencement of development on an approved planning application has been extended; if there is no public notification, if he will list the approved planning applications for which the Department has extended the period for the commencement of development under 13 (3) of the Order?*

1980 **Answer:** There is no procedure set out to make the public aware that an approval has been extended, although this information would be made available upon request.

A list detailing approvals and refusals of extensions of time has been collated since 2007 and is detailed in Table 2.5A. If any Hon. Member is interested in a specific development proposal, my officers would be happy to help.

Table 2.5.A

2007		
PA No	Description	Decision
02/00465/B	Creation of temporary car park, land at corner of Circular Road and Peel Road	Agreed 9th January 2007
04/01804/A	Demolish existing single storey workshop and the construction of a two storey warehouse / storage building Warehouse & Premises, Marsden Terrace, Ramsey	Agreed 17th January 2007
02/01686/B	Erection of dwelling with integral garages to replace, Barn/stables, Ballaveare, Old Castletown Road, Port Soderick, Braddan	Agreed 20th February 2007
02/00531/B	Erection of dwelling and garage, Plot 2, land adjacent to Ballaradcliffe, Kiondroghad Road, Andreas	Agreed 20th February 2007
02/02416/B	Extension to dwelling including first floor conservatory to replace existing garage and erection of replacement garage, 9 Howe Road, Onchan	Agreed 1st March 2007
02/02381/A	Approval in principle for erection of apartment block with associated car parking, Land Adjacent To Belmont Terrace, Jurby Road, Ramsey	Agreed 1st March 2007
03/00043/B	Erection of two dwellings with rear parking. Land between 87 and 93 Royal Avenue, Onchan.	Agreed two years to June 26th 2009
04/01436/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling with detached garage, Site Rear Of 8 Church View, Braddan	Agreed two years to 15th June 2009
99/02270/B	Residential estate layout comprising roads plots and sewers for fourteen dwellings, Field 432644 (5937), Douglas Road, Ballasalla, Malew	20th April 2007 Approval extended to 10th June 2008
99/02271/B	Erection of fourteen dwellings Field 432644 (5937), Douglas Road, Ballasalla, Malew	20th April 2007 Approval extended to 10th June 2008
03/00514/B	First floor extension over existing kitchen/dining room and garage, Renscault House, East Baldwin, Braddan.	20th April 2007 Approval extended to 15th July 2011

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 6th DECEMBER 2011

04/02166/A	Approval in principle for the demolition of existing buildings and the erection of a replacement three storey building comprising of two ground floor retail units and four residential apartments with car parking to rear, 1/2 Auckland Terrace Parliament Street, Ramsey	2nd May 2007. Agreed 2 years 11th May 2007
02/01784/GB	Partial demolition of building to retain facades and rebuild, including extension to provide office accommodation and basement parking, Former Douglas Court House and 13 Athol Street, Douglas	Agreed 12 months 11th May 2007
02/01785/GB	Partial demolition of building to retain facades and rebuild, including extension to provide office accommodation, ground floor licensed premises and basement parking	Agreed 12 months 11th May 2007
03/01948/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a farm dwelling and associated outbuildings on Fields 124122, 124124 & 124128, (County Series 2070 & 2008), Mylechraine, St. Judes Road, West Craig, Ramsey	Agreed 12 months 12th June 2007
04/01618/A	Approval in principle to convert 5 storey guest house into 5 apartments 12 Empire Terrace, Douglas	Agreed 2 years on 12th June 2007
03/00897/B	Erection of a three storey dwelling with integral garage to replace existing, Boathouse/garage, Shore House, Shore Road, Port Erin	Agreed 2 years 12th June 2007
03/00891/B	Alterations and extension to dwelling Brook Villa, Glen Road, Colby, Arbory	Agreed 2 years 3rd July 2007.
02/01873/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling, Part Field 132425 (formerly 4400) Adjacent White Coppice, Glen Auldyn , Road, Glen Auldyn, Ramsey	Agreed 12 months 10th July 2007
02/01875/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling, Part Field 133088 (formerly 4900) Adjacent To Fern Ne Cregga, Glen Auldyn Road, Glen Auldyn, Ramsey	Agreed 12 months 10th July 2007
05/00235/A	Approval in principle for residential development Mount Auldyn House, Jurby Road, Ramsey	Agreed 12 months 24th July 2007
05/01124/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a residential development of one house and two flats with off street parking to replace existing office/light industrial unit, Concorde House, Westbourne Road, Ramsey	Agreed 12 months 17/8/07 - to 4/8/08
03/00421/B	Erection of an office building with parking to replace private club and flat, 8-9 Hill Street, Douglas	Agreed 2 years on 31st August 2007
03/00071/B	Extensions to front and side of dwelling to provide additional living accommodation, 82 Silverburn Crescent, Ballasalla	Agreed 1 year on 31st August 2007
02/02129	Erection of four storey office block with parking, corner of Peel Road and Circular Road, Allan Bank, Douglas	Agreed 1 year on 25th September 2007
03/01133/B	Extension to side of dwelling, 6 Heywood Drive, Onchan	Agreed 1 year on 25th September 2007
03/00618/B	Erection of a motor cycle garage with roof deck over, in front garden of Clovelly, Strang Road, Union Mills, Braddan	Agreed 2 years on 25th September 2007
04/02473/A	Approval in principle for the erection of light industrial units, land adjacent to E B Christians & White Hoe Industrial Estate, Old Castletown Road, Douglas	Agreed 2 years 9th October 2007
02/02407/B	Erection of dwelling to replace existing, Lheakerrow Cottage, Andreas Road, Regaby, Ramsey, IM7 4EJ	Agreed one year 12/10/07
02/02552/A	Approval in principle for erection of a new timeshare facility including 4 permanent penthouse apartments, 51 Timeshare Suites, 2 Restaurants, Conference Facilities, Swimming Pools, Leisure Complex and Golf Club, to replace existing hotel. Approval extended to 31/3/08 per delegated minute 3.2, 22/9/06., Golf Links Hotel, Fort Island, Castletown	Not agreed

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 6th DECEMBER 2011

02/02553/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a single large dwelling with integral garage, gate lodge and tennis court, Tractor Shed, Castletown Golf Course, Derbyhaven Road, Derbyhaven, Castletown	Agreed one year 21/3/09
03/00521/B	Erection of seven dwellings with garden areas and car parking, land adjacent to 47 Scarlett Road, Castletown	15/11/07 Agreed 24 months to 07/11/09
04/00535/B	Erection of a single storey extension and timber decking on rear elevation, 145 Fairways Drive, Mount Murray, Braddan	15/11/07 Agreed to by 12 months to 19/05/09
03/01444/B	Conversion to a granny flat, Workshop At Cushag, Lower Foxdale, Patrick	15/11/07 - Agreed to extend by 24 months to 29/12/09
03/01412/B	Conversion of existing barn/workshop to tourist accommodation, Ellenbrook, Old Castletown Road, Douglas	15/11/07 - Agreed to extend by 24 months to 13/02/10
05/00048/A	Approval in principle for the demolition of existing building and the erection of a block of seven apartments with associated ground floor parking, Russell's Butchers, 36 Hope Street, Douglas	15/11/07 - Agreed to extend to 09/12/09
03/01488/B	Alterations and extension to dwelling, Rose Lea, Ballavartyn Road, Santon	Agreed 23/11/07
02/01356/B	Erection of car port, Epworth, 22 Terence Avenue, Douglas	Agreed 23/11/07
04/02480/A	Approval in principle for the demolition of indoor riding arena and redundant stables and conversion of existing stone stables and barn into 12 residential units with associated parking, Lower Sulby Farm, Scholague Road, Abbeylands	Agreed 23/11/07
05/01399/A	Approval in principle for the conversion of existing farm outbuildings to create four residential units, four double garages and a new vehicular access from Ballafesson Road, Ballachurry Farm, Ballachurry Road, Ballafesson, Rushen	Agreed 23/11/07
04/02388/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling, Land Adjacent Mostyn Ville, Chapel Hill, Bride	Agreed 23/11/07
01/01291/A	Approval in principle for erection of garage with first floor storage to replace dwelling, 22 St. Georges Walk, Douglas.	23/01/2006
2008		
PA No	Description	Decision
01/00357/B	Erection of dwelling and garage, Land Between 17 18 And 19 Hillberry Meadows, Douglas - Approval extended for 24 months per delegated minute 3.1, 21/4/06.	Agreed 28/5/08
01/01291/A	Approval in principle for erection of garage with first floor storage to replace dwelling, 22 St. Georges Walk Douglas. Approval was extended for 24 months per delegated minute 4.2, 23/1/06.	Refused 24/1/08
02/00465/B	Approval in principle for the erection of a pair of semi detached dwellings with integral garages, garage and plot opposite St Marys Hall, Gellings Avenue, Port St. Mary	Agreed 4/8/08
02/02106/B	Residential estate layout for thirty two dwellings comprising roads plots and sewers and formation of new roundabout, Field 7151 (311037), Ramsey Road, Peel	Agreed 03/01/08
02/02129/B	Erection of four storey office block with parking, corner of Peel Road and Circular Road, Allan Bank, Douglas, IM1 1AY	Agreed 23/07/08
03/00470/B	Refurbishment and extensions to create a dwelling, Tuck Mill, Slegaby and Ballacottier, Clypse, Onchan	Refused 04/07/08
03/01069/B	Conversion of hotel to six apartments, Silvercraigs, 27 Palace Terrace, Douglas	Agreed 24/01/08
03/01070/B	Showroom and workshop extension to replace existing workshop, Raymotors, Corner Of Queens Pier Road and Brookfield Avenue, Ramsey	Agreed 18/04/08
03/01110/B	Erection of a block of seventy four apartments with car parking and landscaping on land at corner of Premier Road and Mooragh Promenade, Ramsey	Agreed 24/04/08
03/01202/B	Erection of an outbuilding to provide garaging, workshop/store and additional living accommodation Ballaveare Farm, Old Castletown Road, Port Soderick, Braddan	Agreed 24/04/08
03/01203/B	Alterations and extensions to dwelling Ballaveare Farm, Old Castletown Road, Port Soderick, Braddan	Agreed 24/04/08

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 6th DECEMBER 2011

03/01623/B	Two storey extension to replace existing single, to rear elevation, Cooil Aalin Veg, 1 Main Road, Ballabeg	Agreed 07/02/08
03/01948/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a farm dwelling and associated outbuildings on Field 124122, 124124, &124128 (County Series 2070 &2008) Mylechraine St Judes Road West Craig Andreas	Agreed 4/7/08
03/01974/B	Conversion of Water Tower/Sawmill to a dwelling, The Water Tower, Ballamoar Castle, Ballamoar, Jurby	Agreed 24/01/08
03/01984/B	Conversion of redundant outbuildings to a dwelling, The Rhenwee, Regaby West Road, Andreas	Agreed 24/01/08
04/00303/B	Conversion of existing ground floor hair salon and office to a residential apartment, Bridson House, Bridson Street, Port Erin	Agreed 22/4/08
04/00310/B	Construction of an underground garage and creation of an additional vehicular access with driveway and landscaping, Lewaigue Lodge, Port Lewaigue, Ramsey	Agreed 24/01/08
04/00418/B	Erection of a block of sixty residential units comprising apartments and maisonettes with ground floor retail space and basement parking on remainder of Villiers Site, Loch Promenade Douglas	Agreed 27/6/08
04/00608/B	Erection of a replacement dwelling, Upper Lambfell, Cronk Y Voddy, St. Johns	Agreed 08/10/08
04/00669/B	Conversion of redundant farm storage buildings into three dwellings and alteration to existing cottage (Resubmission), Ballakilley Farm, Church Road, Port St. Mary, IM9 5LW	Agreed 4th July 2008
04/00724/B	The Old Vicarage Vernon Road Ramsey IM8 2EG Alterations, including the reinstatement of original entrance and pillars, erection of a replacement garage, roofing of storarge area, installation of roof lights and erection of an orangery and porch on south west elevation	Agreed 28/5/08
04/00790/B	Erection of a corporate headquarters office building with associated car parking and landscaping, Plot 5a, Site 5, Isle Of Man Business Park, Douglas	Agreed 18/07/08
04/00795/B	Redevelopment of site, to create ground floor commercial unit and an apartment on each of two storeys above, with adjacent area for parking	Agreed 01/08/08
04/01025/B	Alterations and conversion to a dwelling (Resubmission) New Property Next To West Lodge Main Road Crosby	Agreed 28/5/08
04/01277/B	Replacement traditional green finish uPVC front door and fanlight, 13 Circular Road, Peel	31/10/08.
04/01417/A	Approval in principle for the redevelopment of site for residential purposes in the form of apartments, Bridge Works, South Quay, Douglas	Agreed 08/10/08
04/01478/B	Erection of two storey extension on north west elevation Woodlands Lezayre Road Glen Tramman Lezayre	Agreed 4th July 2008
04/01804/A	Residential estate layout for thirty two dwellings comprising roads plots and sewers and formation of new roundabout Field 7151 (311037), Ramsey Road, Peel	Agreed 17/1/07
04/02117/A	Approval in principle for amendments to PA 04/00654/A, residential development consisting of 34 apartments and 10 maisonettes with dedicated on site parking, on land to front of Capital Car Park, adjacent to Westmoreland Road	9/12/08
04/02418/B	Amendments to approved PA 00/01430, changes to bedroom windows on rear elevation, Communal, Erinville, Promenade, Port Erin	Agreed 14/01/09
05/00245/A	Approval in principle to replace existing buildings/yard with residential development comprising of apartments, Timber Yard Lake Road, Douglas	Agreed 08/10/08
05/01277/A	Approval in principle for a hotel leisure complex, residential apartments, and parking spaces former Swimming Pool site Marine Parade Peel	Duration of consent extended by 1 year
05/01279/A	Approval in principle to demolish existing garage and construct three dwellings on site together with off-street car parking for each unit (Re submission), Land At The Junction Of May Hill And Glen Elfin Road, Ramsey	Agreed 15/02/08

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 6th DECEMBER 2011

05/01959/B	Partial demolition of existing buildings to create temporary car park, 1 - 15 Market Street, Douglas	REFUSED 15/02/08
05/02098/B	Creation of a temporary car park on part of former Douglas Steam Saw Mills, Lake Road, Douglas	Agreed 24/01/08
05/92118/A	Approval in principle for residential development, Colby Football Clubhouse, Glen Road, Colby	Agreed 04/09/08
05/92275/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a pair of semi detached dwellings with integral garages, Garage And Plot Opposite St Marys Hall, Gellings Avenue, Port St. Mary	Agreed 12 months 03/01/08
05/92391/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a 190 bedroom hotel and casino (Amendment to PA 05/00464/A), site bounded by Victoria Street, Lord Street and Walpole Avenue, Douglas	Agreed 12 months 03/01/08
06/00394/A	Approval in principle for the erection of six semi detached "affordable" dwellings and fifteen detached dwellings, field 311788 adjacent to Brickworks Entrance, Glenfaba Road, Peel	Refused 01/08/08
06/00561/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling with garage land to rear of Olinda South Cape Laxey	Agreed 24/04/08
06/00590/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a replacement agricultural dwelling Upper Begoade Farm Begoade Road Onchan	Agreed 17/11/08
06/01202/B	Amendments to approved 03/00470/B to include changing facing stonework for staircase enclosure to curtain walling and approval of reserved matters set out in condition 4 of 03/00470/, The Tuck Mill, Slegaby And Ballacottier, Clypse, Onchan	Refused 04/07/08
06/01500/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a two storey apartment building, with car parking, turning area and garage, Land Adjacent To Arbory Church Yard, Main Road, Ballabeg	Agreed 4/9/08.
06/01554/A	Approval in principle for the construction of a Science and Technology Park incorporating light industry, storage, internet hosting, data storage and other computer services, Land At Ronaldsway Industrial Estate, Ronaldsway, Ballasalla	Agreed 14/01/09
06/01923/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a detached dwelling with garage, Land At Ballaquane Cottage, Poortown Road, Peel	Agreed 14/01/09
05/92127/A	Approval in principle for creation of football ground with associated facilities Field 424828 South Of Colby Station Station Road Colby	Agreed 17/11/08
99/02270/B	Residential estate layout comprising roads plots and sewers for fourteen dwellings, Field 432644 Between Grianane And Kelburn, Douglas Road, Ballasalla	Agreed 04/06/08
99/02271/B	Erection of fourteen dwellings, Field 432644 Between Grianane And Kelburn, Douglas Road, Ballasalla	Agreed 04/06/08
2009		
PA No	Description	Decision
01/00357/B	Erection of dwelling and garage, Land Between 17 18 And 19 Hillberry Meadows, Douglas. Approval extended to 22/4/09 previously	Refused 06/05/09
01/01775/B	Extension to dwelling with integral Garage	Refused 22/3/10
02/01536/A	Approval in principle to erect 3 light industrial buildings to replace existing buildings to be demolished, Laundry Buildings Carrs Road, Tromode, Douglas	Agreed 26/02/09
02/02129/B	Erection of four storey office block with parking, corner of Peel Road and Circular Road Allan Bank Douglas	Agreed 31/07/09
04/00535/B	Erection of a single storey extension and timber decking on rear elevation 145 Fairways Drive Mount Murray Braddan	Refused 06/05/09
04/00660/B	Erection of a two storey general purpose storage building to replace existing Fields 2166 & 2205, Sky Hill Lezayre Road Lezayre	Refused 06/03/09
04/01436/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling with detached garage, Site To Rear Of 8 The Church View, Braddan, Douglas, Isle Of Man	Agreed 01/07/09
04/02308/B	Erection of two four storey blocks, each block containing eight flats St Olaves Kitchen Garden Bowring Road Ramsey	Agreed 06/05/09
04/02388/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling land adjacent Mostyn Ville Chapel Hill Bride	Refused 06/05/09
04/02596/B	Alterations and conservatory extension to dwelling including provision of pitched roof to replace existing flat roof, Billeymillish Andreas Road Regaby Bride	Agreed 22/01/09

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 6th DECEMBER 2011

05/00002/B	Erection of a dwelling and garage including alterations to existing dwelling to form attached ancillary accommodation with driveway alterations, Brambley Cottage, 11 Cronk Road, Union Mills, Braddan	Agreed 26/02/09
05/00173/B	Erection of a two storey extension to the north eastern elevation to provide additional living accommodation 45 Sea Cliff Road Onchan	Agreed 06/03/09
05/00292/B	Erection of a detached replacement garage and installation of three roof lights on south elevation of house, 143 Royal Avenue, Onchan	Agreed 26/02/09
05/00444	Erection of a double garage, Abbey House Rushen Abbey Ballasalla	Agreed 21/10/09
05/00599/B	Provision of Car Park to provide increased car parking provision off the Highway in relation to the Public Hall, and the for the provision of open space to the rear of the Hall, Recreation Hall, Quines Hill, Port Soderick, Isle Of Man, IM4 1AU	Refused 29/05/09
05/01234/B	Erection of a two storey extension to provide kitchen and porch with dressing room above to side elevation, Garden House Clay Head Road, Baldrine, Isle Of Man, IM4 6DP	Refused 29/05/09.
05/02001/B	Alteration to shop premises to provide w.c and food preparation area and conversion and extension of existing barn to create living accommodation Whitestone Stores, Main Road, Ballasalla, Malew	Agreed 18/09/09
05/02098/B	Creation of a temporary car park on part of former Douglas Steam Saw Mills, Lake Road, Douglas, Isle Of Man, IM1 5AF	Refused 29/03/10
05/92286/B	Erection of a pair of apartments with garaging to replace two demolished dwellings, Plot, Formerly 1 And 2, The Promenade, Port St. Mary, Isle Of Man	Agreed 11th January 2010
06/00590/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a replacement agricultural dwelling Upper Begoade Farm Begoade Road Onchan	Agreed 11/11/2009
06/01730/A	Approval in principle for the erection of 20 detached dwellings and 6 (affordable) semi detached dwellings, Land Adjacent To Croit Ny Greiney, Douglas Road, Peel, Isle Of Man	Request 09/07/09.
06/01948	Approval in principle to convert existing outbuildings into separate dwelling / living accommodation at Ballacondra Farm Cranstal	Agreed 21st October 2009.
07/00054/A	Approval in principle to demolish existing and erection of a new bungalow with attached garage and erection of a two storey dwelling with detached garage, Cronk Reayrt, Main Road, Crosby	Refused 06/05/09
07/00375	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling Land Adjacent To Allandale Farm Ballamanagh Road Sulby Isle Of Man	Agreed 21st October 2009.
07/00534/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling	Agreed 21/10/09
07/00540/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a replacement dwelling and renovation and extension to existing stone barn, Ballacaroon Farm, West Baldwin Road, Mount Rule, Isle Of Man, IM4 4HS	Request denied 01/06/09.
07/00671/A	Approval in principle for the erection of three dwellings, Waitara, Clifton Road, Port St. Mary	Agreed 08/06/09
07/00856/A	Approval in principle for renovation and conversion of existing building into living accommodation Sulby Filtration Plant Old Starch Works Sulby Glen Sulby	Agreed 13/7/09
07/00958	AIP for the erection of a dwelling with a garage to replace existing workshop/store. Carmodil West, Glen Road, Ballaugh	Agreed 2/10/09
07/00958/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling with garage to replace existing workshop/store, Carmodil West, Glen Road, Ballaugh, Isle Of Man, IM7 5JD	12 months 2/10/09
07/01010/A	Approval in principle to convert redundant barns to living accommodation Gretch Vane Farm Ballaragh Road Laxey	Approve 24/11/09
07/01144/A	Approval in principle to rebuild existing farm house, conversion of out buildings to provide annex accommodation and barn amendments Tremon Farm Ballakillowey Road Colby	Agreed 18/09/09
07/01482	AIP for the renovation and conversion of redundant mill into a dwelling The Old Mill, Harbour Road, Port Grenaugh Santon	Refused 4.11.09
07/01733	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling	Agreed 10/12/09

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 6th DECEMBER 2011

07/01733/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling, Sea Peep, Poortown Road, Peel, Isle Of Man, IM5 1QG	Agreed 10/12/09
07/01998/A	Approval in principle for the conversion of existing hotel into five apartments, Ellan Vannin Hotel, 31 Loch Promenade, Douglas, Isle Of Man, IM1 2LY	Agreed 24/11/09
07/02037/A	AIP to convert the existing garage into additional living accommodation and erection of a detached garage. 2 Hilary Close, Onchan, IM3 4BF	Agreed 24/11/09
2010		
PA No	Description	Decision
03/00790/B	Residential estate development comprising of roads, plots, sewers, flood protection measures, drainage, public open space and layout for 26 semi detached dwellings, 69 terraced dwellings, 42 apartments and 38 self build plots, east of Gardeners Lane between Greenlands Park and Poylldooley Nature Reserve, off Gardeners Lane, Poylldooley, Ramsey	Declined
03/01070/B	Showroom and workshop extension to replace existing workshop Raymotors, Corner Of Queens Pier Road and Brookfield Avenue Ramsey	20/9/10 declined consent.
03/01202/B	Erection of an outbuilding to provide garaging, workshop/store and additional living accommodation, Ballaveare Farm, Old Castletown Road, Port Soderick, Braddan, IM4 1BB	Refused 07/06/10
03/01203/B	Alterations and extensions to dwelling, Ballaveare Farm, Old Castletown Road, Port Soderick, Braddan, IM4 1BB	Refused 07/06/10
03/01412/B	Conversion of existing barn/workshop to tourist accommodation Ellenbrook Old Castletown Road Braddan	3/2/10 declined
03/01473	Erection of an office development with parking and associated works to replace existing offices and gym 39 Finch Road Douglas	Agreed 8/2/10
04/00032	Erection of a block of six apartments with ground floor parking to replace existing dwelling Stanley House Douglas Head Douglas	Agreed 29/03/10
04/00418/B	Erection of a block of sixty residential units comprising apartments and maisonettes with ground floor retail space and basement parking on remainder of Villiers Site Loch Promenade Douglas	Agreed 21/4/11
04/00608/B	Erection of a replacement dwelling, Upper Lambfell, Cronk Y Voddy, St. Johns, Douglas, IM4 3NS	Declined 17/8/10
04/00798	Approval in principle for alterations and extensions to dwelling including a detached double garage and creation of a new vehicular access	9/6/10 refuse
04/02325/B	Amendment to previously approved house type to plots 1,2,5,8,10,14,17 & 18 Land Adjacent To Colby Glen Hotel Main Road Colby	12/7/10 SPO 21/6/11.
05/00253/B	Creation of an 18 hole golf course with clubhouse, parking and green keepers facilities (to include renovation of existing buildings), Land At Middle Farm Between Kewaigue Hill, Ellenbrook Farm, Oakhill And Cronkbane, Kewaigue, Braddan	12/02/10 refuse 06/03/10
05/01894/B	Erection of an extension to form additional bedroom accommodation, Brookfield Residential & Nursing Home, Cloughbane Drive, Ramsey, Isle Of Man, IM8 2RE	Agreed 6 months to 12/03/11
05/092197	Erection of a detached garage with accommodation over Hunters Moon Glen Auldyn Ramsey IM7 2AE	20/9/10 refused request
05/92118/A	Approval in principle for residential development Colby Football Clubhouse Glen Road Colby Arbory	9/6/10 grant 20/11/11
05/92181/B	Conversion of lower floor level to form a self contained apartment 18 Hutchinson Square Douglas	22/2/10 refused request -
05/92197/B	Erection of a detached garage with accommodation over Hunters Moon Glen Auldyn Ramsey IM7 2AE	20/9/10 SPO refused
05/92286/B	Erection of a pair of apartments with garaging to replace two demolished dwellings Plot, formerly 1 & 2 The Promenade Port St. Mary	11/1/10 SPO granted 2 year extension to 10/2012
05/92351/B	Erection of a single storey extension to east elevation 1 Bradda Mount Bradda East Port Erin	26/1/10 SPO granted 1 year extension to 10/2/11

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 6th DECEMBER 2011

06/00063/B	Erection of a two storey dwelling with garage, Land Adjacent To Mostyn Ville, Chapel Hill, Bride, Isle Of Man	24/4/10 SPO granted 1 year extension to 28/4/11.
06/00268/B	Demolish existing and erection of a single storey replacement garage, 27 Arbory Street, Castletown	Accept, extended for a further 2 years to 25/4/12.
06/00487	Conversion of piggery complex into dwelling house	9/6/10 SPO determined to refuse
06/00561/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling with garage, Land To Rear Of Olinda, South Cape, Laxey, Isle Of Man	27/4/10 refused
06/00874/B	Demolition of existing and erection of a replacement garage 38 Derby Road Peel	Agreed on 17/8/10
06/00911/B	Demolition of existing garage and construction of a new larger garage with link to dwelling house Knock Rushen House Scarlett Castletown	SPO. extended for a further 2 years to 04/08/12.
06/01088/B	Demolish existing dwelling and erect a new detached dwelling 41 Groudle Road Onchan	1 year extension of duration of consent agreed 17/9/10.
06/01125/B	Palm Cottage, Alterations to redundant attached outbuilding to form an additional dwelling	agreed 09.12.10
06/01202/B	Amendments to approved 03/00470/B to include changing facing stonework for staircase enclosure to curtain walling and approval of reserved matters set out in condition 4 of 03/00470/B, The Tuck Mill, Slegaby and Ballacottier, Clypse, Onchan, Isle Of Man	Agreed 17/8/10
06/01300/B	Erection of a two storey office extension, Restart Unit, Isle Of Man Business Park, Cooil Road, Braddan	Agreed 7.9.10
07/00671	Approval in principle for the erection of three dwellings Waitara Clifton Road Port St. Mary	12/7/10 further 1 year.
07/00856/A	Approval in principle for renovation and conversion of existing building into living accommodation Sulby Filtration Plant Old Starch Works Sulby Glen Sulby	20/9/10 allowed consent to 23/8/11.
07/01587/A	Approval in principle for a residential development of six plots with associated access road, parking and services land at Ballacollister Field No's. 614589, 612008 & 612011 Ballacollister Road Laxey	The duration of consent extended for a further 2 years to 10/06/12.
07/01789/A	Approval in principle to demolish existing hotel and creation of 68 apartments contained in three buildings, car parking and landscaping Grand Island Hotel Bride Road Ramsey	The duration of consent extended for a further 1 year to 17/11/11.
07/02382/A	Approval in principle for residential development, Isle Of Man Water Authority Depot, East Quay, Peel, Isle Of Man, IM5 1AR	Extended the duration of the consent to 18/3/11.
07/02383/A	Approval in principle for commercial development, Isle Of Man Water Authority Depot, East Quay, Peel, Isle Of Man, IM5 1AR	Extended the duration of the consent to the 10/4/11.
08/00241/A	Approval in principle to erect two apartments with associated parking, 5 Station Road, Peel, Isle Of Man, IM5 1AY	Agreed to extend the duration of the consent to 25/7/11.
08/00672/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling and garage, part of garden of Shan Vallah, The Colony, Port Lewaigue	Agreed to 2 year extension 03.12.10
08/00706	Knock Rushen House, Scarlett, Castletown, IM9 1TA	The duration of consent extended for a further 1 year to 3/7/11.
08/00913	Field 432533, 432534, & 432535 Phildraw Road Ballasalla	The duration of consent extended for a further 2 years to 3/7/12.
08/00942/A	Approval in principle to erect a dwelling within grounds of 141 Royal Avenue, Onchan, Isle Of Man, IM3 1LD	Agreed to extend the duration of the consent to the 10/11/10
08/01001/A	Approval in principle to erect a dwelling	Extension of duration of consent to 23/12/12 agreed
08/01127/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a replacement dwelling and garage, Ashwood, Ballamenagh Road, Baldrine, Isle Of Man, IM4 6AL	Extended the duration of the consent to 1/8/11
08/01333/A	Approval in principle for re use of site as a Primary School, outdoor football pitch, car parking and Central Community Health Centre Former Nobles Hospital Westmoreland Road Douglas	Agreed 25/10/10
08/01339/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a replacement dwelling	Agreed for 1 year 22/9/10
08/01687/A	Approval in principle for renovation and conversion of barn to tourist accommodation West Craige Farm, St Judes Road, West Craig, Andreas	1 year extension 30.11.10

HOUSE OF KEYS, TUESDAY, 6th DECEMBER 2011

09/00024/A	Approval in principle to re-instate residential use of redundant dwelling and access drive, Ballalona, The Orchard, Field 425035, Ronague Road	Agreed 2 year extension to 14.07.13, 13.01.11
2011		
PA No	Description	Decision
02/02129	Erection of office building, Allan Bank, Circular/Peel Road, Douglas	Approved 15.03.11
03/00514/B	First floor extension over existing kitchen/dining room and garage, Renscault House, East Baldwin, Douglas	Refused 02.08.11
04/02308/B	Erection of two four storey blocks of eight flats each, St Olaves Kitchen Garden, Bowring Road, Ramsey	Approved for period of 1 year 26.05.11
05/92118/A	Approval in principle for residential development, Colby Football Clubhouse, Glen Road, Colby	Approved for a further period of 1 year to 20th November 2010
06/00874/B	Demolition of existing garage and erection of replacement detached garage - 38 Derby Road, Peel	Approved 09.08.11
06/00905	Extension to existing office accommodation, unit 1300 Summer Hill Business Park, Victoria Road Douglas	Approved 27.09.11
06/01098/B	Erection of building containing 52 apartments, Allan Bank, Circular/Peel Road, Douglas	Refused
06/01187/B	Creation of new access road, Ballahias, Ballanass Road	Approved 15.03.11
06/01205/A	Gloccamorra And Adjacent Land	Refused
06/01631/B	Field 520904, Ballaquine Farm, West Baldwin, Braddan	Declined 23.08.11
06/01924/B	Enlargement of garage with a study above and widening of access onto highway, 4 Bradda Glen Close, Port Erin	Agreed for 1 year 03.05.11
06/02155/B	Demolition of existing buildings and erection of a block of 18 apartments with garaging and parking	Approved for a further 2 years 31.05.11
07/00108/B	Erection of a two storey dwelling to replace existing bungalow, The Spinney, Baldrine Hill, Baldrine	Approved 2 years 28.01.11
07/00695/B	Alterations and erection of replacement garage with living accommodation above, The Mines House, Corony	2011
07/00695/B	The Mines House, Corony Bridge	Agreed by SPO 03.08.11
07/01089/6	Alterations and widen existing garage. 62 Laurel Av	Approved 28.09.11
07/01337 and 07/01338	Conversion of office to private dwelling at Welch House, Church Road, Onchan	Refused 30.08.11
07/01505/B	Erection of a replacement attached garage, 31 The Park, Onchan	Approved 1 year - 14.10.11 DCM
07/01527	Erection of dwelling with garage	Refused 25.10.11
07/01595/RE M	Proposed dwelling on land at end of Switzerland Road (rear of Erin Brae), Douglas Isle of Man	Approved 16.09.11
07/0270/B	Demolition of existing detached garage and erection of replacement attached garage and utility extension	Agreed by SPO for 1 year 09.05.11
08/00241/B	Approval in principle to erect two apartments with associated parking, 5 station road	Approved 16.05.11
08/00924/B	Erection of office building and cafe 38 - 40 Finch Road And Nos. 19 & 21 Well Road, Douglas, Isle Of Man	Approved 27.06.11
08/01339/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a replacement dwelling, Fern Lea, Bride	Approved. 19th July 2011
08/01442/A	Approval in principle to erect a dwelling with ancillary living accommodation and garage Field 614729 Baldrine Road Baldrine	Agreed 19/1/11
08/01521/A	Approval in principle to erect a detached dwelling on land adjacent to "Windrift", Thornhill Park, Ramsey	No decision
08/02182/B	Approval in principle for the demolition of existing dwelling and barn and erection of a replacement dwelling with detached garage/store at Greenhill, Jurby Road, Andreas	Agreed for 1 year 17.03.11
08/02283/A	Approval in principle for the erection of a dwelling, Land Adjacent To Ballaquayle, Lower Dukes Road, Douglas	Approved
09/00404/B	Land At King Edward Bay Golf Course Accessible From	Agreed 14/7/11
09/00414/B	approval in principle to demolish existing buildings and erection of five dwellings with associated parking at "Corner Filing Station", Junction of Waterloo Road and Approach Road, Ramsey	Approved 24.06.11
09/00445/A	Erection of dwelling in part of garden, St Olaves, Bowring Road, Ramsey	One year - 26.04.11
09/00508/A	Approval in principle to erect a detached dwelling, Field 410891, Surby Road, Surby, Port Erin	Agreed for 1 year. 21.4.11

**Planning approval
Consideration of Strategic Plan**

2.6. The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

1985 *Whether planning officers are required under Article 13(3) of the Town and Country Planning (Development Procedure) Order to consider the provisions of the Isle of Man Strategic Plan, where the original planning application was granted prior to the implementation of the Strategic Plan on 1st August 2007?*

1990 **Answer:** There is no formal requirement set out within Article 13(3) as to what the Department must consider. The Department's view is that all of its decisions need to be reasonable and in effect, this means that consideration is given as to whether there has been a change in circumstances arising from a change in Government Policy.

**Planning and Building Control
External consultants**

2.7. The Hon. Member for Douglas South (Mrs Beecroft) to ask the Minister for Infrastructure:

1995 *Whether the Planning and Building Control Division has used external consultants for the fiscal year 2010-11 and the six months to September 2011, and, if so:*

- (a) *how many consultants were employed;*
(b) *how long each consultant was employed (to the nearest number of months);*
(c) *what work was undertaken;*
(d) *how much they were paid;*
2000 (e) *whether any of the consultants were former employees of any Government Department and, if so, of which Departments?*

Answer: The Hon Member's Question is taken to mean professional consultants who have been commissioned with regard to specific projects. In response to each individual Question:

- 2005 (a) Six consultants were employed;
(b) The terms of appointment varied, dependent on the project, with some being employed on several short-term occasions (to audit work carried out) and others for a longer period;
(c) & (d) Consultants were employed in four different areas. These were for minerals advice with regard to specific planning applications and input into the draft Minerals and Waste Plan (£8,000); historic research regarding the registration of buildings (£7,700); quantitative checks in relation to conservation grant applications and quotes (£1,060); Building Control Part P investigation as to competency of an electrical installation and consultancy as to thermal efficiency of six dwellings (£1,640).

2015 (e) As far as I am aware, none of these consultants were former employees of any Government Department.

Procedural

The Speaker: That concludes the business of the House today. The House will now stand adjourned until the next sitting, which will take place at 10 o'clock on Monday, 12th December in this Chamber to elect a Member of the Legislative Council.

2020

The House adjourned at 11.52 a.m.